



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, October 5, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 5:00 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Interim HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill

Absent Members: Oliver, Welch, Dutra

Late Arrivals: None

Early Departures: McLaughlin, 7:38 pm

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Mian Scarlett 09-4684	20 Ticcoma Way	Egress basement windows	67/709	Self
2.	Michael Altman 09-4672	37 Sankaty Road	Rev. 07-4121: cabana	48/2	BPC
3.	Evelyn Sylvia 09-4745	11 Hooper Farm Road	Add egress window	55/225	Self
4.	Maria Pena 10-4813	7 Brinda Lane	Add 3 egress windows	67/313	Self
5.	Timothy Reinemo 09-4638	65 Lovers Lane	Garage move off	80/214.1	Self
6.	Timothy Reinemo 09-4637	63 Lovers Lane	Garage move on	80/214.1	Self
7.	Terry Moriarty 09-4656	18 Goldfinch Drive	Window removal	68/605	Chris Perry

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2021- (as noted)**

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Shaun Broderick 09-4705	3 Old Mill Court	Rev. 084401: raise 12"	55/927	Jardins International
	• Pool and spa not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter.				
2.	Peter Lee 09-4704	3 Austin Locke Way	Rev. 73008: rotate pool	82/49	Jardins International
	• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter.				

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No additional concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; McLaughlin response Certificate # **HDC2021-09-(as noted)**

IV. SIGNS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Nan. Cottage Hosp 09-4723	20 Vesper Lane	Wall sign 1 (Big)	55-248	Sign Here Nantucket
2. Nan. Cottage Hosp 09-4724	20 Vesper Lane	Wall sign 1 (small)	55-248	Sign Here Nantucket
3. Graham Burton 09-4725	37 Tomahawk Lane	Wall sign	69/326	Sign Here Nantucket
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	McCarthy – SAC recommends approval of items 1-3 as submitted.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Items 1, 2, & 3 as submitted. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-09-(as noted)	
4. David Cox 05-3671	58B Main Street	Wall sign (Clorinda Antinori)	42.31/219.2	Antonio Aransaunz
Voting	Pohll, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	McCarthy – Recommend this be held for Oct 26.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for October 26. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #		

V. NEWBUSINESS 09-14/2021

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Mary Claus Rev Trust 09-4582	31 Low Beach Road	Reloc on site & part demo	74/36	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Camp (acting chair), McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Ray Pohl, Botticelli & Pohl			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:08)	Not opened			
Motion	No action at this time.			
Roll-call Vote	N/A	Certificate #		
2. 27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4595	27 Fair Street	Front bldg – historic reno	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP for approximately 30 neighbors Frances Baskett, 2 Charter Street			
Concerns (5:08)	<p>Kotchen – Presented project as a whole; will be using true-divided light windows (TDL); the applications are in error with simulated-divided light windows (SDL). Presented work proposed for this specific structure.</p> <p>Backus – Typical Nantucket, circa 1835; was an inn; thanked Mr. Kotchen for providing history showing evolution of the structure; recommend reusing historic windows where possible and look forward to a window survey. Confirms HSAB's request that they review any revisions; recommends looking into historic tax credits.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 9/27: all existing windows should be restored rather than replaced; all new windows should be TDL; need window survey and photos of condition of any window to be replaced; the proposed rear 2nd-floor deck will be visible and should either be eliminated or reduced so as not to overwhelm the roof plane; the south shed dormer is atypical for this age with so much shingle area, and it does not conform to the usual meeting rail standards; it should be eliminated or reduced in length to minimize the exposed shingle area beside the windows; existing window trim should not be changed so that all window trim on the house matches; different styles of trim are evidence of the houses history and should not be altered for the sake of uniformity; HSAB would like to review future revisions.</p> <p>Reade – His clients are concerned about increased density of use. We agree with everything recorded from HSAB. We object to the rear 2nd-story deck; it is inappropriate and intrudes on the neighborhood.</p> <p>Baskett – Concerned about the rear deck, which is visible from the street.</p>			

Camp – Appreciates the in-depth historic investigation. Agrees the rear deck with French doors is too modern, as well as the shed dormer on Hillers Lane. She’d prefer a combination of the charming, west-elevation, existing wart. Glad a window survey is being done.

