



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Stephen Welch (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday March 28, 2023

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 4:06 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist. Fiona Johnson, Plus Staff

Attending Members: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Dutra, Patten

Remote Participants: None

Absent Members: None

Late Arrivals: Dutra (4:19pm)

Early Departures: Camp (8:20pm)

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll- Call Vote Carried 5-0 // Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

Backus- inform the public that the Opera House located on South water street has had some re-shingling done, and red shingles will be put back as they were originally.

II. COMMISSIONER'S COMMENTS

Oliver- Would like to discuss what deems structure significant or insignificant? What is the process? Would like to discuss.

Welch- Suggested reading Appendix C in "BWNIM".

III. DISCUSSION

Coombs- discussed proposed procedures and best practices that need to be followed by everyone involved. These are not rules, but rather practices that have been agreed upon to be followed. However, it seems that some people are not adhering to these practices, which can cause confusion and annoyance. The suggestion is to try and stick with these practices as much as possible to make it easier for everyone involved to know what to expect. The conversation also mentions the importance of time management during meetings and sticking to the allotted time for applicants to speak.

Pohl- Expresses his satisfaction with having rules in place and the difficulty of enforcing time limits without a stopwatch. The speaker suggests that they will have to rely on their intuition and patience to enforce the rules. They also encourage other members to speak up if they feel like something has gone on for too long.

Welch- The best practices conversation brought up and advanced through your organizational focus committee, the HDC-OFC, was and is about establishing good behaviors and rules in the context of an organization's practices. Emphasizes the importance of serving responsibly, transparently, and evenly, and setting a good example by not being redundant in discussions; suggests holding people to a time limit and focusing on architectural elements that are part of the organization's purview is of the utmost importance in getting caught up in order to regularly discuss more important elements such as area plans and demolition policies, and to have learning sessions to better understand the organization's operations.

Anne Dewez/Mill Hill- Best practices for streamlining processes and working with the public. The speaker suggests that there should be consequences for bad behavior or not following rules, particularly regarding interrupting and over speaking during meetings. The speaker suggests that repeat offenders should face sanctions or consequences for their disruptive behavior, which can make it difficult for follow-on applicants. The speaker encourages the consideration of consequences to curtail certain behaviors as best practices are discussed and implemented.

IV. SIGNS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Cotswold Two LLC 03-8136	8 Chester St	Projecting Sign	42.4.3/64	Marjorie Zinnanti
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill, Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Application, locus map, site plan, and sign information			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve per SAC (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye;		Certificate #	HDC2023-03-8136
2. St Paul Church 03-8167	16 Fair St	Free Standing Sign	42.3.2/5	Rev. Marx Wolf
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill, Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Application, locus map, site plan, and sign information			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions asked SAC to revise app/ applicant (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye;		Certificate #	HDC2023-03-8167
3. NIR Retail LLC 03-8151	16 Old South Wharf	Wall Sign	42.2.4/2	Susan Sheppard
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill, Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Application, locus map, site plan, and sign information			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve per SAC (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye;		Certificate #	HDC2023-03-8151
4. The Brant LLC 03-8152	6 8 N. Beach St	Master Sign	42.4.1/65	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill, Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Application, locus map, site plan, and sign information			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Hold for representation (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye;		Certificate #	HDC2023-03-8152

V. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Kelley Trustees 03-8190	18 Nonantum Ave	Roof replacement	87/18	Marlys Kelley
2. Stephen Welch 03-8203	13 Waydale Rd	Renew COA 05-1038	67/32	Stephen Welch
3. Stephen Welch 03-8206	13 Waydale Rd	Renew COA 72829	67/32	Stephen Welch
4. Stephen Welch 8205	13 Waydale Rd	Renew COA 72963	67/32	Stephen Welch
5. Stephen Welch 03-8204	13 Waydale Rd	Renew COA 72998	67/32	Stephen Welch
6. Joan O'Brien 03-8189	20 Tashama Ln	Color change	55/450	Joan O'Brien
7. Scrimshaw LLC 03-8119	4 Lilac St	Front stoop Rev 07-6711	68/365	KOH
8. Patrick Quigley 03-8130	10 Tashama Ln	Remove 2 nd fl add Rev 06-6442	55/478	Patrick Quigley
9. Jacob Martinson 03-8133	16 W. York St	No shutters, stoop chng Rev 02-5716	55/8.2	Val Oliver
10. Rios & Kline 03-8131	23 Tashama Ln	Enlarge window egress	55/464	Thornewill Design
11. Essex 34 ACK LLC 03-8135	34 Essex Rd	Add window, remove wart	67/672	Brook Meerbergen
12. Glenbeigh LLC 03-8160	33 Nonantum Ave	Garage rev 23-01-7687	87/49	Botticelli + Pohl
13. James Maloney 03-8147	22 Sheep Pond Rd	Roof replacement	63/31	James Maloney
14. Anna Oliver 03-8182	55 Hooper Farm Rd	New garage door	57/256	Val Oliver
15. David Buckley 03-8176	8 Nobska Way	Move on shed	66/101	Val Oliver
16. Conway Family 03-8196	55 Somerset Rd	New cabana	66/92	Val Oliver
17. Jim Houghton 03-8150	12 U. Tawpawshaw	Hardscape & retaining wall	53/58	Atlantic Landscaping

18. Robert Turner 03-8173	11 Seikinnow Place	New front stoop	67/525	DTA
19. Back East lot62 LLC 03-8165	62 Nobadeer Ave	New pergola	88/11	Ahern
20. Back East lot62 LLC 03-8114	62 Nobadeer Ave	Demo structure	88/11	WAPD
21. Back East lot62 LLC 03-8113	62 Nobadeer Ave	New main house	88/11	WAPD
22. Back East lot62 LLC 03-8116	62 Nobadeer Ave	New guest house	88/11	WAPD
23. Back East lot62 LLC 03-8118	62 Nobadeer Ave	New shed	88/11	WAPD
24. Back East lot62 LLC 03-8117	62 Nobadeer Ave	New garage	88/11	WAPD
Voting	Welch, Camp, Coombs, Patten, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl, Oliver, Thornewill			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0			
			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-(as noted)

V. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Back East lot62 LLC 03-81	62 Nobadeer Ave	Pool & hardscape	88/11	Ahern
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application. 			
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill, Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff Conditions (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye;			
			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-(as noted)

VII. OLD BUSINESS 02/14/23

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Harvey Jones 02-7951	78 Main st	Fence	42.3.1/55	Normand Residential
Voting	Welch, Camp, Coombs, Dutra, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl, Oliver, Thornewill			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Ben Normand			
Public	None			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0			
			Certificate #	HDC2023-02-7951
2. Doherty Ack LLC 08-6937	2 Mariner Way	Hardscape	55.1.4/72.4	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	Mickey Rowland/HSAG- Two car driveway is not appropriate.			
Concerns	Backus- Brick apron recommended; material to be consistent.			
	Oliver- Application missing information.			
	Camp- Concerned with fence.			
Motion	Motion to approved through staff with driveway to be all brick, running bond, curve corners @ street; 4' high boards fence (NTW) around pool equip. 5' high board fence (rather than 5 & 1) along perimeter; provide photos of landscape elements. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0// Oliver, Camp, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye			
			Certificate #	HDC2022-08-6937

