



Historic District Commission

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members: Micky Rowland, Lucy Dillon, Jascin Finger, Angus Macleod, Brook Meerbergen

Alternate Member: None

Planning and Land Use Services
2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

MINUTES

Monday August 9, 2021

I. Procedural Business

Call to order at 1:00pm

Attending members: Angus Macleod, Lucy Dillon, Mickey Rowland

Absent members: Brook Meerbergen, Jascin Leonardo-Finger

Late arrivals:

Early Departures:

Motion to Adopt Agenda as written made by Lucy Dillon

Seconded by Angus Macleod

Vote: carried unanimously

Approval of Minutes: **n/a**

Motion made by: **n/a**

Seconded by: **n/a**

Vote: **n/a**

II. Public Comment

None

III. Old Business 07/27/21 – See attached Comments

Property owner	Street address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. 33 N Mill LLC	7 N Mill Street	New dwelling	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz

IV. New Business 08/03/21 – See attached Comments

Property owner	Street address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Eileen Harkness	5 Gardner Perry Lane	Demo shed	55/32.1	Thornewill Design
2. Eileen Harkness	5 Gardner Perry Lane	Addition	55/32.1	Thornewill Design
1. James Gribbell	2 Mulberry Street	New garage/cottage	55.4.1/20	Thornewill Design
3. TLG Properties	21 Pleasant Street	Driveway	55.4.1/1	Edgewater
4. Nantucket 24 Mill St LLC	24 Mill Street	Demo shed	55.4.4/97	Self
5. Nantucket 24 Mill St LLC	24 Mill Street	New shed	55.4.4/97	Self
6. Hannah Gardner House	6 Gull Island Lane	Garage fenestration and roof	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
7. Steve Frohwein	32 N. Liberty	Move shed on site	41/159	Emeritus
8. Steve Frohwein	32 N. Liberty	Replace Windows/like kind	41/159	Emeritus
9. 2 Chestnut St ACK LLC	2 Chestnut St	Addition	42.3.1/69	Emeritus
10. MBL Norris	14 Lowell Place	Shed	41/164	Emeritus

Motion to approve comments made by Lucy Dillon
Seconded by Angus Macleod

V. Other Business

None.

VI. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn meeting made by Lucy Dillon at 2:50pm
Seconded by Angus Macleod

Submitted by Kadeem McCarthy

HSAB Recommendations for HDC

August 9, 2021

7 N Mill - ND

- Site –Most of the largest trees are being removed. This can easily be avoided by moving the house closer to North Mill Street. Preserving the trees should be a priority for the HDC to retain the more rural feeling of the neighborhood and to provide substantial screening from Mill Street.
- This house sits on an elevated ridge exacerbating the already tall roof line. Every effort should be made to lower the height as much as possible including dropping the eave down to the upper window headers.
- The left addition projects too far forward. Additions in the OHD should be as far to the back as possible. There is room on the site to pull the main mass forward allowing the left addition to slide back.
- The parking area should be on the side of the house rather than right in front.
- South –
 - On a 4 bay house, the front door should be to one side – not centered.
 - Door surround could use more detailing
 - The upper windows could be spread out more
 - On the left addition, there are two doors right next to each other. The 6 lite door facing front could be eliminated
 - The chimney detail is unusual
 - The main mass benefits from the soffit overhang, but the side additions should have a simpler detailing
 - This house should have corner boards as does practically every other house in the OHD.
- North – windows should align and relate between floors. The French doors will be visible from Mill Street and should be changed to a single door.
- West – shed dormer sides should be pulled in tighter to windows
 - The dormer eave should drop down to the window headers
 - Separate mulled windows

5 Garner Perry Lane – demo shed

- No concerns

5 Garner Perry Lane – garage addition

- The connector roof is a little awkward
- The forward facing gable and large wall area combine to make this addition compete with the main mass. Rotating the ridge 90 degrees would soften the appearance a bit. And perhaps simpler NTW batten doors would call less attention.

2 Mulberry St – new dwelling

- Siting – This proposal changes a somewhat natural and informal sloped yard into a series of level terraces by using tall stone walls. A more historic approach would be to allow the grade to slope more naturally and rely less on the stone walls. The existing stone retaining wall is low and very rustic. This should be the model for any new walls.
- The gambrel roof is a little concerning. There weren't a lot of gambrel barns in town, and this partially sunken gambrel has an unusual relationship to the grade around it. It seems unlikely that this complicated roof type would have been used for an outbuilding in this location.
- North – the dormer windows should be spread apart more to fill the dormer.
- East - the east facing elevated deck will be very visible from Mulberry St and is very awkward in size and shape. It would be preferable to have the outdoor space to the west where the view from Mulberry could be screened more easily.

21 Pleasant - driveway

- A cobblestone apron instead of brick would be more appropriate in this neighborhood. The existing driveway further down Candle House Lane is cobblestone.

24 Mill St – demo shed

- What is the date of the existing shed?
- would prefer to rebuild the old rather than build a new one

24 Mill St – new shed

- Better drawings are needed to show the overall height and accurate window placement
- A better site plan is needed to indicate the exact location.

6 Gull Island – garage revisions

- It isn't necessary to rebuild the roof to comply with the building code. Would prefer to keep the original roof line
- Change in siding material is ok

32 N Liberty – move shed

- Moving a shed or any secondary structure close to the street is counter to BWNIM. Would prefer to see it back off the street in the original location or pushed further into the corner.

32 N Liberty – window replacement

- No concerns

2 Chestnut - addition

- This addition does not fit into the neighborhood context. It is too tall, too close to the street, not at all subordinate to the main mass, roof pitch is too steep, dormer is too massive, and the connector is inappropriate in every way. It is not up to the HDC to approve a floating elevated passageway simply to meet the applicant's needs. There are other ways – including retaining the existing fire escape structure which is not an unusual site in town.
- A more acceptable approach would be to present this addition as a separate, smaller and lower, independent dwelling set back from the street with a discreet ground floor connector well to the back. Apparently a similar building was already approved in this location.
- The applicant is asking for too much structure too close to the street, creating an uninterrupted three story wall on a small side street in town. These streets should not become walled in by densely packed towering masses. The neighborhood originated as modest dwellings, and the streetscapes should retain that character.

14A Lowell Place - shed

- Ideally sheds in the OHD should be placed in the back of the dwelling. If it cannot go in back, then it should be considerably smaller and set several feet back from the main façade of the dwelling.