Coombs – The rear wart should remain 1 story; this building is visible from all sides; keeping its quality and simplicity is important.

Thornewill – The 2nd-floor deck should be eliminated; adding it takes away from the historic simplicity of the building; she’s okay with that bumping up a bit but should remain very simple. Part of the beauty of the different window trim in the additions is it tells the story and should be maintained.

McLaughlin – The west elevation is visible from a side street; it’s approvable.

Pohl – Agrees with comments about the deck, maintaining simplicity of the rear addition, and indicating through the trim the sequencing of the time periods.

Motion to Hold for revisions and the revisions to be reviewed by HSAB. (Coombs)

Motion

Roll-call Vote

Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

3. 27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4594 27 Fair Street Back bldg – historic reno 42.3.2/193.1 Workshop APD

Voting

Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill

Alternates

None

Recused

None

Documentation

Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.

Representing

Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD

Public

Ted Hill, 6 Charter St

Al Messina, 10 Martin’s Lane

Joseph Foley, 8 Charter Street

Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP for approximately 30 neighbors

Concerns (5:33)

Kotchen – Presented this project; none of the historic information aligned with the existing structure; construction methods indicate it’s 40 or 50 years old. He’s willing to hold this and come back with data on the age.

Backus – The National Park Service, Department of National Historic Places has a definition for the word “historic”, which doesn’t necessarily involve a structure’s age. She couldn’t find much information on this. It would be a shame to lose the saltbox element on the east if this is a historic structure.

Read HSAB comments 9/27: the proposed addition should be set back, not forward from the existing structure; the applicant is creating his own problem by adding more program; to argue that it needs to come forward in order to respect the rear setback requirements, cannot be used to validate inappropriate design; the additions should be more secondary in height and massing; the new east-facing salt-boxes gables facing backwards are awkward; the new additions could be used to conceal the existing saltbox condition, and they should be simple gables; all existing windows should be restored rather than replaced where possible; all new windows should be TDL - not SDL; HSAB would like to review future revisions.

Pohl – We need an additional package with supporting data that this is a new building versus historic. He’d prefer to hold this for that information.

Hill – He feels this is probably not historic. Asked that the proposed rear staircase be enclosed. There’s a cement retaining wall that probably dates back to the 1920s; he and his neighbor are concerned it could be undermined by the proposed work. Wants to know where the air-conditioning units (A/C) will be placed.

Messina – We should keep in mind that Hiller’s Lane, combined with High Street, is one of the most travelled side streets and is very narrow with no sidewalk. He’s concerned about the massing of the proposed building being a 2-story structure in combination with the addition to the front building will create a narrow canyon on the Hiller’s Lane.

Foley – Agrees with Mr. Messina that the proposed massing is not appropriate for the structures or neighborhood; these are massive in comparison to the surrounding historic homes on the fish lots. He thinks a site visit would be informative.

Reade – He can’t think of another instant in the fish lot area where a building is so long facing the street; most houses are small and modest. This is proposed at 2 stories for most of its length along Hiller’s Lane.

Thornewill – If this is a new structure, which she tends to believe, she would like to see a new structure because the proposed south elevation reads like 4 attached condos, which is inappropriate.

Camp – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill about learning the true age. The existing looks like a mirror image of the front building. Hiller’s Lane is a very tight street; she’d prefer a rebuild on the existing footprint pushing the far-right addition back from the road.

Coombs – Agrees with what’s been said. We need to find the age of the building; if it was built in the last 50 years, there should be a building permit. As a secondary building, it should be kept small and have some greenery around it.