3. Mike Romano 01-7815	55 Easton St	Rev 05-6245 windows	42.4.1/86	Shelter 7
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Dutra			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Jason Olbres- Shelter 7			
Public	Mickey Rowland/HSAG- Recommends all sash restored.			
Concerns	Backus- Windward Circa 1912 structure Radford Bungalow Kit House, recently approved addition. Contributing structure. Leans towards Hollis recommendations. Camp- Would like the windows to be restored in the front and sides. Coombs- Would like windows to be restored.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff triple & adjacent single to be restored; other windows okay to replicate & re-use glass to reasonable extent possible; all TDL. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0// Camp, Coombs, and Welch-aye		Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7815
4. 4 The Kids Realty 07-6708	79 Pocomo Rd	roofwalk walk rev	15/5	CWA
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence.			
Representing	Chip Webster- CWA			
Public	None			
Concerns	Thornewill- would like to see one chimney. Welch- loose skirts, not appropriate. Coombs- needs two chimneys			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revision reduce roof walk and remove skirt & natural to weather 2ft shorter from east to west. (Welch)			
Roll-Call Vote	Carried 5-0// Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, and Camp-Aye //		Certificate #	HDC2022-07-6708
5. 32 Hulbert Trust 01-7704	32 Hulbert Ave	Fenestration revisions	29/72	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli- Botticelli +Pohl			
Public	Mickey Rowland/HSAG- Design of the building, specifically the tall windows that appear out of proportion with the building; suggested the windows should be smaller to match the scale of the building and more in line with the windows on the left. The piers of the foundation only appear at the corners, suggested they should be spaced more frequently for proper structural support.			
Concerns	Backus- Infill OHD Brant Point Neighborhood; ganged windows are better than the three windows. Camp- over fenestrated; south elevation two windows not ganged less is more. Coombs- too many windows.			
Motion	Motion to through Staff West elevation to reduce dormer-fine; south option with 2 windows; and north- newest option but smaller D hung windows that match other 2nd floor windows 1 pair French doors. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Patten, and Welch-aye		Certificate #	HDC2022-01-7704

6.	1010 Wins LLC 10-7136	10 Lincoln Ave	Demo/ move of garage	30/184	Emeritus LTD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Thornewill, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern- Emeritus LTD				
Public	None				
Concerns	<p>Backus- HDC survey in file; it's a contributing Isabel Proudfit garage, 1940's or 1950's structure. If it's a partial demo application would have to be amended.</p> <p>Welch- would like to know what portion of the historic garage is proposed to be demoed; and what is proposed to be retained. Believes much better clarity on what is being retained is important. Notes the garage was originally approved to be moved on the lot with clear expectation it would be retained, not chopped up.</p> <p>Oliver- would like to know what the intending cabana was emulating.</p>				
Motion	Motion for revisions with an itemized list of what is planned to be retained and a copy of the approved cabana.				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Dutra and Welch-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7136
7.	1010 Wins LLC 10-7317	10 Lincoln Ave	New garage	30/184	Emeritus LTD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Thornewill, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern- Emeritus LTD				
Public	<p>Peter Ernst/ 11 & 13 Lincoln Ave- spoke on behalf of the neighbors at 11 and 13 Lincoln regarding the proposed new garage at 10 Lincoln, which has come before HDC for the third time. Despite revisions made based on HDC's previous comments, the proposed location of the garage remains prominently visible from Lincoln Avenue. Ernst mentioned that HDC's previous comments on January 31st suggested moving the garage to the back of the property, away from public view, but this was not addressed in the revision. The revised proposal only moved the garage by a few feet compared to the original design, which would have placed it much further away. However, Ernst appreciated HDC's efforts to ensure that proposals are appropriate for Nantucket and offered to answer any questions through the chair.</p> <p>Mickey Rowland/HSAG- the gable forward seems to be too prominent; it'd be more appropriate for the gable to be facing sideways. Hip roof would be good style to be considered. Garage doors seem out of scale; no casing, seems odd. Siding needs more variation.</p>				
Concerns	<p>Backus- Locating is better, appreciates the redesign of the garage. Gable window looks squatty, smaller 4 lite would look better.</p> <p>Oliver- appreciates the stature; suggested making the front portion eave forward keep the rest how it is having lights in the front it would read more historic.</p> <p>Camp- gable forward draws a lot of attention, eave forward would be a better suggestion; looks like its competing with the main house.</p> <p>Welch-</p>				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions move back 2' of rear corner of the jog of the main structure, add casing to garage doors & address the gable forward. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, and Welch-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7317
8.	Harold Brothers Realty, LLC 01-7685	2,4,6 Highland Ave	New dwelling 1	30/189	Emeritus LTD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Patten, Dutra				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern- Emeritus LTD				
Public	Mickey Rowland/HSAG- Length of the building is an issue, it's too large; roof walk is too wide.				
Concerns	<p>Backus- Appreciates the revised location, still a bit large, would be helpful to see a streetscape to see how it will fit in the neighborhood.</p> <p>Thornewill- house is on the large side, one story massing on the street side would be great stepping down; roof walk is too wide; the scale of the door and windows is confusing. Shrink everything by inches would make building more modest.</p> <p>Coombs- Roof walk not appropriate.</p> <p>Oliver- The style is too incongruent of a style of the neighborhood. Nix the roof walk.</p> <p>Camp- Simplify the structure, would prefer a chimney.</p> <p>Welch- Simpler structure, less linear from left to right, make one of the structure subordinate; front porch is overly formal for the neighborhood.</p>				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions, more modest length & height. Simplify front porch, remove roof walk; consider the chimney, get heights on window & door schedule. (Camp)				

