



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, July 29, 2021

PLUS, 2 Fairgrounds Road, Conference Room – 1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:04 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
 Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Dutra, Thornewill
 Remote Participation: Per 940 CMR 29.10, Diane Coombs is participating remotely via ZOOM
 Absent Members: Dutra
 Late Arrivals: Camp, 1:05 p.m.; Welch, 1:11 p.m.
 Early Departures: Welch, 2:20 p.m.

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. NEW BUSINESS 07/06/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Craig Majernik 07-4240	63 Burnell Street	New main house	49.3.2/1.1	Workshop APD
2. Craig Majernik 07-4241	63 Burnell Street	New garage/studio	49.3.2/1.1	Workshop APD
3. Craig Majernik 07-4243	63 Burnell Street	New cabana	49.3.2/1.1	Workshop APD
4. Craig Majernik 07-4242	63 Burnell Street	New shed	49.3.2/1.1	Workshop APD

Voting Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns **McCarthy** – It has been requested that this be held for Tuesday.
Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold Items 1-4 until Tuesday, August 3. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

5. 8 Walsh, LLC 07-4128	8 Walsh Street	Rev. 3819: fenestration	42.4.1/83	B. Meerbergen
-------------------------	----------------	-------------------------	-----------	---------------

Voting Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.

Representing Brook Meerbergen

Public None

Concerns (1:05) **Meerbergen** – Presented project; reviewed window survey; there are buildings in the area with Andersen windows.

Backus – Read HSAB comments 7/12: this is a significant structure (1920's); the windows appear to be in relatively good shape and should be repaired rather than be replaced; changing to insulated glass windows would diminish the historic integrity of the building.

Oliver – Our policy is to keep true-divided light (TDL) on the front with sides that are least seen, and the rear allowed to be simulated-divided light (SDL).

Thornewill – Ms. Oliver's suggestion is good; the SDLs on the side and rear won't be noticeable. Reuse any TDLs on the front that are in good condition.

Coombs – TDL should be on the front.

McLaughlin – Confirmed which existing windows are not being switched out.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with windows on the front to remain TDL; the rest can change to wood-clad SDL. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2021-07-4128**

6. Jessica Millard **06-4017** 5 Cudweed Road Fenestration & color change 82/145 Val Oliver Design

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill
 Alternates Welch
 Recused Oliver
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.
 Representing Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design
 Public None
 Concerns (1:16) **Oliver** – Presented project.
Camp – She likes the proposal; the color change will tone the whole thing down.
Coombs – Good with the proposal. Looking at the big windows on the south elevation 2nd floor, it makes the side less busy; this isn't a "cottagy" house; suggested only 3 windows on the top.
Thornewill – There is more glass being added, which changes the proportion of glass to wall; would prefer the width of glass not be so evident. Would like something done to have a little less glass on the south elevation 2nd floor.
McLaughlin – Clarified what's being applied for.
Pohl – He's a little concerned about all the glass but agrees the color will tone it way down.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

VII. OLD BUSINESS 07/13/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Thomas Rhodes II Trst 06-3932	125 Main Street	New dwelling	42.3.3/49	Gryphon Arch

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch
 Alternates Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.
 Representing Ethan Griffin, Gryphon Architects
 Public None
 Concerns (1:28) **Griffin** – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.
Backus – Read HSAB comments 7/26: very close to Quarter Mile Hill; can it be moved a couple feet to the west; prefer simpler shed dormer facing Main Street; sliding barn doors don't normally have cover transoms; lower the height of the barn doors; prefer to see west doors as hinged with black strap hinges; east doors should show strap hinges and wood latch; French doors are at least 4 feet wide and will be visible; prefer to see traditional proportioned door sizes, make narrower or break into 3 panels; please send back to HSAB if revisions are submitted. She forwarded abutter comments to commissioners.
McLaughlin – The change is appropriate.
Welch – Appreciates the change. South elevation is the most prevalent but is simple. East elevation, the barn doors should be affixed as a wall element, so we don't have to think about glass behind them. He has no concerns if the privet were to run all the way across; that would eliminate potential concerns.
Oliver – She has no concerns except with what might be visible. The west has an overabundance of glass; either make the door styles cohesive or eliminate the transoms.
Coombs – The south elevation dormer is too large for the window; cheek walls should come in or the window should be bigger.
Pohl – Suggested shutters on that south-elevation dormer window.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with shutters on the south elevation dormer window and with the barn doors to be fixed with no glass behind. (McLaughlin)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Oliver, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2021-06-3932**

