



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, November 4, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 pm. and announcements by Ms. Camp

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Interim HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner
 Attending Members: Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Absent Members: Pohl, Oliver, Dutra
 Late Arrivals: None
 Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Welch, Coombs, and Camp-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. NEW BUSINESS 10/12/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Carol Surface 10-4824	47 Warren' Landing	Rev. COA – MH	38/54	BPC
2. Okay Okay House 10-4821	10 Union Street	Parking & patio	42.3.1/43	BPC
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:04)	McCarthy – Asked these be held since representative is not present. Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, November 9. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Camp-aye			Certificate #
3. Deb Cote	23 Prospect Street	Hardscape – driveway/wall	55.4.4/90	Linda Williams
4. Deb Cote	23 Prospect Street	Rev. COA – frndtn coat	55.4.4/90	Linda Williams
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:15)	Williams – Asked these be held for the beginning of Tuesday, November 9. Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, November 9. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Camp-aye			Certificate #

III. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4595	27 Fair Street	Front bldg. – historic reno	42.3.2/192	Workshop APD
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP for 30+ neighbors within the Fish Lots. Hillary Rayport, 89 Main Street				
Concerns (1:06)	<p>Kotchen – We are in the process of completing the window survey for all the structures. Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; the windows will be true-divided light (TDL), not simulated-divided light (SDL); our intent is to restore as many windows as possible. Confused about the apparent change in position regarding the 2nd-floor addition off the rear; the existing 1-story addition would not be approved today.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1835 Typical Nantucket in the Fish Lots. Requested no approval until the window surveys are provided; all the existing windows should be kept. The rear gable addition should be a lot lower and more subordinate. This application must be before the Planning Board for change of use. At the last meeting, there was overwhelming support for the need for simplicity of the rear addition; additive massing on typical Nantucket structures is simple.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 11/01: the proposed asymmetrical west facing gable is inappropriate; this wing should remain as simple as possible and be lowered to reflect appropriate additive massing; it should be changed to a symmetrical gable with a recessed – not flush dormer; HSAB would like to review future revisions.</p> <p>Reade – His clients agree with HSAB recommendations. The increase in height of the rear wing is inappropriate and it should be scaled down.</p> <p>Rayport – Shared context and history of this structure to help HDC maintain the historic character of the Town. This property hasn't gotten the care it needs, and we look forward to its revitalization. It's her opinion the increase in size is in violation of what contributes to the neighborhood; currently it has 38% lot coverage. Buildings in this area are low and tumble down to the street. Asked this either be denied or deferred until after the Planning Board hearing.</p> <p>McLaughlin – South elevation left, the door should have more wood than glass; this is visible. Application states SDLs. West elevation, the 5-light door is inappropriate and visible.</p> <p>Coombs – South elevation, the addition with the dormer should be reduced to 1 floor; agrees with HSAB and Ms. Rayport.</p> <p>Thornewill – South elevation, the tertiary mass is too large and should not have dormers.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with what's been said; the proposed gable-dormer addition overwhelms the main mass. Prefers the existing simple structure off the rear south elevation.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and revisions to go to HSAB for review. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye			Certificate #	
2.	27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4594	27 Fair Street	Back bldg. – historic reno	42.3.2/192	Workshop APD
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP for 30+ neighbors within the Fish Lots. William Fordyce, 3 Darling Street Hillary Rayport, 89 Main Street				
Concerns (1:38)	<p>Kotchen – This structure had no historic data; we did further research and have submitted information indicating this is circa late 1960s; asking for a demolition to be replaced by 3 small cottages, more appropriately scaled. Asked that anyone with historical information to please share that with him.</p> <p>McCarthy – The submitted information states this was built in 1981.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 11/01: it remains a possibility that the right-side shed was not completely rebuilt and is still an existing historic structure; if so, it needs to be protected; the age needs to be verified by looking at the existing framing materials; this creates a very long townhouse looking building with multiple front doors which has no historic precedent; the proposed additions should be set back – not project forward from the existing structure, and they should be more secondary in height and in massing; in order to maintain the present scale of the neighborhood facing Hillers Lane, this building should remain at its current size; the loss of small-scale accessory buildings has a significant impact on the character of the neighborhood; HSAB would like to review future revisions.</p> <p>Feels a portion of the historic shop still exists; the smaller section was Earl Ray's contractor shop; doesn't agree it was all removed but was altered with changes in the 1990s. Changes to this impact the neighborhood.</p> <p>Reade – He did research on the building; the main part was constructed as a single-family dwelling by Stan Murry in 1981; the contractor shop has always been there. The shop was connected to the single-family dwelling in the 1990s with the restriction that it would not be used as rental units and to have 4 parking spaces. The application would be that the historic section of the building would be eliminated or consumed by new construction while the newer part would remain. If there is an approach for various, smaller structure, the contractor shop is a historic structure and should be protected and preserved.</p>				

