



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,  
**Associate Commissioners:** Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

**Thursday, September 23, 2021**

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,  
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:02 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Interim HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, PLUS Administrative Assistant; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker  
 Attending Members: Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill  
 Absent Members: Camp, Dutra  
 Late Arrivals: Welch, 1:12 pm;  
 Early Departures: McLaughlin, 1:35 pm.

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as amended. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

## I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

## II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Ramos Family RT <b>09-4575</b>	24 South Shore Road	Fence and screening	80/116	Leigh Topham
2.	59 Bartlett Road, LLC <b>09-4721</b>	59 Bartlett Road	Add porch roof	66/99.1	Linda Williams
3.	NHA <b>09-4722</b>	89 A-B Bartlett Road	Change roof overhang	66/410	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	McLaughlin having connection difficulties.				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Coombs)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye;			Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-(as noted)</b>

## III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

4.	Karli Hagedorn <b>09-4553</b>	34 West Chester Street	Hardscaping	41/31	Julie Jordin
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	McLaughlin having connection difficulties.				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	<b>Backus</b> – Approvable with following conditions: There is preservation restriction and need to have their concurrence on this project.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with concurrence from New England Preservation Trust. (Coombs)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4553</b>

**IV. NEW BUSINESS (9/14/2021)**

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Mark Knight <b>08-4494</b>	60 Nobadeer Avenue	Addition and renovation	88/10	Permit Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	McLaughlin connection issues			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Mark Poor, Permits Plus			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:11)	<p><b>Poor</b> – Presented project; circa 1990s.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – This is a nice job of maintaining the quiriness of the structure while expanding the program.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – Agrees. Confirmed there will be square posts on the porch. No concerns.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Okay with what’s happening; it’s in the back.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – No concerns.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as sub mitted. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-08-4494</b>	

2. Margaret Nolen <b>08-4528</b>	28 Easton Street	LK replace of ext. materials	42.1.4/15	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	McLaughlin not responding			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Mark Poor, Permits Plus			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:18)	<p><b>Poor</b> – Presented project; completely renovated in 1991; Brosco will make mahogany window.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – No historic information on the application; HDC survey indicates 1938 and National Historic Landmarks (NHL) data indicates 1900s; a window survey would be helpful.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 9/13: property record card says built in 1990 (in correct per Ms. Backus) – no concerns.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – He’s been through this house; all windows were replaced during the 1990 renovation; no old windows are left.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – No concerns.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – The mahogany windows will be good as long as they have the same mullion pattern.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – No concerns.</p> <p><b>McLaughlin</b> – No comments: connection issues.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Coombs, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-08-4528</b>	

3. Mueller Nantuc. Assoc. <b>09-4554</b>	11 North Mill Street	Fenestration + trim color	55.4.4/77	CWA
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Amy Ledoux, Chip Webster Associates			
Public				
Concerns (1:26)	<p><b>Ledoux</b> – Presented project; yellow trim and sash to Quaker grey; only replacing windows and doors in addition.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – Did not go to HSAB. This is listed as 30 Prospect Street and in 1930s made up of 3 houses; southwest and northeast elevations, recommend keeping 8-over-12 windows; northeast elevation, the proposed 12-light, 1-panel door is not appropriate.</p> <p><b>McLaughlin</b> – The proposed 12-light doors are okay if the panel is wood.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – The 12-light doors on the front and back should not be changed.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Okay with the windows. Has concerns about the 12-light door facing Prospect Street.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Concurs about the door.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with no change to the southwest-elevation front door. (Welch)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4554</b>	

4. Tom Donovan	<b>09-4555</b>	106 Surfside Road	2nd floor deck	67/50	JN design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	McLaughlin disconnected				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Josiah Newman, JN Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:35)	<p><b>Newman</b> – Presented project; this is 106W (west) Surfside.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – No concerns.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – No concerns due to no visibility.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – The depth of the deck plus stair landing is over 10 feet; asked if the stairs could be moved toward the house to bring the depth of the deck to 8 feet.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Given the location, no concerns.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – This is on the rear and not visible.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4555</b>

