

1122
NANTUCKET
TOWN CLERK

2021 JAN 26 PM 2:27



Historic District Commission

Madaket Advisory Board

Members: Linda Williams (Chair), Tom Erichsen, Brad Fleming, Robert Kucharavy, Bruce Mandel

Alternate: Mark Palmer

MINUTES

Monday January 04, 2021

This meeting was held via remote participation (using ZOOM recording feature) Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding the Open Meeting Law.

I. Procedural Business

Call to order. This meeting was conducted via Zoom and called to order by Linda Williams at 10:00 am. This meeting was recorded on Zoom video.

Attending members: Linda Williams, Robert Kucharavy, Brad Fleming, Tom Erichsen and
Bruce Mandel

Absent members: Mark Palmer

Late arrivals: None

Early Departures: None

Motion to Adopt Agenda made by Robert Kucharavy; Seconded by Tom Erichsen.

Roll Call Vote: carried unanimously 5-0// Fleming, Mandel, Erichsen, Kucharavy and Williams- aye

Approval of Minutes: November 21, 2020

Motion: N/A

II. Public Comment

None

III. New Business – See attached Comment

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Chris Schwarzapfel 10-2033	9 Maine Avenue	Pool	60.3.1/425	NAG

IV. Other Business

N/A

V. Adjournment

Motion to Adjourn made by Kucharavy; Seconded by Erichsen at 10:50 am.

Roll Call Vote: carried unanimously 5-0/ Fleming, Mandel, Erichsen, Kucharavy and Williams- aye

Submitted by Cathy Flynn

Date/Time 1/04/2021

MULTIPLE CONCERNS RK/TE

To: Historic District Commission
From: Madaket Advisory Board

BRUCE MANDEL RECUSED

NOT IN FAVOR OF A POOL IN THIS LOCATION

Members Present

(X) Linda Williams- Chair (X) Brad Fleming (X) Tom Erichsen (RECUSED) Bruce Mandel (X) Robert Kucharavy

Alternate: () Mark Palmer ABSENT

Applicant CHARLES SCHWARZAPFEL Address 9 MAINE AVENUE

Historic information/known history Eel Skin was moved to this site to avoid erosion

() Non-Contributing () Contributing () Individually significant

Comments

() Incomplete application () Historical information needed (X) CONCERNS () Recommend View

CONCERNS: MAB FEELS A VIEWING BY THE HDC IS CRITICAL PRIOR TO ANY APPROVAL – IT HAS TO BE SAID THAT ONCE YOUR CROSS MILLIE’S BRIDGE, THE ENVIRONMENT, STRUCTURES, SETTINGS, LANDSCAPE ARE TOTALLY DIFFERENT FROM MADAKET PROPER.

- ***There is no specific planting plan submitted with the application as should be nor is the location of the pool equipment shown on the plan on submission of the application, generally required by the HDC. This application should be held for complete planting details and location of the pool equipment and how that is supposed to be screened. The HDC should not have to come up with where equipment goes or what type of plantings should screen it. The applicant needs to provide that and a view from the street of proposed plan upon submission and not leave it up to the HDC to design it for them.**
- **Inappropriate location for a pool in important area of Madaket next to Eel Skin, one of the few remaining original structures on Smith’s Point other than (the area past the bridge). This is a sensitive area, with older structures and unique landscape. Of the 50 units on Smith’s Point, Fred Rogers and Eel Skin as the oldest historic/contributing structures and having a modern convenience such as a pool next to Eel Skin would not be appropriate.**

- **It would be the only pool past the bridge in a wide-open outwash landscape, which is different than the area of Madaket on the other side of the bridge. Not in context with the neighborhood whatsoever. Screening would draw attention to the pool.**
- **Groundcover in that area is naturally low and indigenous close to the beach (beach grass and other rough vegetation), less than 2-3 feet in general, any new plantings would create an unnatural landscape barrier and draw the eye to it, particularly as it would be located right along Maine as the pool is close to Maine. It would also be in the view shed from other areas of Smith's Point towards the Ocean being proximate to the beach.**
- **In all likelihood nonindigenous and higher plants would not survive. There are a very few that have tried to create a more formal landscape scheme done by professional landscapers on Maine, and all have for the most part died. Any of the other few hedges on the Point are farther away from the beach, not directly impacted by ocean spray or protected by old cedar trees or other structures. Due to the location of this lot close to the coastal bank there is no such protection for any new plantings in a sandy soil. Should the nonindigenous plantings that provide screening die there would be no screening for the pool. In any event, any required natural screening would have to be indigenous and would likely be only 2-3 feet high and ultimately would not provide any sight protection from Maine Avenue.**
- **Berming to hide the pool and elevate plantings is completely inappropriate. There are no created berms on the Point. The landscape is flat and this lot is flat.**
- **A curved 36" rock retaining wall with cap to hold back the berm from Maine is close to Maine, is totally inappropriate and out of character with the neighborhood. No other walls appear on Smith's Point.**
- **In other areas of Madaket, the HDC has in the past considered what actions have to take place in order to screen a pool. Excessive screening/fencing creates an unnatural barrier and actually brings attention to the pool. In this open landscape it would certainly be out of place.**
- **Will need ZBA approval. Many of the objections expressed by members and the public in person at the MAB meeting and by letter, are not within the purview of the HDC and better left to be expressed at the ZBA meeting.**
- **Landscape disturbance will be extreme to install the pool and would likely erase what groundcover is there presently.**
- **There is no topo map, height of the berm, the schematic from Maine to show the berm, plantings as viewed from the road.**

A letter from Pat Catchpole - 8 Maine Avenue, directly across the street – read into the record mentioned the quiet nature of the area, noise from pool is inappropriate, erosion, fragileness of the area, lights from a pool in a very dark skies positive area, steps from pristine beach, how are children protected from attractive nuisance, no pool fence, a fence would also be inappropriate. Area has remained relatively unchanged.

Bonnie and Bob Havery - 6 Maine 48 years, others have put in tall formal plantings all have died, some hedges on the Point on Rhode Island and Mass. Ave have distance from ocean and protected by some older cedars and houses, this is wide open so plantings here will not survive. Read letter into record. In ground pool completely out of character in the area, danger unfenced,

dangerous precedent. When visit site you can see the remnants of plantings that have died off and were done by professional landscapers and all died. Area by pool is still exposed to ocean.

Steve Murphy - 5 Rhode Island – 40 years, three winters ago water had encroached onto the lot, out of character with area, this is not like the rest of Madaket on the other side of the bridge, no security fence, old Eel skin house rented by multiple children. When HDC makes visit look at the limited growth above 2/3 feet and what it is and where it is. What is there is inadequate to cover the pool as close pool is to Maine Ave.