



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, October 28, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Interim HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez;
PLUS Administrative Assistant; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill
Absent Members: Dutra
Late Arrivals: Welch, 1:10; McLaughlin, 1:17 pm; Coombs, 1:32 pm
Early Departures: Coombs, 1:43 (technical problems); Welch, 1:57 (technical problems)

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Oliver)**

Roll-call vote Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

II. CONSENT

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Dana Jungherr 10-4917	1 Sparrow Drive	Mini-split heatpump condenser	68/528	SSCC
2. Charles Ernst 10-4868	166 Cliff Road	Garage reshingle	41/69	Peter Fernandes
3. Fisher's Landing Assoc. 09-4793	8 Warrens Landing Road	Move on shed	38/92	Seth Gottlieb
4. Tom Etheridge 10-4825	16 Lyons Lane	Cabana	76/15	Atlantic Landscaping
5. 50 Brewster Road, LLC 10-4832	50 Brewster Road	Revisions	43/96	EMDA
6. Dworetzky-Banse Fam 10-4816	8 Shawkemo Road	MH revs	43/90	Botticelli + Pohl
7. Dworetzky-Banse Fam 10-4854	8 Shawkemo Road	Rec barn revs – add window	43/90	Botticelli + Pohl
8. David Prill 10-4820	82 Pocomo Road	Add kneewall to rear porch	15/35	Botticelli + Pohl

Voting Camp (acting chair), Oliver, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused Pohl

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 3-0//Thornewill, Oliver, and Camp-aye

Certificate # **HDC2021-(as noted)**

III. NEW BUSINESS 10/12/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Goldsmith 09-4778	1 White Street	New dwelling	79/29	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:07)	<p>Oliver – Presented project; lot is 400’ deep with about 200’ between structures, so they won’t be seen together; height is 27’7”; white trim & windows and Hamilton blue front door.</p> <p>Thornewill – South and north elevations, a higher pitch on the main gable forward would create hierarchy. South elevation, the 4 2nd-floor windows on the gable is a bit much; should reduce to 3 windows.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill. Would prefer the shower and front door switch places.</p> <p>Pohl – Increase the pitch of the south elevation gable to 9/12 and 3 rather than 4 windows on the 2nd floor .</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south elevation 2nd-floor windows reduced to 3 and the gable pitch increased to 9/12 and as much vegetation as possible retained. (Thornewill)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Camp, Thornewill, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4778
2.	Carol Surface 10-4824	47 Warren’ Landing	Rev. COA – MH	38/54	BPC
3.	Okay Okay House 10-4821	10 Union Street	Parking & patio	42.3.1/43	BPC
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:15)	McCarthy – Doesn’t see Mr. Paul in the queue. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold 2&3 for representation. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4821
4.	US Reif Marine 10-4852	134 Orange Street	New 2 nd floor addition	55/49	Anton Dimov
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Anton Dimov				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:17)	<p>Dimov – Presented project; Marine Home Center; color to match existing; willing to make double windows.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1930-40 commercial contributing structure; the fenestration should match the existing gable being imitated.</p> <p>Oliver – Her only concern is the height; the maximum height in mid-Island is 30’ to grade and this is 31’ to grade; that might require zoning relief.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees about the double windows; this is a warehouse and looks like it.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with what’s been said. The proportions of the existing double windows are atypical but introducing a new set of windows would not be appropriate. Asked if the building to the left with a chimney is part of the property (yes).</p> <p>Camp – Likes that the 1st-floor fenestration is remaining; however, duplicating a not-so-great design isn’t a good idea. She’d prefer something resembling a more typical store front on Orange Street.</p> <p>Pohl – Confirmed there is a building that would screen any view of the east elevation. He agrees with the consensus.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the windows to match windows on existing gable. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Thornewill, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye; Camp-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4852