2. Village Way RT 05-3782	6 Village Way	New dwelling	14/42	James Browers
----------------------------------	---------------	--------------	-------	---------------

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver
 Alternates Welch, Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns (1:37) Not opened at this time.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

3.	17 Lincoln RT 06-3968	17 Lincoln Avenue	Pool and hardscape	30/118	Ben Champoux
Voting	Welch (acting chair), Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Motion to Appoint Mr. Welch Chair <i>pro tem</i> . (Oliver)				
	Carried 3-0//Oliver, Thornewill, and McLaughlin-aye; Coombs-abstain				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ben Champoux				
Public	none				
Concerns (1:38)	<p>Champoux – Held for a view; none of the retaining walls will be visible; net decrease of parking will be about 1200 sf.</p> <p>Backus – She reviewed this; photos show it is visible from Jefferson Avenue; concurs with prior HSAB comments about the excessively large driveway.</p> <p>Thornewill – The retaining walls won't be visible; her only concern is the expanse of parking but that is being screened.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill. Suggested breaking up the Belgium block with a walkway of different material to the arbor.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Coombs – The parking should not so be severely edged and square; it looks very commercial. Round out the edges.</p> <p>Welch – Asked if it's possible to round the corners with a 2' radius (yes). Agrees with Ms. Oliver's suggestion. The grade change should not be perceived from the Jefferson Avenue.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the driveway corners rounded with a 2' radius and the grade should not be considered as perceived from Jefferson Avenue. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Thornewill, Oliver, Coombs, and Welch-aye; McLaughlin-nay	Certificate #	HDC2021-06-3968		
4.	14 MVR, LLC 04-3420	14 Madequecham Valley Rd	New dwelling	89/13	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:54)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Coombs – The center main mass is too massive. From a distance, this is perceived as a single long roof. Everything on the 2nd-floor is straight, right under the roof, and in a long line; that is atypical for the Madequecham area. A chimney would break up the main-mass roof line.</p> <p>Oliver – The north needs to be simplified; suggested removing the dormers on the north elevation wings.</p> <p>Camp – The massing is huge; the connector gives it some additive massing. Likes Ms. Oliver's idea; she'd be okay with removing one of the wing dormers.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Pohl – He agrees with Ms. Oliver's suggested to eliminate the dormers on the north elevation lower masses.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north-elevation flanking masses dormers eliminated. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-04-3420		
5.	Doug Meyer 05-3841	18 Gardner Road	New dwelling	43/135	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:06)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; explained the proposed grade changes.</p> <p>Camp – North elevation, the left screened-in porch shed roof looks like an add-on; suggested a hipped roof.</p> <p>Oliver – Her only concern is the north elevation left dormer pitches; they could be reduced so they drop off the ridge more and look simpler.</p> <p>Coombs – Appreciates the changes.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The dormer meeting rails need to drop.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the dormer pitch dropped to 5/12; change porch roof to a hipped; and align the dormer meeting rails. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Camp, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3841		

6.	Zero India Street, LLC 03-3268	1 Cambridge Street	Alteration + addition	42.3.1/130.2	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, advisory comments, and <i>Building with Nantucket in Mind</i> (BWNIM)				
Representing Public	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Concerns (2:20)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; height now 28’9”; reviewed color options.</p> <p>Backus – Looks a lot better but still seems tall; referenced BWNIM regarding maintaining the integrity of the front; south elevation dormers add to the height; look at historic references. Read HSAB comments 7/26: referenced HDC comments from July 6th; this is still too tall; the HDC has repeatedly asked that this be lowered by a significant amount – at least 3 to 4 feet; a 10/12 roof pitch is too steep and accentuates the height; lower the roof pitch to 7/12 or 8/12; eliminate the third floor; drop the plate to match the existing tower as suggested at HDC; the north and west elevation detailing should be simplified; it is more formal than the McKecknie building around the corner; lower India should remain simple and not over designed; would prefer a street façade that looks like a converted dwelling; eliminate clapboard on west and east; please send back to HSAB if revisions are submitted. The brick building is circa 1870.</p> <p>Coombs – She has repeatedly asked to drop the building height even lower so as not to compete with historic buildings. Remove all 3rd-floor dormers and eliminate the 3rd floor. The front façade has improved. Set the 2nd floor back or reduce the number of windows. We have to keep the age of the historic portion in mind when adding to a historic building; feels more could be done to keep it from looking like circa 2021.</p> <p>Thornewill – Appreciates removing the front 3rd-floor dormers and shutters. Doesn’t think the rear 3rd-floor dormers will be that prominent but suggests simplifying the trim, the rake size draws attention. The height is under 30’. She doesn’t support the idea of black sash.</p> <p>Camp – She’d love the height to come down a couple of feet more but doesn’t want to lose the west elevation. She thinks black trim will pop with the brick, but it might not work on the “old-fashioned” store front look.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with what’s been said but disagrees with allowing black; we’ve turned down other requests for black.</p> <p>Pohl – The flat-roof cricket is a deck; you’ll see people standing on a roof destroying the roof illusion; it shouldn’t be accessible. Appreciates all the changes; the 28’9” is good.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with colors to be white windows on 1st floor of new section and Essex green on the second floor with white trim; eliminate the cricket deck; and reduce the dormer plate height as much as is allowed. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Thornewill, Camp, oliver, and Pohl-aye; Coombs-nay			Certificate #	HDC2021-03-3268