McLaughlin – Feels this is compatible with other large structures in the neighborhood.

Pohl – If Mr. Kotchen can demonstrate the building is new with no historic value, there would be more available options regarding massing and placement.

Motion to View and Hold for more information and revisions and HSAB to review the revisions. (Coombs)

Motion

Roll-call Vote

Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

4. 27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4597 29 Fair Street Back bldg – historic reno 42.3.2/192 Workshop APD

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.
 Representing Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD
 Public William Fordyce, 3 Darling Street
 Concerns (6:00) **Kotchen** – This proposal is to lift and add 1’ of head room to the 1st floor; circa 1892; will do a mudsill.
Backus – Mr. Kotchen provided excellent historic information. If the owners want to retain use as rentals, they can seek historic tax credits.
 Read HSAB comments 9/27: all existing windows should be restored rather than replaced where possible; a window survey should be done for any windows to be replaced; all new windows should be TDL - not SDL; the triple ganged French doors will be very visible from Hiller’s Lane; this should be a single door with a window, and the door should be 6’-8” – not 7 ft tall; raising the entire building to gain head height is reasonable, but should be kept to a minimum; possibly use a mud block foundation to mitigate the additional height; HSAB would like to review future revisions.
Fordyce – Moving the stairs is making them visible from Darling Street. There’s only 18” between the end of this and my cottage; wants to understand the construction method.
Thornewill – Raising the east-elevation 2nd-floor deck to 8’3” from 6’9” is inappropriate; the low profile should be kept.
Coombs – The east elevation, the glass doors make it have too much fenestration; agrees the French doors should be no more than 6’8” and should be a single door with flanking window on both floors; the railing style dates to the 1800s.
Camp – East elevation, agrees with Ms. Coombs about the doors; the French doors should have a wood kick panel.
McLaughlin – East elevation has too much glass; the triple-ganged windows should be reduced to 2; the 2nd-floor should have 1 door with 2 flanking windows on the 1st floor.
Pohl – Explained what would happen regarding construction so near the neighbor. The stairs will be visible; suggested stepping the east-elevation deck down.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions and HSAB to review revisions. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; Certificate #
 McLaughlin no response

5. 27 Fair Street, LLC 09-4596 29 Fair Street Front bldg – historic reno 42.3.2/192 Workshop APD

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.
 Representing Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD
 Public Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP for approximately 30 neighbors
 Tom Bologna, 30 Fair Street
 Jamie Moss, 7 Plumb Lane
 Joseph Foley, 8 Charter Street
 Concerns (6:18) **Kotchen** – Presented project and history; the building is in extreme disrepair and much doesn’t meet code; we will create a full construction execution plan to be shared with all abutters; we haven’t determined the foundation.
Backus – Individually significant structure circa 1709. Quoted Henry Foreman and the PIN report regarding the history of this structure. This would be a prime candidate for a historic tax credit. This structure is also attributed to the George Bunker Family. The gable addition is not appropriate – too tall and eliminates south elevation silhouette on the south elevation. Agrees that a chimney survey should be provided. Regarding the basement; there should be some documentation of the historic basement access points.
 Read HSAB comments 9/27: all existing windows should be restored rather than replaced; a window survey should be done for any windows to be replaced; all new windows should be TDL; the existing trim should be repaired - not be replaced with new trim; the old historic material expresses the building’s age; all new trim would destroy the historic character; the proposed rear addition is modern in its proportion and fenestration and does not relate at all to the age of the main mass; it is too wide and boxy, and should be broken up into smaller forms; the fenestration should also reflect the style and character of an 1800’s addition; sliding French doors and large panes of glass are completely inappropriate; on the South elevation the broken back saltbox roof line dates from the 1800’s and should remain; considering the proposed total gutting of the historic and iconic Woodbox Inn interior including the fireplaces, the chimneys should be required to remain intact and not removed and rebuilt; an existing chimney survey should be provided; HSAB would like to review future revisions.
Reade – His clients agree with HSAB; this is one of the most iconic buildings in Nantucket. The overall nature as viewed from the side streets will be greatly altered by the additions and glass on the 1st floor.
Bologna – Asked about the foundation and if it will be a basement or crawlspace. Asked about how the changes to the rooms will result in fewer bedrooms.
Moss – The expansion is out of character with the historic structure and the neighborhood; the increase glass adds to light and noise pollution. The interior is driving the exterior.
Camp – Front elevation far left, the 2 windows are very funky and should be renovated and kept; this isn’t much younger than the Oldest House. Rather than a gable going back with nano doors, suggested keeping the shed roof.

