



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, August 12, 2021

PLUS, 2 Fairgrounds Road, Conference Room – 1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:01 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner

Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill

Remote Participation: Per 940 CMR 29.10, Stephen Welch and Diane Coombs participating remotely via ZOOM

Absent Members: Oliver, Dutra

Late Arrivals: Welch, 1:37 p.m.

Early Departures: Camp, 2:17 p.m.

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. NEW BUSINESS 07/06/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Houghton, Jim 07-4186	12 Upper Tawpawshaw	New Dwelling	53/58	Shelter 7
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos.				
Representing	Jason Olbres, Shelter 7				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:04)	Olbres – Presented project. McLaughlin – Front door should be a typical 6-panel door. Camp – Likes the cottage-style door. No concerns. Thornewill – No concerns. Coombs – Every elevation has mulled windows; there’s plenty of room for them to be separated, especially on the east and south elevations. Pohl – Nothing to add.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the front door to have 6-lights. (Thornewill)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, and Pohl-aye; Coombs-nay		Certificate #	HDC2021-07-4186	

2. Westmoor Club, LLC **07-4189** 105 West Chester Street Tennis/pickleball courts 41/805 JGG Architects

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, photos.
 Representing Graham Goldsmith, JGG Architects
 John Cowdon, General Manager Westmoor Club
 Public Helen Moore, 12 Crooked Lane
 Virginia Warren, 117 West Chester Street
 Martin McKerrow, 106 West Chester Street and other properties in the area

Concerns (1:12) **Graham** – Presented project; developed the vegetative screen of native plants.
Moore – She can hear everything; for her, the pickle ball courts are not a visual issue.
Warren – There is inadequate parking for the facilities as is; concerned about excessive paving in a rural area. Opposed to the pickle ball courts, which will increase traffic.
McKerrow – Referenced a letter of opposition with 9 signatories. This should meet the residential nature of the area. Concerned also about “creeping development” on the property.
Cowdon – Responded to points neighbors have brought up: parking, noise, screening, and possible increased membership.
Coombs – Some consideration should be given to neighbor’s concerns; courts should be placed elsewhere on the property away from the road. We should have some certification that the pickle ball courts will shut down in the winter and the membership won’t increase beyond allowed. The neighbors have the right to “enjoy peaceful use of their properties”; this must fit into the neighborhood.
Camp – Most of the complaints are about noise and parking; that’s not our jurisdiction. We could request a reduction to 2 pickle ball courts. The barn would be a good buffer.
Thornewill – West Chester is a residential neighborhood; the dormitories should be sited along the West Chester Street with the courts more interior. Any buffer along West Chester Street should remain natural as is.
McLaughlin – What is proposed is approvable per HDC standards.
Pohl – We’ve heard neighbors’ concerns; there have been good suggestions to reduce the “nuisance” factor.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

III. OLD BUSINESS 07/27/21

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Howard Martin 06-4020	2 Back Street	New dwelling	55/389	LINK
Voting	Camp (acting chair), McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Victoria Ewing, LINK				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:54)	Ewing – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; other homes in the area have simulated-divided light windows (SDL). Backus – HSAB didn’t review. The height is 29’7” and no additive massing; should have true-divided light windows (TDL) in the old historic district (OHD); making it a 4-bay was a commissioner suggestion. Coombs – Appreciates the simplicity, which will fit in. Thinks a 4-bay would be too heavy for the size. Would like some more additive massing, which fits the suggested era. Thornewill – Additive massing would go off the rear, which wouldn’t be visible. This is appropriate for Back Street. Windows on the front should be TDL. Welch – No concerns regarding additive massing. Given proximity to the street, the proportions of doors and windows to overall mass are a little small. McLaughlin – This fits into the neighborhood and is approvable as is. Camp – This is boxy.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the windows on the visible sides to be TDLs. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Welch, and Coombs-aye; Camp abstain Certificate # HDC2021-06-4020				