The rest held for Tuesday Aug 3

7.	Nantucket Invest. Hldgs 06-4041	22 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	14/73.1	Emeritus
8.	Jennifer Silva 04-3381	14 Harborview Way	Lift, addition, & roofwalk	42.4.1/26	Thornewill Dsgn
9.	38 Prospect LLC 05-3831	38 Prospect Street	Lot 29 – spa	55.4.4/56	Linda Williams
10.	Stelphanie Basile 04-3602	8 New Mill Street	Rev. Garage/apartment	42.3.3/33.2	Linda Williams

VII. NEW BUSINESS 07/20/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	TJL Properties, LLC 07-4193	21 Pleasant Street	Demo garage	55.4.1/1	Linda Williams
2.	Daniel Bartlett 07-4144	4 Mioxes Way	Move off to 41B Bartlett Farm	68/87	NAG
3.	Daniel Bartlett 07-4143	41 Bartlett Farm Road	Move on frm 4 Mioxes Way	82/500	NAG
4.	Moor Better, LLC 07-4148	4 Moors End Lane	Dormers	41/211	Topham Design
5.	Mark Burlingham 07-4163	15 Beach Street	New fence + gate	73.1.3/26	Topham Design
6.	Cinda Gaynor 07-4149	84 Old South Road	Hoop tent	68/415	Greyson Keller
7.	Tom Hanlon Lndscpng 07-4184	117 Old South Road	New commercial bldg.	68/111	EMDA
8.	JDB 34 Liberty, LLC 07-4200	34 Liberty Street	Fence	42.3.4/82	Linda Williams
9.	Chris Loftus 07-4206	8A Evergreen Way	New cottage	68/703.1	Linda Williams
10.	NHA Macy Warehouse 07-4199	12 Straight Wharf	Barn doors	42.3.1/138	Linda Williams
11.	Joseph Arvay 07-4214	11 Front Street	Replace 3 windows	73.1.3/99	Nolasco Const
12.	Ann Laurilliard 07-4192	22 Cliff Road	Replace all windows	42.4.4/51	Thornewill Dsgn
13.	Nicholas Boyle 07-4188	31 York Street	Spa/fence/arbor/ODS/patio	55.4.1/205	David Troast
14.	Seawing, LLC 07-4178	13 Low Beach Road	MH- addition	74/45	Smith & Hutton
15.	Seawing, LLC 07-4177	13 Low Beach Road	Shed	74/45	Smith & Hutton
16.	Seawing, LLC 07-4176	13 Low Beach Road	Garage move off/demo	74/45	Smith & Hutton
17.	John Khann 07-4181	8 Okorwaw Avenue	New dwelling	79/132	M Cutone Arch
18.	Sally Horchow 07-4191	27 East Tristram Avenue	Hardscape	31/2	Ahern, LLC
19.	Joe Tirone 07-4180	25 Honeysuckle	New duplex	68/389	Val Oliver Design
20.	Liz & Mark Norris 07-4175	14A Lowell Place	Revisions to proposed cottage	41/164	Emeritus
21.	Housing Nantucket 07-4171	31 Fairgrounds Road	New Dwelling- bldg. 6	67/149	Emeritus
22.	Housing Nantucket 07-4172	31 Fairgrounds Road	New Dwelling- bldg. 7	67/149	Emeritus
23.	HGMB, LLC 07-4183	34 Prospect Street	Hardscape revisions	55.4.4/77	Mark Godfrey