Foley – Regarding the ganged windows across the back, those are completely inappropriate for the neighborhood.

Coombs – The dining room has plenty of existing charm and doesn't need to be opened up with big windows. South elevation, should maintain the charming broken-back roof.

Thornewill – Agrees with what's been said. West elevation, the existing 3rd-floor gable dormer should remain. This hasn't changed much on the inside or outside since the 1800. The windows need to remain as authentic as possible. Agrees with HSAB that the addition is way too big; it needs to be more sensitive to the existing.

McLaughlin – West elevation, the 2-over-2 windows and doors are inappropriate. Its architectural features should be maintained on all sides using wood and TDL windows.

Pohl – Regarding Ms. Thornewill's comments on the incongruous but historic dormer on the west elevation, he feels the same about the gable addition; he'd be willing to see the volume of the building increase as long as the idiosyncratic feel remains.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions and to go back to HSAB for review and Chimney survey. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

VI. OLD BUSINESS 09/21/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Trogoh Nominee Trust 05-3640	26 Easy Street	Mixed use structure	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:50)	MacEachern – Asked to hold for October 12 for a full board. Not opened at this time.			
Motion	No action at this time.			
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #

2. Conlon James Trust 08-4475	24 Woodbine Avenue	Rev. 1511: add rfwlk, fenest	80/96	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:52)	MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Thornewill – If there is to be a roof walk, the proportions are in the wrong direction; it's length should run with the length of the house; we don't normally see a roof walk on this type of architecture. McLaughlin – This is harmonious to itself and the area. He's okay with the roof walk as proposed. Coombs – A roof walk is supposed to be on a 2-story building, but this is Woodbine. Asked if the roof walk could be rotated as Ms. Thornewill suggested (yes).			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to the roof walk. (Thornewill)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #

VII. NEW BUSINESS 09/23/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. McGovern Moriarty 09-4615	26 Lincoln Street	Shed demo/move off	73.4.2/3	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Thornewill			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments			
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:57)	Thornewill – Presented project; post 1993. Backus – Read SAB comments: no concerns. Asked the age; some outbuildings in this area date to the 1930s. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve the move off/demolition. (McLaughlin)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye			Certificate # HDC2021-09-4615