2.	Jim Helfrich 05-3834	37 Fair Street	Addition/alteration/porch	42.3.2/212	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Camp				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:08)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – This is 1820 typical Nantucket; flush dormers seem out of place; west isn't in keeping with historical massing. Read HSAB comments 8/2: the dropped addition roof improves the feel of additive massing; north elevation, the flush shed dormer plate should drop to the window head casings, with the adjacent eave aligning with the meeting rails of the dormer windows; push the addition south so it steps back from the existing north face; the partial roof walk skirt will be visible from both Fair and Darling Streets and is very awkward - if allowed, the skirt should be natural to weather; the porch skirt boards should also be natural to weather; would prefer Essex Green to black doors and shutters; please send back to HSAB if revisions are submitted.</p> <p>Thornewill – This is more appropriate. Okay with the flush dormer. The addition reads as simple additive massing.</p> <p>Coombs – She agrees with HSAB. The roof walk skirt is overpowering and should be eliminated. Black is used on a different style; should be dark green. Raising the flush dormer windows on the north will help. Would like the chimney returned; it pulls the rear elevation together.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North elevation rear addition dormer meeting rails should align. He thinks with that, it's approvable.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees the roof walk skirt is overpowering. West elevation, the 2nd-floor right relative to the window sill looks off; the "D" window headers should be at 6'6". North elevation, it looks like there's room to drop the roof, eave, and dormer roof and eave; as proposed, it looks like a 1990s addition; the addition windows head height is the same as the main mass when normally there would be a stepping down.</p> <p>Pohl – North elevation flush dormer could be raised up to align the meeting rails.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation dormer window headers dropped to 6'6" and the eave dropped to the header; the meeting rail to align with the addition eave; and with green trim. (McLaughlin)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3834	

3.	Greg Raiff 05-3832	100 Low Beach Road	Hardscape revisions	75/27	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:27)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Welch – The grade change at the pool and structure are more acceptable than at the parking; the blocky retaining wall is out of place; the wall goes into the parking at least twice the length of the steps; suggested decreasing the grade change to reduce the height of the steps and correct the retaining wall.</p> <p>Coombs – Appreciates the rounding of the parking corners and the change in the vegetation. Confirmed there will be no hedge.</p> <p>Thornewill – Her concern is the use of granite for the stone steps, which will be visible; the wall and steps should be the same material.</p> <p>Pohl – They could use salvaged granite.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 3 risers at 8.25" with the grade dropping the grade to eliminate the 4th riser and stone steps to be salvaged granite. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, Thornewill, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3832	

Rest held for Tuesday Aug 17

4.	John Barry 05-3838	22 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	40/45	Emeritus
5.	John Barry 05-3956	22 Eel Point Road	New guest house	40/45	Emeritus
6.	John Barry 05-3895	22 Eel Point Road	New garage	40/45	Emeritus
7.	Trogoh Nominee Trust 05-3640	26 Easy Street	Mixed use structure	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
8.	33 N Mill, LLC 05-3789	7 North Mill Street	New dwelling	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz
9.	Mark Atkinson 06-4023	82 Baxter Road	Addition	49/39	Botticelli + Pohl
10.	Carol Anne Surface 04-3606	47 Warren's Landing Rd	Pool	38/54	BPC
11.	Kristine Amendalora 05-3625	8 Bank Street Sias	Additions	72.1.3/69	Angus Macleod

VI. NEW BUSINESS (08/3/2021)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Julius Pasy 07-4217	6 Bayberry Lane	Addition	67/73	Thornewill Dsgn
2.	Eileen Harkness 07-4215	5 Gardner Perry Lane	Demo shed	55/32.1	Thornewill Dsgn
3.	Eileen Harkness 07-4216	5 Gardner Perry Lane	Addition	55/32.1	Thornewill Dsgn
4.	James Gribbell 07-4236	2 Mulberry Street	New garage/cottage	55.4.1/20	Thornewill Dsgn