24.	Peter O'Brien 07-4174	36 Low Beach Road	GH Rev. 1842: fenestration	74/55	Emeritus
25.	Laura & Doug Fisher	7 Paul Jones Road	New Pool	30/68.1	Emeritus
26.	90 N Liberty Pres.Trst 07-4195	90 North Liberty Street	New Foundation	41/22	Botticelli & Pohl
27.	The Braes, LLC 07-4165	23 Baxter Road	Addition	49.2.3/12	Botticelli & Pohl
28.	Houghton, Jim 07-4186	12 Upper Tawpawshaw	New Dwelling	53/58	Sheller 7
29.	38 Monohasset, LLC 07-4182	38 Monohansett	New Dwelling	79/60	Val Oliver Design
30.	Molly McGrath Irv. Trst 07-4225	50 West Miacomet Road	Rev. 67335: fenestration revs	86/2	Sue Genthner
31.	30 Vestal, LLC 07-4187	30 Vestal Street	755sf cabana	41/45	Studio Ppark
32.	Jennifer Bowman 07-4194	14 Starbuck Road	Spa - hardscape	60/114	Jardins Intl
33.	Westmoor Club, LLC 07-4189	105 West Chester Street	Tennis/pickleball courts	41/805	JGG Architects
34.	ACK 860 QR, LLC	86 Quidnet Road	Rev 2944; win/doors	21/102	NAG
35.	Perry Hall 07-4231	19 Medouie Creek Road	Garage	14/33	Self
36.	5 Bunker Hill, LLC 07-4259	7 Bunker Hill Road	New dwelling	73.4.2/39	Topham Design
37.	G2 Bunker Hill, LLC 06-4101	7 Bunker Hill Road	Pool and hardscape	73.4.2/39	Topham Design

VIII. OLD BUSINESS 07/27/21

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	Michael Herbert 06-4046	4 Harbor View Way	Alteration	42.4.1/30	Topham Design
2.	David Lazowski	18 Parson Lane	Hardscaping	75/102	M. Cutone Arch.
3.	Downyflake	14 West Creek Road	Commercial building	55/175	Robert Newman
4.	Downyflake	14 West Creek Road	Rooftop solar	55/175	Robert Newman
5.	Lentini, Salvator 06-4048	20 Field Avenue	Main house addition	80/149	CWA
6.	Lentini, Salvator 06-4052	20 Field Avenue	Pool	80/149	CWA
7.	Lentini, Salvator 06-4054	20 Field Avenue	Pool cabana	80/149	CWA
8.	Brian Harris 06-4064	51 Weweeder Avenue	New dwelling	88/12	Emeritus
9.	Robin Tweedy 06-4065	3 Grand Avenue	Renovation	73.3.1/13.1	Emeritus
10.	Jim Ikard 05-3833	1 Bloom Street	Addition	42.3.3/140	Emeritus
11.	Jim Helfrich 05-3834	37 Fair Street	Addition/alteration/porch	42.3.2/212	Emeritus
12.	Greg Raiff 05-3832	100 Low Beach Road	Hardscape revisions	75/27	Emeritus
13.	John Barry 05-3838	22 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	40/45	Emeritus
14.	John Barry 05-3956	22 Eel Point Road	New guest house	40/45	Emeritus
15.	John Barry 05-38955	22 Eel Point Road	New garage	40/45	Emeritus
16.	Trogoh Nominee Trust 05-3640	26 Easy Street	Mixed use structure	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
17.	33 N Mill, LLC	7 North Mill Street	New dwelling	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz
18.	Mark Atkinson 06-4023	82 Baxter Road	Addition	49/39	Botticelli + Pohl
19.	Carol Anne Surface 04-3606	47 Warren's Landing Rd	Pool	38/54	BPC
20.	Kristine Amendaloro 05-3625	8 Bank Street Sias	Additions	72.1.3/69	Angus Macleod

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	July 15, 20, & 22, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, August 3, 2021 at 5:00 pm. 4 Fairgrounds Road, Community Room • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:41 p.m. (Thornewill)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0// Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board | Sconset Advisory Board | Madaket Advisory Board