2.	McGovern Moriarty	09-4614	26 Lincoln Street	Rear addition to main house	73.4.2/3	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs					
Alternates	None					
Recused	Thornewill					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments					
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:00)	<p>Thornewill – Presented project; the south elevation bed-wall isn't visible.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: no concerns. South elevation, the left bedroom could use another window.</p> <p>Coombs – Even though you can't see that south elevation bed wall, she'd like it to have another window.</p> <p>Camp – No concerns.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No concerns.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (McLaughlin)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4614
3.	McGovern Moriarty	09-4613	26 Lincoln Street	New garage studio	73.4.2/3	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs					
Alternates	None					
Recused	Thornewill					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:04)	<p>Thornewill – Presented project; the house on the hill is 17' and this is 22'8" but sits lower.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: the balcony isn't appropriate. She agrees with SAB, especially since the balcony faces the road and is visible from West Sankaty; she recommends a view.</p> <p>Pohl – Mr. Thornewill offered to remove the east elevation deck and French doors and put the west elevation window on the east. Everyone agrees to that. He's positive the "F" window meets egress requirements.</p> <p>Coombs – The garage is more complicated and taller than the house. Agrees about the balcony.</p> <p>Camp – It's charming and goes with the main house. The French doors opening to Lincoln Street is inappropriate; a single window addressing the street would be better with the balcony on the other side.</p> <p>McLaughlin – This is compatible and appropriate.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with removal of the east elevation deck and French doors and replace with a double-hung window to meet egress requirements. (Camp)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4613
4.	Timothy Reinemo	09-4618	65 Lovers Lane	New dwelling	80/214.1	Self
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Tim Reinemo					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:13)	<p>Reinemo – Presented project; height is 29'10"; white trim.</p> <p>Coombs – This might be a tad formal but okay for the Boulevard-Lovers Lane area, which is informal. If possible, its height should come down.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees it's large for Lovers Lane; if it comes down a couple of feet, it would be fine.</p> <p>Thornewill – Nothing to add; white trim is too much on such a large house.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Southwest elevation, the garage door brackets should be on the inside. The rest looks okay.</p> <p>Pohl – The brackets are atypical; he'd prefer vertical board doors. The white trim would make it stand out.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	
5.	Francis McGillin	09-4621	7 Atlantic Avenue	Basement stairwell	55/15	Permits Plus
6.	Andrew Arnott	09-4622	4 Manchester Circle	Pool	56/463	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	None					
Representing	None					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:12)	Not opened at this time.					
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4622

7.	Liberty Street Trust	09-4643	71 North Liberty Street	Demo existing pool	41/141.1	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Steve Theroux, Nantucket Architectural Group					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:22)	Theroux – Presented project. Backus – This is an existing pool in the ROH. Read HSAB comments 9/27: no concerns. No concerns.					
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4643
8.	Liberty Street Trust	09-4641	71 North Liberty Street	Replace existing pool	41/141.1	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Steve Theroux, Nantucket Architectural Group Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:25)	Theroux – Presented project; the pool is moving out of the setback and getting smaller; fence and screening exist. Reade – We will file with the ZBA based upon an alteration of a pre-existing non-conforming structure and is not significantly detrimental to the neighborhood; the alternative is to repair the existing pool <i>in situ</i> . Backus – Read HSAB comments 9/27: no concerns as long as it's not visible from Coffin Park. Coombs – She thinks removing the pool removes the legality of replacing it; this is in the old historic district (OHD) where pools aren't allowed. Camp – Because it's not square, she can't get an idea of how large it is. She's okay with this as it is an existing pool. The proposed bluestone patio is very large. Thornewill – She's okay with replacing the pool; nothing is getting worse. Concerned about the proposed sauna, which is a structure. McLaughlin – Screen went black. Pohl – There is a net improvement.					
Motion	Motion to Approve the hot tub and pool through staff with no approval of the hardscape or sauna at this time. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; McLaughlin abstain.				Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4641
9.	Lisa Winn/Elliot Lees	09-4632	24 Somerset Road	Rooftop Solar	66/125	Cotuit Solar
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.					
Representing	Karen Alence, Cotuit Solar					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:38)	Alence – Presented project. No concerns.					
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4632
10.	James Kane	09-4627	21 Ridge Lane	New fdtn/shift /frnt prch	38/76	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Brook Meerbergen					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:42)	Meerbergen – Presented project. Coombs – No concerns.					
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4627

11. 38 Monohansett, LLC 09-4625	38 Monohansett Road	Rev. 07-4182:	79/60	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:46)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday, October 7. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

12. Charles Phillips 09-4626	4 Swain Street	Window replacement	42.4.1/82.3	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:46)	McCarthy – The owner asked this be held for October 12 th . Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for October 12th at owner's request. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl		Certificate #	

