



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, September 9, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:01 pm. and announcements by Ms. Camp

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Interim HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner
Attending Members: Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
Absent Members: Pohl, Oliver, Dutra
Late Arrivals: McLaughlin intermittent: arrive 1:10 pm. and gone at 1:19 and back at 1:26
Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 4-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. J. Kodz 08-4466	10 Back Street	Rev. 62307: failed inspec	55/353	M. Humphrey
2. J. Kodz 08-4465	10 Back Street	Rev. 68185: failed inspec	55/353	M. Humphrey
1. 77 Sparks ACK, LLC 08-4501	77 Sparks Avenue	Fenst/roof/clr change	55/138.1	Patrick Noddin
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	Coombs – Asked why 10 Back Street failed their inspection. McCarthy – Had added steps where there shouldn't have been; relocate shower.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-(as noted)

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Edward McCarthy 08-4493	10 Hinckley Lane	Deck/stairs/fenst rev	30/226	LINK
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Approvable with the north elevation railing executed like that of the south elevation and open railing at top of landing as shown in example A1 and A2 provided by staff 			
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No additional concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Welch, Thornewill, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4493

IV. NEW BUSINESS 08/31/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Charles Davidson 08-4449	10 Quince Street	Add French door	42.3.4/103	NAG
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Bill McGuire, Nantucket Architectural Group				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:05)	<p>McGuire – Presented project; not visible even from Hussey Street; agrees with keeping the window with a single French door with kick panel or move the window to the basement stairs and keep the double 12-light French doors with kick panel.</p> <p>Backus – This is contributing circa 1780 typical Nantucket structure contributed to Barnabas Coleman; there was no historic information on the application when it's imperative that we have that; the property had additions in 1990s; the change is on the historic portion of the house; should be a single door with the removed window saved.</p> <p>Coombs – Likes Ms. Backus idea of a single door with a panel at the base; the removed window must be saved for future use. She could accept moving the window right but wants the door to be a single French door.</p> <p>Thornewill – If they use a single door, they can leave the window; not adverse to 12-light French doors with wood kick panels because this is not visible; this is also minimally invasive to the historic structure.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill. He feels Ms. Backus should feel confident that she has our backing; if this information in the future is not included, she can deem the application as incomplete.</p> <p>Camp – Likes the French doors with kick panels as long as the existing window is saved for future use; she likes the balance of windows on this elevation.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 12-light French doors with kick panels aligned under the 2nd-floor window and reusing the old window in the basement stairs. (Thornewill)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Welch, Thornewill, and Camp-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4449
2.	Nant Westmoor Frms, LLC 08-4394	8 Old Westmoor Farm	New cabana	41/822	Workshop APD
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Lost McLaughlin				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:17)	<p>Kotchen – Summarized the project; presented project; the pool is approved.</p> <p>Thornewill – It's simple and trusts it's not visible.</p> <p>Welch – It's an appropriate structure whether or not it's screened.</p> <p>Coombs – No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Welch, Thornewill, and Camp-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4394
3.	Nant Westmoor Frms, LLC 08-4391	8 Old Westmoor Farm	Rev. 2918: add 2-flr/chg fenst	41/822	Workshop APD
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:21)	<p>Kotchen – Presented project; this is not visible; going to 26'6"; claims he can't bring the height down 2'6" because of position of door and need for head height; this matches the aesthetics of the house; the door is 7'.</p> <p>Thornewill – She liked the previously approved; it's a funny proportion but not visible.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees; okay with it so long as it's not visible.</p> <p>Coombs – It should be no more than 24' tall.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the garage not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Welch, Coombs, Thornewill, and Camp-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4391