5.	50 Brewster Road, LLC 09-4762	50 Brewster Road	New garage	43/96	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:33)	<p>McMorrow – Presented project; height is 22'; details match the main house; garage doors are cedar natural to weather.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Confirmed the south-elevation deck does not extend more than 8' from the wall. South elevation, the triple casements should be two double-hung windows.</p> <p>Thornewill – The south elevation garage door configuration extending through the broken back is odd.</p> <p>Camp, Coombs, and Pohl – No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4762
6.	12 Derrymore R.T. 09-4753	12 Derrymore Lane	Garage	41/241	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:43)	<p>McMorrow – Presented project; height 22'; white trim, sash, and pedestrian door with the garage door natural to weather.</p> <p>Welch – This is appropriate.</p> <p>Camp – The garage door crosses the broke back; suggested switching the pedestrian and garage doors.</p> <p>Oliver – Nothing to add.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comment.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation wood-panel and garage doors swapped. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Welch, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4753
7.	Dexter Group, LLC 10-4835	8 Winn Street	New dwelling	41/51.2	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:47)	<p>McMorrow – Presented project; height is 24'; Nantucket grey trim, cedar roof, black sash, and Hamilton-blue door.</p> <p>McLaughlin – South elevation, the 6 doors aren't appropriate.</p> <p>Camp – The roofline should be simplified: south elevation the 2 gables on top of each other could be under 1 roof; east elevation has 4 overlapping gable roofs and 2 very close corner boards.</p> <p>Oliver – This is successful; the north and west will be visible. She's concerned that filling in the hole will make this tower over abutting structures.</p> <p>Thornewill – Great looking. The in-fill is brilliant.</p> <p>Pohl – Additions telescope back into the lot with good additive massing. This is a good building.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4835
8.	James Bessey 10-4832	12 Correia Lane (lot 2)	New pool and spa	80/59 (prtn)	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Thornewill (Welch having mic problems.)				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:57)	<p>Meerbergen – Presented project; auto cover doesn't require a fence.</p> <p>Oliver – Given what's on the lot, this won't be visible. Asked why the fence is only in the front.</p> <p>Camp – Generally okay. Would like shrubbery in front of the fence and approved with the caveat.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Doesn't think it is visible.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the vegetation to be maintained and pool not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4832

9. James Bessey	10-4831	12 Correia Lane (lot 2)	New pavilion	80/59 (prtn)	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:02)	<p>Meerbergen – Presented project; he'd be willing to lose the gable windows and have a half wall on three sides.</p> <p>Oliver – Appreciates it's at the back with the fence. She has problems with a gable window over nothing. Suggested filling in with half walls to ground it.</p> <p>Camp – From the street, you'd see the tops of the columns and the windows; suggested making the north elevation a shingled wall and leaving the rest opened; thinks a half wall wouldn't be visible.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North elevation, the gable window is out of character without a 1st-floor wall.</p> <p>Pohl – The columns feel long and "stringy;" suggested filling in between the outside columns of the north elevation to give the structure more substance.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the corners filled in between the columns on the north, east, and south elevations, per Mr. Meerbergen's concept. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4831	
10. James Bessey	10-4833	12 Correia Lane (lot 2)	New sports court	80/59 (prtn)	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:12)	<p>Meerbergen – Presented project.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4833	
11. Isaiah Truyman	10-4826	117 Orange Street	Hardscape	55/377	Atlantic Landscaping
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:13)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for rep. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #		
12. Patrick Bailey	10-4851	3 Doc Ryder Drive	Addition + fenestration	66/210	JB Studio
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Juraj Bencat, JB Studio				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:14)	<p>Bencat – Presented project.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North elevation, the roof walk is inappropriate for a 1.5 story house and this design.</p> <p>Camp – The addition is fine. The roof walk isn't appropriate. Sorry to see the chimney go.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with Ms. Camp. The additive massing is in keeping with the area; the roof walk is out of place.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees. North elevation, a 6-light, cottage-style, front door would be better.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the front door to be a 6-light and elimination of the roof walk. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-10-4851	

