



## Historic District Commission Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members: Micky Rowland, Lucy Dillon, Jascin Finger, Angus Macleod, Brook Meerbergen

Alternate Member: None

Planning and Land Use Services  
2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

### MINUTES Monday July 26, 2021

#### I. Procedural Business

Call to order at 1:01 pm

Attending members: Angus Macleod, Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Lucy Dillon, Mickey Rowland.  
Brook Meerbergen

Absent members:

Late arrivals:

Early Departures:

Motion to Adopt Agenda as written made by Lucy Dillon

Seconded by Jascin Leonardo-Finger

Vote: carried unanimously

Approval of Minutes: **July 12<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup>**

Motion made by: Lucy Dillon

Seconded by Jascin Leonardo-Finger

Vote: carried unanimously

**II. Public Comment**

None

**III. Old Business – See attached Comments**

Property owner	Street address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Thomas Rhodes II Trst <b>06-3932</b>	125 Main Street	New dwelling	42.3.3/49	Gryphon Arch
2. Zero India Street LLC <b>03-3268</b>	1 Cambridge Street	Alteration + addition	42.3.1/130.2	Emeritus

**IV. New Business – See attached Comments**

Property owner	Street address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. JDB 34 Liberty LLC	34 Liberty Street	Fence	42.3.4/82	Linda Williams
2. TJL Properties LLC	21 Pleasant Street	Demo garage	55.4.1/1	Linda Williams
3. NHA Macy Warehouse	12 Straight Wharf	Unapproved LK doors	42.3.1/138	Linda Williams
4. Ann Laurilliard	22 Cliff Road	Replace all windows	42.4.4/51	Thornewill Design
5. Nicholas Boyle	31 York Street	Spa/fence/arbor/ODS/patio	55.4.1/205	David Troast
6. Liz & Mark Norris	14A Lowell Place	Rev 3415; cottage fenestration	41/164	Emeritus
7. HGMB LLC	34 Prospect Street	Hardscape revisions	55.4.4/77	Mark Godfrey
8. 90 N Liberty Pres.Trust	90 N Liberty St	New Foundation	41/22	Botticelli & Pohl

Motion to approve comments made by Lucy Dillon  
Seconded by Jascin Leonardo-Finger

**V. Other Business**

None.

**VI. Adjournment**

Motion to adjourn meeting made by Lucy Dillon at 2:45pm  
Seconded by Jascin Leonardo-Finger

Submitted by Kadeem McCarthy

## HSAB Recommendations for HDC

July 26, 2021

### 125 Main St – New Dwelling

- Very close to Quarter Mile Hill. Can it be moved a couple feet to the west?
- Prefer simpler shed dormer facing Main St
- Sliding barn doors don't normally cover transoms. Lower the height of the barn doors.
- Prefer to see west doors as hinged with black strap hinges.
- East doors should show strap hinges and wood latch.
- French doors are at least 4 feet wide and will be visible. Prefer to see traditional proportioned door sizes, make narrower or break into 3 panels.
- Please send back to HSAB if revisions are submitted

### 1 Cambridge St – Additions

#### Previous HDC comments from last meeting:

Coombs – As proposed, this is too massive. The Atheneum, Catholic Church, and Post Office should not be stepped on and made less important; that is the crux of our responsibility to the old historic district (OHD). The 2nd-floor should be set back and the building smaller than the aforementioned. This is too massive in the center of downtown.

Camp – This reads as an anomaly. Appreciates removing the 3rd-floor dormers. Would like the height reduced 3 or 4 feet. It is important to get the color right.

Thornewill – This feels too tall; suggested using the existing tower top plate as a reference to drop the eaves of the 2nd floor. The 2nd floor shutters lend too much formality and pulls attention up there.

Oliver – Agrees with HSAB about the ways to lower the height and what's been said. Simple is better. Likes the north elevation front door; eliminate the clapboard in favor of shingles and no shutters. West elevation, same issues.

Pohl – Black shutters is too much. Simplify.

- This is still too tall. The HDC has repeatedly asked that this be lowered by a significant amount – at least 3 to 4 feet. A 10/12 roof pitch is too steep and accentuates the height. Lower the roof pitch to 7 or 8/12 and eliminate the third floor entirely. Drop the plate to match the existing tower as suggested at HDC.
- The detailing on the North and West elevation should be simplified. It is more formal than the McKecknie building around the corner. Lower India should remain simple and not over designed. Would prefer a street façade that looks like a converted dwelling.
- Eliminate clapboard on west and east.
- Please send back to HSAB if revisions are submitted

### 34 Liberty St - Fence

- No concerns

### 21 Pleasant St – Demo garage

- It should be moved rather than demoed.

### 12 Straight Wharf – Unapproved Like Kind Doors

- The interior and exterior should be treated to match the previous color and weathered look.
- The bigger concern is the modern glass door behind. The barn doors are like storm doors and left open all day revealing plate glass doors.
- A more appropriate approach would have been wooden doors with a multi-paned layout as they were before. On Nantucket we have always required that additions and details replicate historical elements rather than contrast with the existing structure.
- This can set a bad precedent. The Hub leaves their doors open all day too. Should they be allowed to put glass doors behind them – fully exposed to Main St?
- Please send back to HSAB if revisions are submitted
- These are NOT like-kind. The material is different, the construction is different, and the old strap hinges could have easily been re-used.

### 22 Cliff Rd – Replace

- Replacing every window in this house will completely change the historic character. The sash should be restored. The cost to restore will be similar or likely less expensive and they will last another couple of hundred years.
- Can replace the new Brosco windows if desired

### 31 York St – Spa, fence, ODS, patio

- There is too little screening for this spa. It will likely be visible through the proposed deciduous vegetation in the winter.
- Would prefer evergreen screening or a board fence on the wall
- Outdoor lighting plan?
- Will there be pool equipment?

### 14 A Lowell Place – revisions

- No concerns

### 34 Prospect St – Hardscape rev

- HSAB didn't receive proposed drawings, but Mark explained the proposals for the garage door, like kind front door replacement, ODS, and AC fence
- All sound acceptable

### 90 North Liberty – new foundation

- Will the house stay at the same elevation?
- Will there be areaways or basement windows or vents?
- Must follow secretary interior standards for rehabilitation to preserve its status
- Please hold for further info and send back to HSAB