4. Oliver Carr	08-4404	86 Cliff Road	Dwelling rotate & addtn	30/74.1	Robert Newman
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:27)	<p>Newman – Presented project; could move back 4’ or 5’.</p> <p>Thornewill – This positioning isn’t too different from others on the same side of the street. It looks like a good change.</p> <p>Coombs – Would like it moved a little off Cliff Road.</p> <p>Welch – It’s appropriate. He’s not sure 4 or 5’ is huge; it should stay within the line of other structures fronting on Cliff.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The change and structure are appropriate; he would approve as submitted.</p> <p>Camp – Wants it to have the same setback as houses either side of it.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with it shifted away from Cliff Road 4’. (McLaughlin)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4404	
5. Oliver Carr	08-4403	86 Cliff Road	Garage	30/74.1	Robert Newman
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:37)	<p>Newman – Presented project.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4403	
6. Oliver Carr	08-4402	86 Cliff Road	Hardscape	30/74.1	Robert Newman
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:39)	<p>Newman – Presented project; leveling the grade across the property to about elevation 16.</p> <p>Backus – Aprons are not required on dirt roads.</p> <p>McLaughlin – This is appropriate and natural to the neighborhood; he’d motion to approve.</p> <p>Thornewill – Asked if there is brick along Pilgrim Road, which is brick; suggests gravel; aprons on dirt roads don’t work and have to be constantly rebuilt.</p> <p>Welch – Asked about the grade change. It’s appropriate.</p> <p>Coombs – We don’t approve aprons on a dirt road.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the driveway to be peastone. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4402	
7. Hermansdorfer, C + B	08-4406	11 Deer Run Road	Rotate and resite house	57/20	Topham Design
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Joe Topham				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:44)	<p>Topham – Presented project.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (McLaughlin)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Welch, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4406	

8. M2D3 Irrevocable Trust **08-4453** 31 Washing Pond Road 2nd floor dormers on garage 31/29 Elizabeth Dunne

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Elizabeth Dunne Marcoullier
 Public None
 Concerns (1:46) **Marcoulier** – Presented project; 24’” existing; south elevation is enclosed to hide the pool equipment.
McLaughlin – The deck is over 8’ deep and should be pulled back. South elevation, the meeting rails do not align.
Thornewill – The front elevation, the dormer is overwhelming and has awkward window alignment; the dormer should be set back from the wall and the windows reduced about half in size. The stairs should be tucked within the 8’ dept of the deck.
Welch – The deck is 8’ deep. His concern is size of windows on the north elevation but okay with their positions. This massing is similar to 9 Washing Pond Road.
Coombs – The dormers overpower the garage; the north elevation windows should not be mulled, and the left extension of the dormer eliminated. South elevation, this is a garage and the dormer again should be reduced. The 2nd floor is top heavy. Agrees about pulling the stairs to within the 8’ depth.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions and images of similar structures in the area. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye Certificate #

9. John Johnson III **08-4451** 34 Easton Street Move off/demo dwelling 42.1.4/18 CWA

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.
 Representing Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates
 Public None
 Concerns (1:57) **Webster** – Presented project; circa 1965; we are reaching out to affordable housing.
Backus – The HDC survey was not included in the application; this is contributing based upon information provided from NPT – reviewed that information; deed restriction requires it be a single-family dwelling; in 2008, HDC reviewed a demolition prior to historic structures update. Concurs with HSAB. This is where cultural history outweighs architectural significance.
 Read HSAB comments 8/30: no survey or historical information; former owners include Walter Beinecke Jr. and sculptor Seward Johnson giving this historic relevance; it’s a unique example of post-modern architecture representing that period on Nantucket; would prefer to see this home renovated rather than demolished.
Coombs – This building needs to be left where it is; it fits into the streetscape. She opposes a demolition or a move.
McLaughlin – Visually this structure has no historical aspect. He thinks it should be demolished. He voted against approving this structure in 1965.
Thornewill – This is an anomaly on Easton Street; the only reason to keep it is because it’s tucked in. She doesn’t see the architecture as having anything to do with Nantucket. At the other end of the point, a couple of buildings have been allowed to be moved or demolished.
Welch – He tends to agree. It is our more modern history with historic reference to character. He’d like to see if this is uniquely qualified to be moved off and reused as bungalows for affordable housing. It could be put to good use. He’d want the replacement structure to echo the soft green break of this site.
Camp – She is with Ms. Coombs. Appreciates the history with the Beinecke and where it came from; it has relevance.
 Motion Motion to demolish. (McLaughlin) not carried//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs and Camp-nay
Motion to Approve the move off/demolition through staff with the applicant is to reach out top affordable housing with elevation drawings, interior photo documentation, and written history submitted into the file. (Welch)
 Roll-call Vote Carried 3-2//Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Welch-aye; Camp and Coombs-nay Certificate # **HDC2021-08-4451**