5. Paul Benk	<b>09-4592</b>	8 North Gully Road	Add dormer	73.1.3/48	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	McLaughlin not responding; Oliver stepped out.				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:42)	<p><b>MacEachern</b> – Presented project.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – HDC survey doesn't have a date but states contributing; NHL dates to 1976; speculates that is a revision date. Read SAB comments: dormer too big and top heavy; suggested "reverse" gable or shed dormer.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – He'd like to view this. His comments would be based upon what's adjacent to this.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – The proposed dormer is inappropriate in its size.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – Okay with a gable dormer but as proposed it overwhelms the simplicity of the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – Agrees with SAB; either reduce the size of the gable or go with a shed.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to View and hold for revisions. (Coombs)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

6. 2 Chestnut St, LLC	<b>07-4271</b>	2 Chestnut Street	Addition	42.3.1/69	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:49)	<p><b>MacEachern</b> – Asked this to be held for Tuesday September 28 to maintain a consistent board. Not opened at this time.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold at applicants request to be heard September 28. (Welch)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

7.	Mary Claus Rev Trust <b>09-4582</b>	31 Low Beach Road	move on site/partial demo	74/36	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:50)	<p><b>Botticelli</b> – Presented project; unsure of the age of the building; the historic photo shows a significantly different roof line and eave height; existing height of 27’9” is not changing.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – This is contributing: HDC survey indicates 1938; Nantucket Preservation Trust documentation indicates it goes back Florence Coffin Kirk during the planning of the Low Beach area; it changed from 1900 to 1938; she’s also concerned about the age of the ell proposed for demolition; if it is moved and the ell demolished, the history must be documented; NHL data indicates circa 1863 with lots of additions.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – Loves this little building, which is iconic on the street; would hate it be hidden in the back. She could see changing it to a garage in its existing location.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – She’s confused about what is happening on the lot.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – It shouldn’t be changed to a garage but okay with moving it back.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for more information. (Welch)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
8.	PFox Nantucket, LLC <b>09-4583</b>	20 Orange Street	Cottage addition	42.3.2/70	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:02)	<p><b>Botticelli</b> – Presented project; main house no longer has triple 12-over-12 windows facing the harbor.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – This is circa 1977 associated with typical Nantucket circa 1800; prefer retaining and reusing the triple 12-over-12 window on the north.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – She’s okay with this.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – No concerns.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Appreciates comments about keeping the 12-over-12s but agrees with matching the main house.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Doesn’t think it will be visible.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Thornewill)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Welch, Thornewill, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4583</b>
9.	8 Walbang Nom Trust <b>09-4581</b>	8 Walbang Avenue	Demo/move off MH	82/146	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:10)	<p><b>Botticelli</b> – Presented project; circa 1991; this is in the moorlands management area.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – NHL dates this circa 1991.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – It’s weird that houses built in our time are now being demolished; it’s in good shape and doesn’t see why it can’t be renovated.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill; there’s so much need for housing it’s sad we can’t reuse these houses.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – She’s okay with this. Would like to see reusable elements saved.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – She hopes for a move.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as a move-off/demolition. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Welch, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4581</b>

10. 8 Walbang Nom Trust **09-4580** 8 Walbang Avenue New dwelling 82/146 Botticelli + Pohl  
 Voting Coombs (acting chair), Oliver, Welch, Thornewill  
 Alternates None  
 Recused Pohl  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl  
 Public None  
 Concerns (2:16) **Botticelli** – Presented project.  
**Welch** – North elevation, the masses seem a little tall. South elevation, concerned about the amount of deck space. East elevation, the left gable over the porch feels aggressive; asked if it could be hipped.  
**Thornewill** – Agrees with Mr. Welch about the gable over the porch and the amount of decking. It’s open space with scrub growth out there so wonders about the visibility of the long elevations. She wants to view this.  
**Oliver** – Also wants to view this.  
**Coombs** – Agrees with Mr. Welch about the gable porch roof. The architectural style fits in with the area.  
 Motion **Motion to View and hold for revisions. (Welch)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

11. Kathleen Waldorf **09-4584** 54 Madequecham Valley Rd Addition 88/20 Botticelli + Pohl  
 Voting Coombs (acting chair), Oliver, Welch, Thornewill  
 Alternates None  
 Recused Pohl  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl  
 Public None  
 Concerns (2:23) **Botticelli** – Presented project; doesn’t know where this would be visible from.  
**Welch** – He was out here recently; this is appropriate. North elevation, agrees with dropping the eave 6” and terminating the top of the dormer 6” off the ridge; suggested a change in the dormer roof pitch.  
**Oliver** – Agrees. Asked if the north elevation eave could be dropped 6” so that it’s not the same as the main mass.  
**Thornewill** – The new 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor dormer is the same as the other two and reads as a long block; would like it split into 2.  
**Coombs** – Would like the new dormer on the north split into 2 smaller dormers and pulled off the roof.  
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Welch, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