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Thornewill and Welch-aye Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7685**

9. Harold Brothers Realty, LLC 01-7684	2,4,6 Highland Ave	New dwelling 2	30/189	Emeritus LTD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Patten, Dutra			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern- Emeritus LTD			
Public	Mickey Rowland/HSAG- too tall, front door should have more formality.			
Concerns	Backus- fairly large structure, gable forward ok, concerned with nano doors, no vegetation shown on lot. Thornewill- there is no hierarchy, front porch needs to come up, a lot of fenestration on the westside. Roof pitches are too steep. Coombs- Would like to see some reduction of windows on the east side. Would like to see more windows under the porch. Oliver- needs to be more subordinate to the other structure. Landscape is a huge concern. Welch- Structure needs to be simplified, concerned on what is going to be visible from Highland; more modest front porch should be addressed. The proximity of the structures, they need breathing space.			
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions & more information in landscape plan. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Thornewill and Welch-aye		Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7684

10. Tigerlily Nom Tr. 10-7289	7 Barnabas Lane	New dwelling	30/132	Studio PPark
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	James Krapp- Studio PPark			
Public	Mickey Rowland/HSAG- the detailing on the door is under detailed, it needs to be more detailed, more appropriately and more accurately, the windows on the front façade too much shingle space between the first and second floor windows, maybe raising the first-floor windows would mitigate that. North elevation mullion windows not appropriate, should be single. All windows on that gable are too separated should be pulled in closer. Shed dormers is too big, should be split into two or make smaller.			
Concerns	Backus- Infill Woodbury subdivision, 1980's - chimney doesn't look appropriate should be on the main mass not 2 nd mass. The transoms above the door on the north are not appropriate. The windows on the south would need to be reconfigured. Coombs- front door needs more detail agrees with Mickey. West elevation chimney doesn't fit in. North elevation windows should be separated. Camp- Chimneys are oddly placed, they should complement the main mass, historically situated; fair right or centered. Additive massing door seems odd, should be a window. Fenestration should be more historic. Welch- Front façade front door needs better detailed, trim package. Roof walk should be two segments eliminate the three segments. Shutters are too small left to right; they would need to be functional to cover windows. Front structure secondary mass on the sides; the ganged windows separate them. To remove height, bury the window header into the top plate. Oliver- North main mass side should be shingled.			
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0 // Coombs, Camp, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2023-10-7289

11. Tigerlily Nom Tr. 01-7689	7 Barnabas Lane	New garage	30/132	Studio PPark
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	James Krapp- Studio PPark			
Public	Mickey Rowland/HSAG- Site plan needs to be updated; garage should be pushed backed father onsite. Exterior fireplace in OHD should be eliminated. The back porch, hipped roof that extends its too long, awkward, strange shape. Dormers are too wide, too much shingle area, south elevation odd cutout on roof it's inappropriate. The pent roof does not belong should be eliminated.			