Rest held for Tuesday, November 2

Proposed HDC Minutes for October 28, 2021

13.	23 Broad Owner, LLC 10-4843	23 Broad Street	Addition + fenestration	42.4.2/77	Emeritus
14.	John Barry 10-4844	22 Eel Point Road	Add dormer + stairs	40/45	Emeritus
15.	Nan. Invest. Holdings 10-4845	22 Pocomo Road	New guest house	14/73.1	Emeritus
16.	Nan. Invest. Holdings 10-4842	22 Pocomo Road	New garage	14/73.1	Emeritus
17.	Dex Dog, LLC 10-4842	6B Arrowhead Drive	Addition	69/58.1	Emeritus
18.	Karen Urban 10-4848	33 Main Street 'Sconset	Pool house	73.4.2/34	Emeritus
19.	Hoehn-Saric 10-4865	34 Easton Street	New house	41.1.4/18	CWA
20.	Tack3, LLC 10-4865	26 Washington Street	Rev. COA	42.3.2/23	CWA
21.	Robert Meyer 10-4866	307 Polpis Road	New dwelling	25/39	CWA
22.	Mueller Nant. Assoc. 10-4858	11 North Mill Street	Rev. COA	55.4.4/77	CWA
23.	12 Somerset Lane, LLC	12 Somerset Lane	Rev. COA	56/55	Linda Williams
24.	Norris Bldg Co.	14R Lowell Place	Shed	41/164.1	Linda Williams
25.	Deb Cote	23 Prospect Street	Hardscape – driveway/wall	55.4.4/90	Linda Williams
26.	Deb Cote	23 Prospect Street	Rev. COA – found coat	55.4.4/90	Linda Williams

IV. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Pamela Perun 08-4492	4 Roberts Lane	Rooftop solar	56/34	Sunwind LLC
2.	Conlon James Trust 08-4475	24 Woodbine Avenue	Rev. 1511: add rfwlk, fenst	80/96	Emeritus
3.	Trogoh Nominee Trust 05-3640	26 Easy Street	Mixed use structure	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
4.	30 Vestal, LLC 09-4611	30 Vestal Street	MH fenest, dormer alt	41/45	Studio Ppark
5.	27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4595	27 Fair Street	Front bldg. – historic reno	42.3.2/192	Workshop APD
6.	27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4594	27 Fair Street	Back bldg. – historic reno	42.3.2/192	Workshop APD
7.	27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4597	27 Fair Street	Back bldg. – historic reno	42.3.2/192	Workshop APD
8.	Candice Macoul	72 Orange Street	Renovation	55.4.1/21	CWA

