



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,  
**Associate Commissioners:** Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

**Thursday, January 14, 2021**

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,  
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 5:23 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker  
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill  
Absent Members: Dutra  
Late Arrivals: None  
Early Departures: Camp, 6:07 p.m.; Welch, in and out due to technical issues

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

Motion **Motion to Approve the agenda. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

## I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

## II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	James Cabral 01-2661	19 Clarendon Street	48sf addition	76.1.3/100	Linda Williams
2.	Charles Flanagan 01-2648	91 Goldfinch Drive	Front door color change	68/579	Self
3.	Martin McDonough 01-2660	14 Swayzes Drive	Fenestration revisions	66/159	Permits Plus
4.	4 Ahab Rd, LLC 12-2619	41 Wauwinet Road	Move off/demo	20/7	Thornewill Design
5.	Arrowhead Archaeology 01-2655	13 Arrowhead Drive	Metal roof	69/10.3&10.4	M Cutone Architecture
6.	Ruth Klinck 01-2654	301 Madaket Road	Rev. 2414: fenestration	60.2.1/55	NAG
7.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC 01-2653	5 Grey Lady Lane	Rev. 2564: reverse plan	66/712	Val Oliver
8.	Maury Rugged, LLC 01-2652	18 Bayberry Lane	144 sf addition	67/67	Val Oliver
9.	Amy Ambrecht 01-2666	13 Ginky Lane	Rev. 71358: drmr	41/850	Robert Newman

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp

Alternates None

Recused Oliver, Thornewill

Documentation Site plans, photos, historical information, and advisory comments.

Representing Carrie Thornewill, Thornewill Design

Public None

Concerns **Coombs** – Asked about the move-off/demo at 41 Wauwinet Road. She is satisfied with the explanation.

**Thornewill** – Built in 1970. Moving it would be very difficult.

**Backus** – National Historic Landmarks (NHL) data confirms this is circa 1970.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Certificate # **HDC2021-01-(as noted)**

**III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS**

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. 59 Bartlett Road, LLC <b>01-2663</b>	59 Bartlett Road	Driveway/ramp	66/99.1	Linda Williams
• Due to minimal visibility				
2. Sig Heller <b>01-2658</b>	17 Margaret's Way	Rev 44884; pool autocvr	20/65	Linda Williams
• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity				
3. Joseph Kelly <b>01-2657</b>	4 Hollister Road	Shed	92.4/275	Linda Williams
• Due to lack of visibility				
4. Paula Barth <b>01-2659</b>	18 Gardner Street	Expd deck 53sf/dr chg	42.3.4/81	Chuck Lenhart/SCI
• Due to lack of visibility				
5. John Manera <b>01-2656</b>	5 Bartlett Road (portion)	New dwelling	55/102.3	Linda Williams
• Remove capitals and plinths and keep railing/balusters				
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	No additional concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-01-(as noted)</b>

**IV. NEW BUSINESS**

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Charles Schwarzapfel <b>10-2033</b>	9 Maine Avenue	Pool	60.3.1/425	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Steve Theroux, Nantucket Architectural Group			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:34)	<p><b>Theroux</b> – Presented project; stated comments by the abutters are not within HDC purview; 36” retaining wall was excluded; abutter on Rhode Island Avenue has a 4-foot vegetated berm. The MAB is made up of 5 Madaket residents who don’t want a pool and feels it makes no sense for this to go back to them. Asked for a denial.</p> <p>Discussing where this lot is located and possible exposure to abutting roads.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – Read MAB comments; not in favor of the pool in this location; viewing is critical to any approval of a pool in this location; once across Millie’s Bridge, this area is very different from the rest of Madaket; need to know where equipment is going. Eel Skin is circa 1868. Read letters of concern from abutters: not in context with the neighborhood whatsoever; any new plantings would create an unnatural landscape; would be within viewshed; no protection for vegetative screening on this coastal plain; berming is completely inappropriate in this flat landscape.</p> <p><b>Flynn</b> – Mr. Theroux issued plans based upon MAB comments; MAB has not seen those revisions. There is another letter from Peter Holmes. During the MAB meeting, Ms. Williams reiterated HDC’s purview is from a publicly travelled way.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Asked if this has gone to ConCom (outside their jurisdiction). HDC is concerned about keeping an area conducive to what has been there. To allow a pool to go in where it cannot be adequately screened is irresponsible. This is not a project that fulfills our mission.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Agrees with Ms. Coombs; this is the same as pools in Cisco. It will affect the aesthetic and quality of the environment. This is a beach seascape with informality, which is what draws people there. It will not blend in and be intrusive to the landscape or this historic structure. If we deny this, they will appeal to the Select Board.</p> <p><b>McLaughlin</b> – He doesn’t think there should be any problem.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – She drove out there today. This is the most relaxed, laid-back area of the Island and really just a dune. This is different from anyplace on the Island. Allowing a pool there would take away from its character.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – His thoughts are similar to what’s been said. Clearly there is a lot of shifting sand and landscape. It is hugely important to keep it informal. He thinks the revisions should go back to MAB. It would be foolish to issue a denial on the first hearing; we should ask for revisions.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions and to go back to MAB. (Camp)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