13. 27 Pequot Realty Trust 09-4655	27 Pequot Street	Additions	80/134	Val Oliver Design
14. Greg Glowacki 09-4661	11 Millers Lane	Rev. 3042: resite pool/pckl	68/124	Val Oliver Design
15. William Wright 09-4646	5 Goose Cove Way	Solar panels	59.4/367	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:47)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for October 12th. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

16. George Breen 09-4667	19 Broadway	As-built trash bin	73.1.3/111	Self
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:48)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4667

17. Ps & Qs, LLC 09-4665	105 Surfside Road	Move off/demo house	80/4	Mark Cutone Arch
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.			
Representing	Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:57)	Cutone – Presented project; circa 1995; we are making it available for move off. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move off/demolition. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4665

18. Ps & Qs, LLC	09-4664	105 Surfside Road	Move off/demo shed	80/4	Mark Cutone Arch
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.				
Representing	Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:59)	Cutone – Presented project; circa 1995. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move off/demolition. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4664
19. Ps & Qs, LLC	09-4666	105 Surfside Road	Relocate shed on site	80/4	Mark Cutone Arch
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos				
Representing	Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:00)	Cutone – Presented project. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4666
20. Ps & Qs, LLC	09-4662	105 Surfside Road	New dwelling	80/4	Mark Cutone Arch
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:01)	Cutone – Presented project; black sash and door, grey trim, and cedar roof; height 27'. Camp – This is very simple; she likes it. Coombs – The left gable is tall for the width, but not a huge problem. Thornewill – The lack of fenestration on the northeast makes it simple and interesting. Rear elevation, the low-pitch roof won't be visible.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Thornewill)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Coombs, Thornewill, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4662
21. Ps & Qs, LLC	09-4663	105 Surfside Road	New pool	80/4	Mark Cutone Arch
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:06)	Cutone – Presented project. Coombs – This is pretty well hidden and tucking it into the deck is a good idea. If it were reduced 2' in length, that would be great. Thornewill – Agrees with Ms. Coombs. Really likes the boardwalk. Camp – No comments.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the length reduced 2'. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4663

22. Anne Delaney	09-4686	41 Wauwinet Road	Ground solar array	20/7	ACK Smart
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Thornewill				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.				
Representing	Tim Carruthers, ACKSmart				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:50)	Carruthers – Presented project. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the array not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. from Wauwinet Road. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4686
23. John Barry	09-4687	22 Eel Point Road	Ground solar array	40/43	ACK Smart
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.				
Representing	Tim Carruthers, ACKSmart				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:54)	Carruthers – Presented project. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the screening intact. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4687
24. Jennifer Bowman	09-4644	14 Starbuck Road	Rev. new porch&drmr/fenst	60/114	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates Jim Johnson, Architect				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:09)	Johnson – Presented project; only the front is visible. McMorrow – Previous changes to this house have gone on consent due to lack of visibility; not sure why this didn't go on consent. McCarthy – Read MAB comments 10/4: the windows are 1-over-1 with fake mullions; should go to 6-over-1 with fixed mullions; the proposal is massive and formal and inappropriate for Madaket; there shouldn't be an apron on a dirt road. Coombs – West elevation, the dormer meeting rails don't align with the eaves and should come down. South elevation, the deck is too long. Thornewill – Agrees with Ms. Coombs. The rear dormer is unfortunate but probably not visible. Camp – East elevation, the gable dormer is not appropriate; it "pushes the envelope." South elevation, doesn't like that the elongated deck is getting even longer. Pohl – He has no concerns. If the rear dormer were a shed, it would have a 2/12 pitch; when it was pulled off the ridge, that dropped the pitch to 5/12; a 6/12 would bring the dormer peak up to meet the roof behind it.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south elevation deck to remain as previously approved; east elevation, change the gable dormer pitch to 6/12 and remove the extra horizontal trim. (Thornewill)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Coombs, Thornewill, and Pohl-aye; Camp abstain			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4644
25. Christopher Christillo	09-4640	3 Bayberry Lane	Dormer and fenest chng	67/59	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:28)	McMorrow – Presented project. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4640