Rest held for Tuesday Sept 28

12. Sea Daze, LLC <b>09-4585</b>	27 Baxter Road	New bsmnt/fenest revisions	49.2.3/10	Botticelli + Pohl
13. Lauren Stein <b>09-4574</b>	11 Woodbury Lane	New dwelling	41/550	Normand Residential
14. Brian + Toni Franz <b>09-4589</b>	12 Cannonbury Lane	Deck/stair/fenest revisions	74/9	Workshop APD
15. Diane Elliot <b>09-4573</b>	28 Lily Street	Rev. + drvwy material chng	42/43	David Bartsch
16. ACKED, LLC <b>09-4588</b>	18B Bartlett Road	Rev: 4419: addition/fenest	67/113.1	Self
17. Hristo Rashkov <b>09-4586</b>	8 Lewis Court	Demo/move off shed	67/37	Self
18. Rufio ACK Holdings <b>09-4567</b>	93 Main Street	Rebuild gate to 6’ tall	42.3.3/17	JB Studios
19. Michael Sproule <b>09-4568</b>	31 Washing Pond Road	Pergola	31/29	Atlantic Landscaping
20. Norris Building Co <b>09-4569</b>	16 Lowell Place	Hardscaping	41/164	Atlantic Landscaping
21. Hedges, LLC <b>09-4570</b>	10 Bassett Road	Rev to retaining walls	26/39	Atlantic Landscaping
22. Chris Lorusso <b>09-4578</b>	316 Polpis Road	As-built retaining wall	25/7	Pat Taaffe
23. Chris Lorusso <b>09-4579</b>	316 Polpis Road	Change cooper roof layout	25/7	Pat Taaffe
24. Tom + Sherry Coffin <b>09-4576</b>	8 Pincrest Drive	Move on fm 13 Low Beach	68/421	Scott Menard
25. Town of Nantucket <b>09-4673</b>	113/135 Pleasant Street	Renew 73014: trailer move	55/270-271	Erika Mooney
26. 27 Fair Street, LLC <b>09-4595</b>	27 Fair Street	Historic reno – front bldg	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop APD
27. 27 Fair Street, LLC <b>09-4594</b>	27 Fair Street	Historic reno – back bldg.	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop APD
28. 27 Fair Street, LLC <b>09-4596</b>	29 Fair Street	Historic reno – front bldg.	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop APD
29. 27 Fair Street, LLC <b>09-4597</b>	29 Fair Street	Historic reno – back bldg.	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop APD
30. 30 Vestal, LLC <b>09-4611</b>	30 Vestal Street	MH fenest, dormer alt	41/45	Studio Ppark

**V. OLD BUSINESS 09-21-2021**

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. William Scannell 07-4293	119R Eel Point Road	Revisions to pool	33/17.1	Atlantic Landscaping
2. Dan Diplacido <b>08-4375</b>	20 Goldfinch	New dwelling	66/606	Val Oliver Design
3. 50 Brewster Rd, LLC	50 Brewster Road	Pool/hardscape/bocce court	43/96	Atlantic Landscaping
4. Jeffrey Kaschuluk <b>01-0461</b>	27 North Liberty Street	Addition, <del>move on lot</del>	41/453	Thornewill Design
5. Andrew Reger <b>08-4349</b>	7 East Lincoln Avenue	Add roofwalk, clarify color	42.4.1/8	Emeritus
6. Trogoh Nominee Trust <b>05-3640</b>	26 Easy Street	Mixed use structure	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
7. Conlon James Trust <b>08-4475</b>	24 Woodbine Avenue	Rev. 1511: add rfwlk, fenest	80/96	Emeritus

VI. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	September 14 & 16, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Next HDC Meeting <b>Tuesday, September 28, 2021 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM</b></li> <li>• Discussion of Advisory Board Review</li> <li>• Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda</li> <li>• Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings</li> <li>• Hardscaping</li> <li>• Discussion of salvaging demolitions</li> </ul>
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:29 pm. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board