Fordyce – Believes the contractor shop was in operation in the 1930s. His understanding is reconstruction work was done in the 1980s but not to the shop.

Rayport – Agrees the smallest portion is a historic structure dating from when Earl Ray lived here. The large structure was built in 1981, but she considers it historic as well since it is approaching the 50-year guideline for historic structures. This was a guesthouse in a neighborhood, not a commercial structure. The middle section and connector have a restriction; she doesn't want to see any permit for demolition of buildings constructed with restrictions against rental use. Looking into the archive of the Inquirer & Mirror, there is a history of the HDC supporting keeping this lot open.

McLaughlin – Mr. Fordyce is correct; where you now see the structure with duplicate doorways, in the 1940s was a sand lot. Interior usage has nothing to do with the HDC and no reference to that should be made.

Coombs – Doesn't support a demolition at this time; we need more information on the age. This should go back to HSAB with all the information we received today, so they can determine what is historic and what is not.

Thornewill – She doesn't want to vote on a demolition today; she doesn't think the main mass is contributing because of its age; it isn't a traditional 4-bay; agrees the piece on the right is historic. She'd like to see the concept of 3 little buildings; that would allow the garden to be visible.

Camp – She'd like to have the dates confirmed, especially regarding the shop.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions, more historical information, and to go back to HSAB. (McLaughlin)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye Certificate #

3. 27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4597 29 Fair Street Back bldg. – historic reno 42.3.2/192 Workshop APD

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD

Public None

Concerns (2:01) **Kotchen** – Asked this be held for the window survey.
Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold for the window survey. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Camp-aye Certificate #

IV. NEW BUSINESS 10/26/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Barry Lyden	4 West Miacomet Road	Move/demo garage	81/160	Gryphon Architects
2.	Barry Lyden 10-4877	4 West Miacomet Road	New garage, cabana	81/160	Gryphon Architects
3.	Susan Doughan 10-4878	63 Orange Street	Rev. 48565: clr chg/ rf/side	55.4.1/16	Gryphon Architects
4.	Helene Patterson 09-4768	19 Brewster Road	New cottage/garage	54/1751.1	Gryphon Architects

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns (2:02) **McCarthy** – The representative has asked that Items 1-4 be held for Tuesday.
Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold Items 1-4 for Tuesday, November 9th. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Camp-aye Certificate #

5. Franze Residence 10-4873 71 Orange Street Hardscape 55.4.1/167 Edgewater

6. Juan Hernandez 10-4879 328 Madaket Road Deck Addition 60/103 Self

7. Cheryl Gilbert Et al 10-4881 16 D Street Revisions 60.2.1/2 EMDA

8. Robert Rothbard 10-4880 3 Brooks Farm Road Revisions 41/222.7 CWA

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns (2:04) Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold Items 5-8. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Camp-aye Certificate #

9. Town of Nantucket 48 Sparks Avenue Demo Athletic Fields 55/242 John McMeeking
 Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Dick Webb, SMRT Architect and Engineers
 Diane O'Neil, NPS Director of Facilities and Grounds.