26. Ezia Athletic Club 09-4645	117 Orange Street	Fenest and color change	55/377	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:30)	<p>McMorrow – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – NPT and PIN information date it circa 1854; home of a school in 1856; and was a McLaughlin & Backus residence. She'd like to see the previously approved elevations versus the existing to discern which is which; would like a window survey; wood more appropriate.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 9/27: would like to see existing drawings and photos; this was built in 1854 and the windows should not be replaced; they should be restored; Andersens are not appropriate for new windows, should be wood TDL's; grey trim is fine, prefer not black sash.</p> <p>Coombs – The sash should not be black; that's not appropriate on the oldest house on Orange Street; windows should be TDL and not vinyl or plastic. Vinyl windows crack, darken, and age badly.</p> <p>Camp – She likes old-fashioned white on a house like this; grey would take away from the architecture. Windows should be TDL.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees with Ms. Camp: white accentuates the quirks and interesting woodwork.</p> <p>Pohl – He thinks grey trim would be fine; he does object to black sash. Suggested an window inventory to establish how many are Andersens and Broscos.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information on the windows and a different sash color. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
27. Oliver Carr 09-4720	84 Cliff Road	Move off/demo	30/74.1	Robert Newman
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:39)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4720
28. 64 HFR, LLC 09-4653	64 Hooper Farm Road	New dwelling	67/321.1	Justin Quinn
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, E. McMorrow Design Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:39)	<p>McMorrow – Presented project; it's short; he could make the west elevation kitchen windows in the gable taller.</p> <p>Camp – Could add a window on the other side of the front door but it's nice as is.</p> <p>Coombs – No concerns.</p> <p>Thornewill – West elevation, the windows in the gable are tiny.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation right windows to be 4" taller. (Thornewill)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4653
29. Craig Knutson 09-4652	30 Crooked Lane	Pool and hardscape	41/332	Ahern
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:44)	<p>Ahern – Presented project; the owner will create additional gardens; she can come back later for the berry cage.</p> <p>Camp – She would be okay with approving the architectural element (berry cage) as well; they all go together. She has no concerns.</p> <p>Coombs – This lot has a lot of buildings on it; but she's okay with it.</p> <p>Thornewill – No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve including the berry cage. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4652