10. Sandra B Finlay **08-4450** 26 Eel Point Road New dwelling 40/118 CWA

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Representing Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates
 Concerns (2:15) **McCarthy** – This is being withdrawn.
 Motion **Withdrawn**
 Roll-call Vote N/A Certificate #

11. Housing Nantucket 08-4454	46 Okorwaw Avenue	Rooftop solar	79/213	ACK Smart
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.			
Representing	Tim Carruthers, ACK Smart			
Public	Anne Kuszpa, Director Housing Nantucket.			
Concerns (2:17)	<p>Kuszpa – Explained rooftop solar will help keep utility expenses down for residents of affordable housing. This is a rental in perpetuity and we’re applying for it to go on the SHI list.</p> <p>Carruthers – Presented project; not visible from Okorwaw.</p> <p>McLaughlin – These are nice outside the old historic district (OHD), not inside the OHDs. He’s okay with this even though it will be visible.</p> <p>Welch – It’s important to clarify that our designation is for the whole Island; the Federal government doesn’t recognize our OHDs. This meets all our solar guidelines except it’s not a black roof; the mitigating factors overcome that.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees with Mr. Welch. This is on the rear; if plants die, they will have to be replaced to mitigate visibility.</p> <p>Coombs – Thinks this is far enough off the road to not make out.</p> <p>Camp – We have to be careful with second generations to keep up the lack of visibility.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4454
12. Housing Nantucket 08-4459	5 Norquarta Drive	Rooftop solar	67/512	ACK Smart
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.			
Representing	Tim Carruthers, ACK Smart			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:25)	<p>Carruthers – Presented project.</p> <p>No concerns as it meets the guidelines.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0// Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4459
13. Housing Nantucket 08-4456	1R Monohansett Road	Rooftop solar	79/65	ACK Smart
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.			
Representing	Tim Carruthers, ACK Smart			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:29)	<p>Carruthers – Presented project.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Welch, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4456
14. Housing Nantucket 08-4455	1 Norwood Street	Rooftop solar	71.3.4/1	ACK Smart
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.			
Representing	Tim Carruthers, ACK Smart			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:31)	<p>Carruthers – Presented project.</p> <p>Welch – He was out there; this is a very dense area. Visibility is obliquely only from the driveway.</p> <p>Thornewill – If anything is visible, it’s in winter; okay with this.</p> <p>Coombs – Not sure if the roof is black; that is one of our guideline requests.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC202108-445

15. Housing Nantucket **08-4458** 66 Pochick Avenue Rooftop solar 79/177 ACK Smart
 Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.
 Representing Tim Carruthers, ACK Smart
 Public None

Concerns (2:34) **Carruthers** – Presented project; the view will be blocked by vegetation from anywhere except the driveway.

Coombs – This doesn't fit our guidelines: it's on the front and visible.

Welch – He thinks there is visibility; asked to view this. He'd like to see the presentation of panels more uniform; the broken first row should be on the top unless they can create a solid rectangle.

Thornewill – It goes against our guidelines. Asked if it's possible to have a ground array.

Motion

Motion to View. (McLaughlin)

