



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,  
**Associate Commissioners:** Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, October 7, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,  
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:01 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Interim HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, PLUS Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill

Absent Members: Oliver, Dutra (McLaughlin could be heard though apparently could not hear)

Late Arrivals: Camp, 1:07 pm; Welch, 1:07 pm

Early Departures: Pohl, 1:57 pm

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 3-0//Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

## I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

## II. DISCUSSION OF OML COMPLAINT

Open Meeting Law Complaint filed against the Historic District Commission from Mark & Suzanne Forsyth of the Lili Pond Neighborhood Association, dated August 3, 2021: Acknowledgement of the Open Meeting Law complaint; discussion and response to the Open Meeting Law Complaint; votes may be taken.

Voting Coombs (acting chair), Welch, Thornewill

Recused Pohl, Camp

Documentation Open Meeting Law (OML) complaint; OML Decision Instructions.

Concerns **McCarthy** – Read Town Counsel's instructions. 1<sup>st</sup> complaint is that the agendas are too long making it hard to follow applications; the 2<sup>nd</sup> is related to 36 Lily Street.

**Coombs** – Acknowledged receipt of the OML complaint. Explained Ms. Camp's involvement in the August 3 hearing that resulted in the complaint.

**Thornewill** – It sounds like a mistake by a lay person on the board; when Ms. Camp was told she couldn't speak as a member of the public, she backed off.

**Welch** – It would behoove us, given the potential seriousness, to receive advice from TC regarding whether or not the violations actually occurred and exactly what the violations are and how to mitigate either incident happening again going forward. He'd like that before we respond.

**Coombs** – Acknowledged Mr. Welch's comments.

**McCarthy** – He has Town Counsel's response; the motion drafted is that Town Counsel and Mr. McCarthy will continue to work on the response through the commissioners; HDC will review the draft for correction; the draft will go back to Town Counsel, who will send to the State Attorney General. Town Counsel's report is that this complaint was filed after 30 days of date of the violation; no OML was violated; and HDC agendas are sufficiently detailed and reasonably clear.

Motion **Move that [Chair/Land Use Specialist] work with Town Counsel to finalize the Commission's response to the Open Meeting Law complaint filed by Mark and Suzanne Forsyth on behalf of themselves and the Lili Pond Neighborhood Association, consistent with the Commission's discussion today, and to issue such response to the Complainants and to the Division of Open Government. (Welch)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 3-0//Thornewill, Welch, and Coombs-aye

## III. NEW BUSINESS 09/28/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Francis McGillin 09-4621	7 Atlantic Avenue	Basement stairwell	55/15	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Mark Poor, Permits Plus			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:22)	<b>Poor</b> – Presented project. <b>Backus</b> – Circa 1973 structure; reviewed history of Atlantic Avenue. Doesn't look like there's room to flip the stairs. Read HSAB comments 9/27: no concerns overall but asked if stairs can be flipped. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4621</b>
2. Andrew Arnott 09-4622	4 Manchester Circle	Pool	56/463	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Mark Poor, Permits Plus			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:25)	<b>Poor</b> – Presented project; 14X28 with autocover. <b>Coombs</b> – Manchester was originally a driveway. Asked if this is in any old historic districts(OHD) (no). If it is not visible, she would approve it. It looks like Somerset Road doesn't have a lot of vegetation between the road and pool. <b>Camp</b> – Asked if there are other details beyond the bluestone patio (no). Agrees if it is not visible from Somerset, she'll approve it. <b>Thornewill</b> – Believes it won't be seen. <b>Welch</b> – No concerns			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted with the pool not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Welch)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4622</b>
3. 38 Monohansett, LLC 09-4625	38 Monohansett Road	Rev. 4182: roof, ODS &fnst	79/60	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Ted Norberg, owner			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:32)	<b>Norberg</b> – Presented project. <b>Welch</b> – It's totally appropriate. <b>Coombs</b> – Sorry to see chimney go. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4625</b>
4. George Breen 09-4667	19 Broadway	As-built trash bin	73.1.3/111	Self
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:36)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

5. Oliver Carr **09-4720** 84 Cliff Road Move off/demo 30/74.1 Robert Newman

Voting Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historical documentation.  
 Representing Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction Inc.  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:36) **Newman** – Presented project.  
**Backus** – National Historic Landmarks (NHL) data indicates 1982.  
**Welch** – It would be great to reuse the structure, but he has no concerns.  
 Consensus agrees.

Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2021-09-4720**

6. Kathryn Ketelson **09-4681** 9 Cabot Lane Driveway replacement 29/90 M. Sweeney

Voting Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.  
 Representing Theresa Sweeney, M. Sweeney Construction Inc.  
 Public None  
 Concerns (8:49) **Sweeney** – Presented project.  
**Backus** – This is The Fish Cottage circa 1880 attributed to Williams Fish; Nantucket Preservation Trust has a marker on this structure and did a history.  
 Read HSAB comments 9/27: changing this shell drive to all red brick is too much brick and too formal an approach for this neighborhood; a more natural material would be preferred, such as cobblestone or pea stone; changing some areas to walkways of a different material would mitigate the large amount of one homogenous surface; a site plan showing the entire driveway should be provided.  
**Pohl** – It’s hard to tell where the brick will go because this is a shared driveway. It will be a lot of brick; it would be nice to break it up somehow.  
**Welch** – We need a proper site plan; would prefer to hold this for Tuesday to review with that.  
**Thornewill** – Agrees with Mr. Welch. Asked that in the meantime they work on reducing some of the area that would become brick.  
**Camp** – Agrees with what’s been said.  
 Coombs – Also agrees with what’s been said; she’d also like to see where the property line runs

Motion **Motion to Hold for a hardscape plan with property line and revisions. (Welch)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

- 7. George Wilcox **09-4679** 101 Low Beach Road Add roofwalk 75/32 Val Oliver Design
- 8. George Wilcox **09-4673** 101 Low Beach Road Addition to shed 75/32 Val Oliver Design
- 9. Tyler Dewing **09-4675** 74 Milk Street Demo barn 56/6.1 Linda Williams
- 10. Tyler Dewing **09-4671** 74 Milk Street New barn/2nd dwelling 56/6.1 Linda Williams
- 11. Thomas Keegan **09-4669** 41B Cliff Road Revise fenestration 29/40 Linda Williams
- 12. NHA **09-4677** 99 Main Street Fence 42.3.3/110 Linda Williams
- 13. NHA **10-4816** 12 Straight Wharf Storm windows 42.3.1/138 Linda Williams

Voting Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation None  
 Representing None  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:42) Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold 7-13 for representation. (Coombs)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

14. Michael Altman <b>09-4674</b>	37 Sankaty Road	Rev. 07-4120: pool	48/2	BPC
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:50)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	
15. Mark Williams <b>09-4710</b>	86 Somerset Road	Solar panels	66/404	Sunwind, LLC
16. Clarjoh LLC <b>09-4711</b>	7 Teasdale Circle	Solar panels	69/73	Sunwind, LLC
17. Patrick Levesque <b>09-4712</b>	3 Henderson Drive	Solar panels	66/195	Sunwind, LLC
18. Young Bracebridge Trust	7 Shawkemo Road	Solar panels	43/5	Sunwind, LLC
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:50)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold 15-18 for representation. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
19. Craig Arsenault <b>09-4717</b>	4 Saratoga Lane	Addition	41/177.3	JB Studio
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat, JB Studio			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:51)	<p><b>Bencat</b> – Presented project; there is a retaining wall covered with lattice on the north and it will be extended.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – Property card and NHL data indicates circa 1948.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – This is an appropriate change. Asked if they are retaining or losing a parking space.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – North elevation, asked about the retaining wall.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – No comments.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – No concerns.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4717</b>
20. Bradley Winer	34 Cliff Road	Rev. 11-2320: fenestration	42.4.4/47	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl,			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:42)	<p><b>Pohl</b> – Asked this be held this for Tuesday.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>			
Motion	<b>Held for October 12<sup>th</sup>.</b>			
Roll-call Vote	N/A		Certificate #	
21. Charles Davidson <b>09-4709</b>	10 Quince Street	Fence	42.3.4/103	NAG
22. Charles Davidson <b>09-4708</b>	10 Quince Street	Color change	42.3.4/103	NAG
23. 167 Hummock Pnd Rd, LLC <b>09-4707</b>	167 Hummock Pond Road	Addition	65/36	NAG
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:42)	Not opened at this time			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold 21-23 for representation. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	