Public None
 Concerns (2:05) **Webb** – Presented project; our structural engineers do not feel the team building is suitable for moving.
Backus – Requested a separate application for the demo-move off of the team building with its age.
McLaughlin – He would like to view this; he's concerned about how much steel will be moved and removed.
Motion Motion to View and to come back on Tuesday, November 9th. (McLaughlin)

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye Certificate #

10. Town of Nantucket 48 Sparks Avenue New fields & amenities 55/242 John McMeeking
 Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and photometric lighting plan.
 Representing Dick Webb, SMRT Architect and Engineers
 Diane O'Neil, NPS Director of Facilities and Grounds.

Public None
 Concerns (2:05) **Webb** – Presented project; track and field portion proposed to get new light fixtures on 80' poles; there is an option to clad the press box in traditional cedar shake. Proposing a retaining wall at the corner of the track nearest the cemetery; explained the grading around the grandstand/press box and up to the field closer to Sparks Avenue. Green fencing tends to fade; asking for black. Existing trees and growth along Sparks Avenue will be maintained.
O'Neil – The grandstand built into the hill alleviates any need for elevators for it to be ADA compliant.
Coombs – She'd prefer the press box be shingled. Asked how close the track comes to the cemetery (10'). Would prefer any wind fencing be green, rather than black. This is sensitively done, and we need it.
Thornewill – Asked if the rear of the bleachers is flush with the level of the other field; she'd like to see a cross section between the two fields. Asked that the chain-link fencing along the path be on the field side. This is awesome.
Camp – Asked if we will see a landscaping plan for around the fields and along the road. Supports shingles on the press box.
Welch – Agrees with the idea of a view; this is important for the community and the kids. He has no real problem with the proposal; it might be an improvement over what is currently visible. Supports black chain-link fencing. Asked that a copy of the drawings be emailed to commissioners.

Motion Motion to View with a set of plans and to come back on Tuesday, November 9th. (McLaughlin)

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye Certificate #

Rest held for Tuesday, November 9th.

11. Alexa Watts 10-4987	33 Vesper Lane	Addition	55/126	Topham Design
12. Padir Halil 10-4901	69½ Cliff Road	Revise roofwalk and railing	30/204	Topham Design
13. 4 Lowell NT 10-4903	4 Lowell Place	Fenestration revisions	41/168	Topham Design
14. John Donoghue 10-4888	10 Holly Street	New studio	80/23	Thornewill Design
15. Robin Halik 10-4876	46A Surfside Road	Fix as-built vent violation	67/120.3	Thornewill Design
16. Robert Hockaday 10-4911	3 New Street, Sias	Rev. 2401 window replace	73.1.3/37	Thornewill Design
17. 11 India St, LLC 10-4897	29 Center Street	Move existing shed	42.3.1/122.2	Ahern
18. 11 India St, LLC 10-4896	4 Chestnut Street	Hardscape revision	42.3.1/68	Ahern
19. 11 India St, LLC 10-4895	16 South Federal Street	Hardscape/gate	42.3.1/70	Ahern
20. Craig Majernik 10-4893	63 Burnell Street	Pool and hardscape	49.3.2/1.1	Ahern
21. 45 Shawkemo Rd, LLC 10-4894	45 Shawkemo Road	Pool and hardscape	27/18	Ahern
22. Joan Albaugh 10-4892	73 Miacomet Road	Addition	66/62	Brook Meerbergen
23. Tom Etheridge 10-4905	16 Lyons Lane	Hardscape	76/15	Atlantic Landscaping
24. ACK-Livin NT 10-4904	2 Hedgebury Lane	Pool	41/593	Atlantic Landscaping
25. Tiffany Lawrence 10-4906	5 Todd Circle	Pool	66/296	Atlantic Landscaping
26. Wesley Delcol 10-4931	10R Golfview Drive	Rev. COA: change porch	66/191	Atlantic Landscaping
27. Wayne Berman 10-4902	98 Tom Nevers Road	Fenestration revisions	91/40	NAG
28. Nantucket Land Bank	19 Wauwinet Road	Move off barn	20/35	Val Oliver Design
29. NISDA	23, 25 Wauwinet Road	Move on barn	20/36&80	Val Oliver Design
30. Paul Picarillo 10-4907	6 Baltimore Street	Shed	60/106	Val Oliver Design
31. Scott Sampson 10-4908	14 Aurora Way	Rev. 4375: ridge, windows	56/445	Val Oliver Design
32. MCB Revocable Trust 10-4909	1 Falmouth Avenue	Rev. 3320:	82/411	Val Oliver Design
33. Grey Lady Lane, LLC 10-4936	10 Grey Lady Lane	Add hip to front porch	66/705	Val Oliver Design
34. Drake Real Estate 10-4941	2 Horn Beam Road	Pool house	21/118.5	Val Oliver Design
35. Robert King 10-4910	16 Wood Hollow	Fence	72/10	Self