Concerns **Backus-** appreciates the reduction in scale, the garage should be relocated, pushed back. Reference “BWNIM” garages should not be forward-facing of main dwelling. Simpler, pent roof not appropriate.
Oliver- agrees with Mickey, and Holly.
Coombs- chimney is inappropriate, painted brick is not ok in the rear. Needs to be simpler.
Camp- should be pushed back, the dormers are complicating the silhouette of Barnabas, simple is better.
Welch- renderings don’t show grade. West elevation, dormers are inappropriate. Hip roof assembly is too long left to right and too tall.

Motion **Motion to hold for revisions (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Coombs, Camp, Oliver and Welch-aye Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7689**
 12. Tigerlily Nom Tr. **01-7671** 7 Barnabas Lane Hardscape & pool 30/132 Ahern
 Voting Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing N/A
 Public None
 Concerns Application not opened.
 Motion **Motion to track. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Coombs, Camp, Oliver, and Welch-aye Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7671**

13. Lions Foot **02-7909** 9 Sherburne Way Demo/ move off to Millbrook 30/37 Topham Designs
 Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver
 Alternates Dutra, Thornewill, Patten
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Joe Topham- Topham Design
 Public **Mickey Rowland/HSAG-** Discussed an elevation of a house and pointing out that it is essentially the same building that is currently on the site, with a minor change of a second floor being added to the rear wing. He mentions that there may have been repairs and new materials added, but the building is still the same as it was in 1938. Argues that the building should be preserved and not demolished, and that the Historic District Commission exists to prevent the removal of such old buildings. They also mention that Holly has outlined reasons for why the building should be kept.

Concerns
(3:08:10)

Backus- 1930's colonial revival windy side built in Sherburne Heights Subdivision considered a contributing structure. Appreciates the 3d laser scan. The structure is significant at least at the local level, losing such structure would be a shame. Structure was built during the colonial revival time frame in a seasonal summer subdivision. 1923 Sanborn map shows its clear footprint.

Welch- Believes it inappropriate for members of the public to be instructing the HDC on its mission and the application of criteria in accomplishing its mission—these are determinations of the elected officials. Cautions that public comments that can be construed to unduly or inappropriately influence the thought process or opinions of the a Commission or Commissioners are fertile grounds for an appeal and perhaps a rendering of an arbitrary and capricious decision; the result of which could lead to results contrary to public benefit . HDC is a regulatory and adjudicatory board that reviews regulations based on their own subjective measures. He emphasizes that it is solely the HDC's determination to make decisions and that the purpose of the HDC is not rightly instructed by members of the public.

Camp- Believes that Windy's side, a 100-year-old structure, is an important example of Nantucket socio-economic history and the demolition of the structure would result in an irreparable hole in the Island's architecture. She argues that the protection of historic architecture goes beyond preserving a sense of place and enters the realm of public trust. Moving the structure out of its historic context would not save it but would leave a hole in its history.

Welch- There is conversation being put forth about determining what constitutes a "significant structure" in Nantucket, particularly when it comes to preserving historical buildings. However, the process is established; the HDC is required to make upon a finding of fact, a vote on such a status, based on certain qualifications (i.e.,structure meets the qualifications for being significant, which include association with important historical persons or events, or with important broad architectural, cultural, political, economic, or social history, and other criteria). Voices a reasonable concern about the Commission making arbitrary determinations of what's significant and what isn't, and the need to articulate thoughts and have discussions based on established guidance, done in a public venue and to arrive at a consistent guidance [for applicants and their agents]. There is also a discussion about whether the structure being discussed should be preserved or not, and concerns about being consistent in decisions related to other structures from the same era, and the fact that much of the alterations are intrusive in nature. Muses about how far back do we as the HDC look back to decide appropriateness—and, if the window happens to be some number of years before the date of the construction of a particular structure, could the argument not be made that preservation of the rural character and setting [an important element of Nantucket's historic landmark designation] is more important, more significant, to preserve? Does not believe the totality of the structure rises to be labeling a significant structure; suggests a portion of the silhouette, that portion being the important and historic section, be retained. [Acknowledges Holly's comment at 3:23:53, that the structure is not considered significant including as compared to high-styled structures on Main St.] This has not been voted by the HDC to be determined a protected structure, which is the only designation required to be stayed demolition; neither have the traits of such importance as required to determine this structure significant been reached; that portion of the structure that is not historic, the bulk of it, [based on setting and other factors] actually qualifies as being intrusive [taking away from the historic (vs. current) character and setting of the area].