24. M2D3 Irr.Tr. <b>08-4453</b>	31 Washing Pond Road	2 <sup>nd</sup> fl dormers on garage	31/29	Elizabeth Marcoullier
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing Public	Mike Bard, Elizabeth Dunne Marcoullier Architecture & Interior Design			
Concerns (2:00)	<p><b>Bard</b> – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – This is much better; it's what we were asking for. The north elevation dormer is “wobbly” over the doors but that oddity won't be discernible.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – The dormer is a little too wide but okay.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – He has no concerns.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – Four windows in the north elevation dormer might give it more symmetry.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Welch, Thornewill, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-08-4453</b>
25. James Davison <b>09-4803</b>	8 North Water Street	Window changes	42.4.2/92.1	LINK
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing Public	Victoria Ewing, LINK			
Concerns (2:09)	<p><b>Ewing</b> – Presented project; the new windows will be Boston Sash.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – No historical information included on the application. Greek revival post 1846; it would help to have the age of the existing windows and know the vintage of the back ell; it would be a shame to lose the small upper and 6-light windows on the ell. Recommend submission of a window survey.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 9/27: windows must be wood sash TDLs; north elevation upper windows should match the size below.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Agrees with HSAB; would like to know which windows are old; the old windows should be kept.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – The west elevation windows should not get larger. North elevation, the sizing of the proposed windows suits the simplicity of the elevation.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – It's a shame to lose the break-up of windows sizes on both the north and the west. The rear-most 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor portion windows are the most atypical relative to the existing windows.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – Agrees with no change on the west elevation and windows being TDL. Okay with the proposal for the north elevation.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for more information and a window survey. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	
26. Nantucket Airport <b>09-4706</b>	14 Airport Road	New hangar	78/1	Anton Dimov
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing Public	Anton Dimov			
Concerns (2:20)	<p><b>Dimov</b> – Presented project: sandstone beige walls and galvanized steel roof</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Asked about the colors. It's a hangar.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Agrees. In any motion we approve the color as close as to what exists on the site.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – Agrees.</p>			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted with color to match as much as possible other hangars in the area. (welch)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2021-09-4706</b>

Rest held for Tuesday, October 12<sup>th</sup>.

27. Jeffrey Greenberg <b>09-4696</b>	30 Orange Street	Rebld deck + fenest rev.	42.3.2/176	Emeritus
28. Horchow Fam NT <b>09-4699</b>	27 East Tristram Avenue	Rev porch and fenestration	31/2	Emeritus
29. Horchow Fam NT <b>09-4698</b>	27 East Tristram Avenue	New garage	31/2	Emeritus
30. Housing Nantucket <b>09-4702</b>	31 Fairgrounds Road	New dwelling, bldg. 4	67/149	Emeritus
31. Housing Nantucket <b>09-4703</b>	31 Fairgrounds Road	New dwelling, bldg. 5	67/149	Emeritus
32. 7 Masaquet, LLC <b>09-4697</b>	7 Masaquet Avenue	New dwelling	80/144	Emeritus
33. Joseph Saluti <b>09-4700</b>	174 Cliff Road	Addition	41/63	Emeritus
34. Joseph Saluti <b>09-4701</b>	174 Cliff Road	Studio	41/63	Emeritus
35. Elizabeth O'Connor <b>09-4739</b>	16 Tashama Lane	As-built retaining wall	55/481	Katy Mitchell

**VIII. OLD BUSINESS 10/05/2021**

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Kathleen Waldorf 09-4584	54 Madequecham Valley	Addition	88/20	Botticelli & Pohl
2. 8 Walbang NT 09-4580	8 Walbang Avenue	New dwelling	82/46	Botticelli & Pohl
3. Nant 24 Mill St, LLC 07-4269	24 Mill Street	Demo shed	55.4.4/97	Self
4. Nant 24 Mill St, LLC 07-4270	24 Mill Street	120sf shed	55.4.4/97	Self
5. Dean Lampe 08-4495	15 Aurora Way	New dwelling	56/447	Self
6. Dean Lampe 08-4499	15 Aurora Way	Garage	56/447	Self
7. Dean Lampe 08-4500	15 Aurora Way	Hot tub	56/447	Self
8. Lauren Stein 09-4574	11 Woodbury Lane	New dwelling	41/550	Normand Residential
9. Nant. Development 08-4370	9 Hydrangea Lane	New dwelling	73/94	Val Oliver Design
10. 22 Easton St., LLC 05-3644	22,24 Easton Street	Guesthouse	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
11. 22 Easton St., LLC 06-4026	22,24 Easton Street	Pool & hardscape	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
12. North Mill, LLC, 08-4338	Lot A – Birdsong Lane	New dwelling	55.4.4/80/1	Thornewill Design
13. Mark Norris 07-4268	14A Lowell Place	Shed	41/164	Linda Williams
14. Paul Benk 09-4592	8 North Gully Road	Add dormer	73.1.3/48	Emeritus

**IX. OTHER BUSINESS**

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	September 9, 28, & 30, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Next HDC Meeting <b>Thursday, October 7, 2021 at 1:00 pm. ZOOM</b></li> <li>• Discussion of Advisory Board Review</li> <li>• Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, Intro</li> <li>• Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda</li> <li>• Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings</li> <li>• Hardscaping</li> <li>• Discussion of salvaging demolitions</li> </ul>
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:28 pm (Coombs)**  
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye

Submitted by:  
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board