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye Certificate #

Rest held for Sept. 14

16. Mark Norris 08-4504	14A Lowell Place	Rooftop Solar	41/164	ACK Smart
17. Richard Snowdon 08-4452	10-12 Massachusetts Ave	Shed	60.3.1/332	Structures Unlimited
18. Hristo Rashkov 08-4460	8 Lewis Court	Pool and hardscape	67/37	Hristo Rashkov
19. Candice Macoul 08-4462	72 Orange Street	New prch + drmr, fenst chg	55.4.1/25	CWA
20. Dean Lampe 09-4599	142 Surfside Road	New dwelling	80/98.1	Self
21. Dean Lampe 09-4600	142 Surfside Road	Garage	80/98.1	Self
22. Dean Lampe 09-4601	142 Surfside Road	Cabana	80/98.1	Self
23. Dean Lampe 09-4602	142 Surfside Road	Pool	80/98.1	Self
24. Dean Lampe 08-4495	15 Aurora Way	New Dwelling	56/447	Self
25. Dean Lampe 08-4499	15 Aurora Way	Garage	56/447	Self
26. Dean Lampe 08-4500	15 Aurora Way	Hot Tub	56/447	Self
27. NHA 08-4446	15 Broad Street	Roof chng to match bldg	42.4.2/61	James Lydon
28. Peter & Thea K Kaizer 08-4481	6 Nobadeer Avenue	Pool	80/37.2	Peter Kaizer
29. Mark Finnegan 08-4470	36 Warrens Landing	Rev. 3626: cabana massing	15/9	BPC
30. James Conlon LTR Etal 08-4475	24 Woodbine Street	Rev. 1511: add rfwalk, fenst	80/96	Emeritus
31. Michelle + Darren Black	28 Eel Point Road	Shed	40/44	Emeritus
32. Karin + Tim Demasi 08-4472	3 Gladlands Avenue	Rev.3424: extnd stairs+deck	80/234	Emeritus
33. Karin + Tim Demasi 08-4473	3 Gladlands Avenue	New garage	80/234	Emeritus
34. Karin + Tim Demasi 08-4474	3 Gladlands Avenue	New shed	80/234	Emeritus
35. Jamie Sterling 08-4479	45 Warren's Landing	Pool and hardscape	38/53	Atlantic Landscaping
36. 50 Brewster Rd, LLC 08-4476	50 Brewster Rd	Pool/hrdsce/bocce court	43/96	Atlantic Landscaping
37. MLR3 LLC 08-4484	45 Shawkemo Road	New main dwelling	27/18	Workshop APD
38. MLR3 LLC 08-4485	45 Shawkemo Road	New guest house	27/18	Workshop APD
39. Steven L Cohen Tr. 08-4488	222 Eel Point Road	Rev. 62937: guest house	38/36.1	Workshop APD
40. Steven L Cohen Tr. 08-4487	222 Eel Point Road	Potting shed	38/36.1	Workshop APD
41. NIR Retail LLC 08-4486	4 Harbor Square (SWR)	Commerical/historical reno	42.2.4/	Workshop APD
42. Kian Ross 08-4498	16 Trotters Lane	Resite main house	67/40	Self
43. Kian Ross 08-4496	7B Crooked Lane	Move off to 16 Trotters	41/80	Self
44. Kian Ross 08-4497	16 Trotters Lane	Move on frm 7B Crooked	67/40	Self
45. Mark & Holly Barber 09-4560	11 South Valley Road	Addition and fenestration	43/137	Self

V. OLD BUSINESS 9/7/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Oliver Carr -06-3954	84 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30/74.1	Robert Newman
2. Richard Chesley 08-4398	1 Wesco Place	Window replacement	42.4.3/54	Hristo Rashkov
3. Karalex N.T. 08-4319	188 Cliff Road	New dwelling	40/24	MCA+
4. 22 Easton Street, LLC 05-3643	22-24 Easton Street	Main house	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
5. Barry Ang 05-3821	11 Jonathan Way	Main house	75/42	McMullen & Assoc.
6. Barry Ang 05-3822	11 Jonathan Way	Cottage	75/42	McMullen & Assoc.
7. Barry Ang 05-3824	11 Jonathan Way	Pool/hardscape	75/42	McMullen & Assoc.
8. Lot 27 N Mill, LLC, 06-4021	Lot 27B Birdsong	New dwelling	55.4.4/80.1	Brook Meerbergen
9. 2 Chestnut St Nant, LLC 07-4271	2 Chestnut Street	Addition	42.3.1/69	Emeritus
10. MBL Norris 07-4268	14A Lowell Place	Shed	41/164	Emeritus
11. 33 N Mill, LLC 05-3789	7 North Mill Street	New dwelling	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz Design

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	August 24 & 26, 2021
Review Minutes	None
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, September 14, 2021 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to adjourn at 2:38 pm (McLaughlin)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board