Coombs- Believes that the building should remain in its current location and not be moved, demolished, or relocated. She feels that it is important for the Commission to make their decision based on current circumstances and not what happened in the past. She also believes that the decision should be based on what has been studied and learned.

Motion **Motion to retain the historic elements as shown in the demolition plan, subject to a site plan review and approval of its [re]location on the property. (Welch)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-1 // Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye; Camp-opposed Certificate # **HDC2023-02-7909**

14. Marty McGowan	01-7822	25 Millbrook Rd	move on from 9 Sherburne	56/67.2	Topham Designs
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Joe Topham- Topham Design				
Public	None				
Concerns	No concerns.				

Motion **Motion to Revise it [the application] to indicate keeping it [the structure] on 9 Sherburne and presenting the plan referenced in the prior motion.. (Welch)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-1 // Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye; Camp-opposed Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7822**

VIII. NEW BUSINESS 02/21/23

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	3 Step Lane LLC	3 Step Lane	Door & window chng rev 01-7678	42.4.2/44	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Patten, Thornewill, Welch				
Recused	None				

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Ethan McMorrow- EMDA
 Douglas Kaffelz- Union Studio Architect
 Public None
 Concerns No concerns.
 Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Dutra, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye; Certificate # **HDC2023-**

2. Michael Kane 38 Vestal St Alterations to Main house 41/50 Val Oliver
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Patten, Thornewill
 Alternates Welch, Dutra
 Recused Oliver
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Val Oliver
 Public None
 Concerns Backus- Circa 1981 Nantucket contributing structure, should have a chimney.
 Motion **Motion to Approve through Staff with kick panels on the north French doors. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0 // Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye; Camp-Abstained Certificate # **HDC2023-**

3. Greg Ferguson 50 Hulbert Ave Add window revision 29/62 Normand Residential
 Voting Pohl, Welch, Patten, Coombs, Oliver
 Alternates Camp, Dutra, Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Ben Normand-Normand Residential
 Public HSAG- Window is quirky, but ok with it.
 Concerns **Backus-** Odd location for an awning window.
 Motion **Motion to Approve to approved with window being fixed not awning 6 light. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Patten, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye; Certificate # **HDC2023-**

4. Stilson 27 LLC 2a Copper Lane Windows, new porch 42.3.3/191 Normand Residential
 Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Dutra, Thornewill
 Alternates Patten, Oliver, Camp
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Ben Normand- Normand Residential
 Public **Mickey Rowland/HSAG-** west elevation is a bit awkward.
 Concerns **Backus-** Infill structure within the OHD circa 2005, TDL's are more appropriate.
 Motion **Motion to Approve through Staff leave the windows on front façade just the way they are and keep the 1st floor windows on the side and SDL's approved as LePage. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Dutra, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye. Certificate # **HDC2023-**

5. Bob Constable 3 Barrett Farm Rd New garage 40/80.1 Thornewill Design
 Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten
 Alternates Dutra
 Recused Thornewill
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Carrie Thornewill
 Public None
 Concerns No concerns.
 Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Dutra, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2023-**

6. Mark Hubbard 45 Milk St New studio 56/20 Mark Hubbard
 Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates Patten, Dutra
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Mark Hubbard