5.	Amos Hostetter 07-4237	58 Baxter Road	New dwelling	49/54	Will Stephens
6.	Tom Fusaro 07-4238	6 Toombs Court	New dwelling	68/155	Val Oliver Design
7.	TLG Properties 07-4251	21 Pleasant Street	Driveway	55.4.1/1	Edgewater
8.	Theodorakos Vaios Tr 07-4254	79 Pocomo Road	Demo/move off	15/5	CWA
9.	Hannah Gardner House 07-4272	6 Gull Island Lane	Historic determination garage	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
10.	Hannah Gardner House 07-4273	6 Gull Island Lane	Garage fenestration and roof	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
11.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 07-4263	5 Sherburne Way	New dwelling GH/garage	30/38	Botticelli & Pohl
12.	Steve Frohwein 07-4277	32 North Liberty Street	Move shed on site	41/159	Emeritus
13.	Steve Frohwein 07-4278	32 North Liberty Street	Replace windows/like kind	41/159	Emeritus
14.	2 Chestnut St ACK, LLC 07-4271	2 Chestnut Street	Addition	42.3.1/69	Emeritus
15.	MBL Norris 07-4268	14 Lowell Place	Shed	41/164	Emeritus
16.	Nantucket Oaks, LLC 07-4285	99 Low Beach Road	New studio #1	75/32.1	Normand Resid.
17.	Nantucket Oaks, LLC 07-4286	99 Low Beach Road	New studio #2	75/32.1	Normand Resid.
18.	Nantucket Oaks, LLC 07-4287	99 Low Beach Road	New studio #3	75/32.1	Normand Resid.
19.	William Scannell 07-4293	119R Eel Point Road	Rev pool	33/17.1	Atlantic Lndscpg
20.	Lund Nantucket R.T. 07-4292	173 Hydrangea Lane	Pool	73/97 & 98	Atlantic Lndscpg
21.	Shared Haven N.T. 07-4289	19 Derrymore Road	Pool	41/116	Atlantic Lndscpg
22.	Kris Megna 07-4288	2A Blueberry Lane	Roof top solar	80/178.1	ACK Smart

VII. OLD BUSINESS 08/10/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Wayne Berman 07-4229	98 Tom Nevers Road	Add, roofwalk, fenestration	91/40	NAG
2.	Lot 27 N Mill, LLC 06-4021	Lot 27B Birdsong	New dwelling	55.4.4/80.1	B. Meerbergen
3.	Lot 27 N Mill, LLC 06-4022	Lot 27B Birdsong	Studio	55.4.4/80.1	B. Meerbergen
4.	Jacqueline Pizzi 06-4081	3 Winn Street	Pool and hardscape	41/593	Atlantic Lndscpg
5.	22 Easton Street 05-3643	22-24 Easton Street	Main house	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
6.	22 Easton Street 05-3644	22-24 Easton Street	East garage	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
7.	22 Easton Street 05-3645	22-24 Easton Street	West garage	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
8.	22 Easton Street 05-3646	22-24 Easton Street	Gym pavilion	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
9.	22 Easton Street 06-4026	22-24 Easton Street	Pool and hardscape	42.1.4/12	Ahern
10.	Oliveira Martin Trust 06-4028	87 Cliff Road	Pool	30/168.1	Ahern
11.	Darrell Ferguson 06-4102	28 Main Street, Sias	Color change chimney and fenest	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
12.	Jessica Millard 06-4017	5 Cudweed	Windows/doors	82/145	Val Oliver
13.	NHA Macy Warehouse 07-4199	12 Straight Wharf	Unapproved Like-Kind doors	42.3.1/138	Linda Williams
14.	Norris Building Co. 06-4086	14A Lowell Place	Hardscape – spa	41/164	Atlantic Lndscpg

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	August 3 & 5, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, August 17, 2021 at 5:00 pm. 4 Fairgrounds Road, Community Room • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:44 p.m. (McLaughlin)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board Madaket Advisory Board