V. NEW BUSINESS 10/26/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Barry Lyden	4 West Miacomet Road	Move/demo garage	81/160	Gryphon Architects
2.	Barry Lyden 10-4877	4 West Miacomet Road	New garage, cabana	81/160	Gryphon Architects
3.	Susan Doughan 10-4878	63 Orange Street	Rev. 48565: clr chg/ rf/ side	55.4.1/16	Gryphon Architects
4.	Franze Residence 10-4873	71 Orange Street	Hardscape	55.4.1/167	Edgewater
5.	Juan Hernandez 10-4879	328 Madaket Road	Deck Addition	60/103	Self
6.	Cheryl Gilbert Et al 10-4881	16 D Street	Revisions	60.2.1/2	EMDA
7.	Robert Rothbard 10-4880	3 Brooks Farm Road	Revisions	41/222.7	CWA
8.	Alexa Watts 10-4987	33 Vesper Lane	Addition	55/126	Topham Design
9.	Padir Halil 10-4901	69½ Cliff Road	Revise roofwalk and railing	30/204	Topham Design
10.	4 Lowell NT 10-4903	4 Lowell Place	Fenestration revisions	41/168	Topham Design
11.	John Donoghue 10-4888	10 Holly Street	New studio	80/23	Thornewill Design
12.	Robin Halik 10-4876	46A Surfside Road	Fix as-built vent violation	67/120.3	Thornewill Design
13.	Robert Hockaday 10-4911	3 New Street, Sias	Rev. 2401 window replace	73.1.3/37	Thornewill Design
14.	11 India St, LLC 10-4897	29 Center Street	Move existing shed	42.3.1/122.2	Ahern
15.	11 India St, LLC 10-4896	4 Chestnut Street	Hardscape revision	42.3.1/68	Ahern
16.	11 India St, LLC 10-4895	16 South Federal Street	Hardscape/gate	42.3.1/70	Ahern
17.	Craig Majernik 10-4893	63 Burnell Street	Pool and hardscape	49.3.2/1.1	Ahern
18.	45 Shawkemo Rd, LLC 10-4894	45 Shawkemo Road	Pool and hardscape	27/18	Ahern
19.	Joan Albaugh 10-4892	73 Miacomet Road	Addition	66/62	Brook Meerbergen
20.	Maria Mitchell Assoc. 10-4890	59 Milk Street Ext.	Move existing sign	56/209	Jascin Finger
21.	Tom Etheridge 10-4905	16 Lyons Lane	Hardscape	76/15	Atlantic Landscaping
22.	ACK-Livin NT 10-4904	2 Hedgebury Lane	Pool	41/593	Atlantic Landscaping
23.	Tiffany Lawrence 10-4906	5 Todd Circle	Pool	66/296	Atlantic Landscaping
24.	Wesley Delcol 10-4931	10R Golfview Drive	Rev. COA: change porch	66/191	Atlantic Landscaping
25.	Wayne Berman 10-4902	98 Tom Nevers Road	Fenestration revisions	91/40	NAG
26.	Paul Picarillo 10-4907	6 Baltimore Street	Shed	60/106	Val Oliver Design
27.	Scott Sampson 10-4908	14 Aurora Way	Rev. 4375: ridge, windows	56/445	Val Oliver Design
28.	MCB Revocable Trust 10-4909	1 Falmouth Avenue	Rev. 3320:	82/411	Val Oliver Design
29.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC 10-4936	10 Grey Lady Lane	Add hip to front porch	66/705	Val Oliver Design
30.	Drake Real Estate 10-4941	2 Horn Beam Road	Pool house	21/118.5	Val Oliver Design
31.	Robert King 10-4910	16 Wood Hollow	Fence	72/10	Self
32.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 10-4912	5 Sherburne Way	Rev. 4356: MH	30/38	Botticelli + Pohl
33.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 10-4913	5 Sherburne Way	Rev. 4263: GH	30/38	Botticelli + Pohl
34.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 10-4914	5 Sherburne Way	New pool and spa	30/38	Botticelli + Pohl
35.	Colby Crenshaw 10-4924	24 Almanac Pond Road	Pool, spa, hardscape	25/37	Jardins Intl.
36.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4919	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo cottage	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
37.	265 Madaket, LLC 10-4920	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo studio	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen

Proposed HDC Minutes for October 28, 2021

38. 265 Madaket, LLC 10-4921	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo workshop	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
39. 265 Madaket, LLC 10-4922	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo greenhouse	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
40. 265 Madaket, LLC 10-4923	265 Madaket Road	Move/demo shed	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
41. 265 Madaket, LLC 10-4918	265 Madaket Road	Deck/fenestration/color	59.4/319	Brook Meerbergen
42. Ed Mahoney 10-4926	1 Lilac Court	New dwelling	68/359	KOH
43. Ed Mahoney 10-4925	4 Lilac Court	New dwelling	68/365	KOH
44. Richmond Great Pt. 10-4942	2 Honey Suckle Drive	New dwelling	68/668	KOH
45. Richmond Great Pt. 10-4943	1 Aster Court	New dwelling	68/668	KOH
46. Barry Ang 10-4929	11 Jonathan Way	Rev. COA – add cupola	75/42	McMullen + AssocN
47. Mark Crosbby 10-4930	73 Goldfinch Drive	Revisions	65/570	BPC
48. George Wing	6 Swain Street	Add gabled drmr over porch	42.4.1/82.2	Self
49. Westmoor Club	105 West Chester Street	Replce sports court/chg mat	41/805	Adam Davis
50. Jeffery Greenberg 10-4940	30A Orange Street	Garage reno/addition	42.3.2/200	Emeritus
51. Horchow Family NT 10-4934	27 East Tristram Avenue	Rev. 4699: porch	31/2	Emeritus

VI. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	October 19 & 21; 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, November 2, 2021 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, Intro • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:21 pm. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Poh-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board