Public Concerns N/A
Backus- Structure not clear on site, very vertical, 3rd dwelling should be subordinate. Ganged four light windows are odd, they should be a 6/6 double hung. Application indicates a grade change a cross section should be submitted for commissions review.
Oliver- Appreciates the simplicity, height is not clear. Mitigate by bringing down maybe add dormer?
Welch- Shorter 1st floor, primary concern is height.
 Coombs-
Thornewill- concern on height, retaining wall might be needed, a section through would be helpful. Incorporate some porch roof deck to mitigate height on one side.
Pohl- looking a topo plan, some implied grade change, and height is a concern.
 Motion **Motion to hold for revisions, covered porch and a cross section of the site from north to south. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Coombs, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2023-**

7. Barbara Charder Trust **03-8126** 121 Orange st Emergency Demo dwelling 55/389 Michael Wilson, ESQ.
 Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra
 Alternates Patten, Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Linda Williams
 Public None
 Concerns **Backus-** Circa 1850's One- and three-quarter story with high brick basement ridge chimney four bay façade with a pilaster doorway with two or one window or even six/six. Conditions of the inside of dwelling are horrible according to other departments, it would be a shame to lose but would like for any future development to replicate this structure.
Welch- This is a demolition by neglect, this structure has been rotting for the last 15 years. Poses various questions to applicant's agent with respect to court involvement and the court order, site and structure conditions, etc.
 Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted due to nature of court order. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Dutra, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye. Certificate # **HDC2023-03-8126**
 8. Barbara Charder Trust **03-8125** 121 Orange st Emergency Demo barn/garage 55/389 Michael Wilson, ESQ.
 Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra
 Alternates Patten, Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Linda Williams
 Public None
 Concerns No concerns.
 Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted due to nature of court order. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0 // Dutra, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye. Certificate # **HDC2023-03-8125**
 Rest held for next meeting-

9. Stark Point LLC	16 Easton St	fenestration Rev22-04-6121	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
10. 4 Bailey Rd LLC	4 Bailey Rd	Add egress window & door	55/106.6	Sanne Payne
11. 5 Surfside LLC	5 Surfside Rd	Revise window well	55/253	LINK
12. Kimberly Walin	56 Eel point rd.	Fenestration revision	32/27	CWA

IX. OLD BUSINESS 03/07/23

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Salisbury Cottage LLC 01-7737	13 Academy Ln	House renovations	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
2. Salisbury Cottage LLC 01-7734	13 Academy Ln	New shed	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
3. Nicole Tirapelli 01-7714	18 Center St- Sconset	Driveway	73.1.6/105	Nicole Tirapelli
4. Cynthia Nelson 01-7808	30 King St Sconset	New studio	73.42/113	Gryphon Architects
5. *Bob Risika 01-7714	18 Maclean Lane	Pool & hardscape	55/448	Atlantic Landscape
6. 8 Maple Lane LLC 01-7795	Maple Lane Lot 8	New dwelling	67/303	Emeritus LTD
7. 8 Maple Lane LLC 01-7799	Maple Lane Lot 8	Garage	67/303	Emeritus LTD
8. Dave Yeager 01-7886	2 Howard Ct	Addition	42.3.4/36	Brook Meerbergen

X. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	January 3, & 10, 2023 & March 7, & 16 2023
Motion	Motion to approve by Welch.
Vote	Carried unanimously
Review Minutes	February 23, & March 9, 14, 21 2023

Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Next HDC Meeting- March 30th at 1pm *HYBRID & IN-PERSON @ 2 FAIRGROUNDS RD. - CONFERENCE RM.• Classification of street trees & vegetating mapping• Discussion of Wind Turbines• Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed)• Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings• Hardscaping• Discussion of salvaging demolitions• Discussion of options for house moves
----------------	---

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 8:40pm. (Oliver)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Submitted by:

Esmeralda Martinez

YouTube link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PSpNxNGyoD8>

Nantucket Old Historic District

Sconset Old Historic District

Madaket Old Village