2.	Frederick Hahn <b>12-2618</b>	50 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	32/25.1	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and <i>Building with Nantucket in Mind</i>				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:05)	<p><b>McMorrow</b> – Presented project; grey trim.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Wants to view with height poles. This is appropriate; having a view with height poles will be helpful.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – He'd like to see a set of cross sections of the site with neighboring structures superimposed.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – She'd like the height brought down. The roof walk with a skirt is overpowering; the skirt should be removed.</p> <p><b>McLaughlin</b> – North elevation, the gable over the door should be 7/12 pitch. West elevation, the small gable to the right should also be 7/12; the left deck facing north should be squared off like the rest.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – He'd like to see the 5/12 “roofettes” to have steeper pitches. He too wants to view with height poles.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to View with height poles at either end of the main gable, hold for revisions, and a cross section of the topography. (Coombs)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #		
3.	Karli Hagedorn <b>12-2615</b>	34 West Chester Street	Garage – chimney & roof	41/31	Normand Residential
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ben Normand, Residential Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:19)	<p><b>Normand</b> – Presented project, circa mid-1940s.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – Read HSAB comments: no quorum no issue with the roof, but not like the removal due to utilitarian use of structure. Not as significant as the Richard Gardner home.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as drafted. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate # <b>HDC2020-12-2615</b>		
4.	22 BLVD <b>12-2614</b>	22 Boulevarde	Rev.09-1780: rnv drrms	80/327	Normand Residential
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ben Normand, Residential Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:25)	<p><b>Normand</b> – Presented project.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate # <b>HDC2020-12-2614</b>		
5.	Leanne Baker <b>12-2617</b>	38 Monohansett Road	Move on & minor mods	79/60	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:28)	<p><b>Meerbergen</b> – Presented project; skylights are existing.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate # <b>HDC2020-12-2617</b>		

6.	Candice Heydt Trust <b>12-2626</b>	20 Brant Point Road	Stairs to roof walk	29/153	Val Oliver Design
7.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC <b>12-2627</b>	3 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/713	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:33)	<b>Oliver</b> – Asked to hold. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold at applicant's request. (Coombs)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
8.	William Buckland <b>12-2631</b>	113 Hummock Pond Rd	As-built patio&pergola	56/59	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:34)	<b>Flynn</b> – This came in as an as-built. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
9.	Barnett-Clearly Family <b>12-2634</b>	1 Morgan Square	As-built demo dwelling	87/33	Bessey Construction
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.				
Representing	Lori Geddes, J.D. Bessey Construction.				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:36)	<b>Flynn</b> – They demolished the house without a permit; they did not pay the fine. It was approved as an addition. <b>Geddes</b> – Explained what led to the demolition; she was told not to pay until the HDC decides what the fee is. <b>Backus</b> – Circa 1988. Read Mr. Welch's comments into the record. <b>Pohl</b> – If he understands this all correctly – had a similar case recently – everything will be rebuilt as it was approved as a renovation and addition. This is not an old building: concrete foundation and plywood deck. <b>Thornewill</b> – The building that existed would most likely been approved for a demolition. J.D. Bessey now knows you should stop and seek the demo permits before proceeding. It isn't a big deal with this building, but it could have been. <b>Coombs</b> – Mr. Bessey, as an Islander, had to have known he should have applied for the demolition. Thinks the as-built fine for demolition should be increased. Doesn't agree with the reasonings for the demolition. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Asked what will be replacing it.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve with payment of the as-built fine. (McLaughlin)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-12-2634</b>
10.	Barnett-Clearly Family <b>12-2635</b>	1 Morgan Square	New dwelling	87/33	Bessey Construction
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Lori Geddes, J.D. Bessey Construction.				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:36)	<b>Geddes</b> – Will build as approved. No concerns.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (McLaughlin)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-12-2635</b>

**VII. OTHER BUSINESS**

Approved Minutes	December 29 & 31, 2020 (no action at this time.)
Review Minutes	January 4, 7, & 8, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• HDC Meeting, Old Business: <b>Tuesday 1/19/21 at 4:30 p.m.</b></li> <li>• Coastal Resiliency Plan meeting: <b>Friday 1/16/ 21 at 1:00 p.m.</b></li> <li>• HDC review of revisions to HDC Background Summary to finalize for web page including vote</li> <li>• Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda</li> <li>• Discussion of 6 Fair Street Minimum Maintenance</li> <li>• Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings</li> </ul>
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed.

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 6:58 p.m. (McLaughlin)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board