HDC Minutes for November 4, 2021, adopted Nov. 16

36.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 10-4912	5 Sherburne Way	Rev. 4356: MH	30/38	Botticelli + Pohl
37.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 10-4913	5 Sherburne Way	Rev. 4263: GH	30/38	Botticelli + Pohl
38.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 10-4914	5 Sherburne Way	New pool and spa	30/38	Botticelli + Pohl
39.	Colby Crenshaw 10-4924	24 Almanac Pond Road	Pool, spa, hardscape	25/37	Jardins Intl.
40.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4919	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo cottage	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
41.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4920	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo studio	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
42.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4921	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo workshop	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
43.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4922	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo greenhouse	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
44.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4923	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo shed	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
45.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4918	265 Madaket Road	Deck/fenestration/color	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
46.	Ed Mahoney 10-4926	1 Lilac Court	New dwelling	68/359	KOH
47.	Ed Mahoney 10-4925	4 Lilac Court	New dwelling	68/365	KOH
48.	Richmond Great Pt. 10-4942	2 Honey Suckle Drive	New dwelling	68/668	KOH
49.	Richmond Great Pt. 10-4943	1 Aster Court	New dwelling	68/668	KOH
50.	Barry Ang 10-4929	11 Jonathan Way	Rev. COA – add cupola	75/42	McMullen + Assoc.
51.	Mark Crosbby 10-4930	73 Goldfinch Drive	Revisions	65/570	BPC
52.	George Wing 10-5042	6 Swain Street	Add gabled dmr over porch	42.4.1/82.2	Self
53.	Westmoor Club	105 West Chester Street	Replce sports court/chg mat	41/805	Adam Davis
54.	Jeffery Greenberg 10-4940	30A Orange Street	Garage reno/addition	42.3.2/200	Emeritus
55.	Horchow Family NT 10-4934	27 East Tristram Avenue	Rev. 4699: porch	31/2	Emeritus

V. OLD BUSINESS 11/02/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Paul Benk 09-4592	8 N Gully	Add dormer	73.1.3/48	Emeritus
2.	Seawing LLC 07-4176	13 Low Beach Road	Garage move off	74/45	Smith/Hutton
3.	Seawing LLC 07-4178	13 Low Beach Road	Main house addition	74/45	Smith/Hutton
4.	Seawing LLC 07-4177	13 Low Beach Road	Shed	74/45	Smith/Hutton
5.	Hannah Craven 09-4787	17 Pine Street	Hardscaping	42.3.3/26	Normand Residential
6.	Ezia Athletic Club 09-4645	117 Orange Street	Fenest and color change	55/377	EMDA
7.	Terri Keogh 09-4767	7 Bunker Hill	Revise dwelling	73.4.2/39	Topham Design
8.	Norris Building Co 09-4569	16 Lowell Place	Hardscaping	41/164	Atlantic Landscaping
9.	Tim Reinemo 09-4618	65 Lovers Lane	New dwelling	80/214.1	Self

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	October 26 & 28, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, November 9, 2021 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, Intro • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:40 pm. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board