Proposed HDC Minutes for October 5, 2021

30. Kathryn Ketelson 09-4681	9 Cabot Lane	Driveway replacement	29/90	M. Sweeney
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:49)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
31. George Wilcox 09-4679	101 Low Beach Road	Add roofwalk	75/32	Val Oliver Design
32. George Wilcox 09-4673	101 Low Beach Road	Addition to shed	75/32	Val Oliver Design
33. Tyler Dewing 09-4675	74 Milk Street	Demo barn	56/6.1	Linda Williams
34. Tyler Dewing 09-4671	74 Milk Street	New barn/2nd dwelling	56/6.1	Linda Williams
35. Thomas Keegan 09-4669	41B Cliff Road	Revise fenestration	29/40	Linda Williams
36. NHA 09-4677	99 Main Street	Fence	42.3.3/110	Linda Williams
37. NHA 10-4816	12 Straight Wharf	Storm windows	42.3.1/138	Linda Williams
38. Michael Altman 09-4674	37 Sankaty Road	Rev. 07-4120: pool	48/2	BPC
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:50)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold 31 through 38 for representation. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
39. 6 OWF Road, LLC 09-4688	6 Old Westmoor Farm	Tennis court	41/821	Ahern
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:51)	Ahern – Presented project. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4688
Rest held for Thursday 10/7 1:00 pm				
40. Mark Williams 09-4710	86 Somerset Road	Solar panels	66/404	Sunwind, LLC
41. Clarjoh LLC 09-4711	7 Teasdale Circle	Solar panels	69/73	Sunwind, LLC
42. Patrick Levesque 09-4712	3 Henderson Drive	Solar panels	66/195	Sunwind, LLC
43. Young Bracebridge Trust	7 Shawkemo Road	Solar panels	43/5	Sunwind, LLC
44. Craig Arsenault 09-4717	4 Saratoga Lane	Addition	41/177.3	JB Studio
45. Bradley Winer	34 Cliff Road	Rev. 11-2320: fenestration	42.4.4/47	Botticelli + Pohl
46. Charles Davidson 09-4709	10 Quince Street	Fence	42.3.4/103	NAG
47. Charles Davidson 09-4708	10 Quince Street	Color change	42.3.4/103	NAG
48. 167 Hummock Pnd Rd, LLC 09-4707	167 Hummock Pond Road	Addition	65/36	NAG
49. Jeffrey Greenberg 09-4696	30 Orange Street	Rebld deck + fenest rev.	42.3.2/176	Emeritus
50. Horchow Fam NT 09-4699	27 East Tristram Avenue	Rev porch and fenestration	31/2	Emeritus
51. Horchow Fam NT 09-4698	27 East Tristram Avenue	New garage	31/2	Emeritus
52. Housing Nantucket 09-4702	31 Fairgrounds Road	New dwelling, bldg. 4	67/149	Emeritus
53. Housing Nantucket 09-4703	31 Fairgrounds Road	New dwelling, bldg. 5	67/149	Emeritus
54. 7 Masaquet, LLC 09-4697	7 Masaquet Avenue	New dwelling	80/144	Emeritus
55. Joseph Saluti 09-4700	174 Cliff Road	Addition	41/63	Emeritus
56. Joseph Saluti 09-4701	174 Cliff Road	Studio	41/63	Emeritus
57. Nantucket Airport 09-4706	14 Airport Road	New hangar	78/1	Anton Dimov
58. Elizabeth O'Connor 09-4739	16 Tashama Lane	As-built retaining wall	55/481	Katy Mitchell
59. James Davison 09-4803	8 North Water Street	Window changes	42.4.2/92.1	LINK

VIII. OLD BUSINESS 10/05/2021

Proposed HDC Minutes for October 5, 2021

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Kathleen Waldorf 09-4584	54 Madequecham Valley	Addition	88/20	Botticelli & Pohl
2. 8 Walbang NT 09-4580	8 Walbang Avenue	New dwelling	82/46	Botticelli & Pohl
3. M2D3 Irr.Tr. 08-4453	31 Washing Pond Road	2 nd fl dormers on garage	31/29	Elizabeth Marcoullier
4. Nant 24 Mill St, LLC 07-4269	24 Mill Street	Demo shed	55.4.4/97	Self
5. Nant 24 Mill St, LLC 07-4270	24 Mill Street	120sf shed	55.4.4/97	Self
6. Dean Lampe 08-4495	15 Aurora Way	New dwelling	56/447	Self
7. Dean Lampe 08-4499	15 Aurora Way	Garage	56/447	Self
8. Dean Lampe 08-4500	15 Aurora Way	Hot tub	56/447	Self
9. Lauren Stein 09-4574	11 Woodbury Lane	New dwelling	41/550	Normand Residential
10. Nant. Development 08-4370	9 Hydrangea Lane	New dwelling	73/94	Val Oliver Design
11. 22 Easton St., LLC 05-3644	22,24 Easton Street	Guesthouse	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
12. 22 Easton St., LLC 06-4026	22,24 Easton Street	Pool & hardscape	42.1.4/12	Workshop APD
13. North Mill, LLC, 08-4338	Lot A – Birdsong Lane	New dwelling	55.4.4/80/1	Thornewill Design
14. Mark Norris 07-4268	14A Lowell Place	Shed	41/164	Linda Williams
15. Paul Benk 09-4592	8 North Gully Road	Add dormer	73.1.3/48	Emeritus

IX. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes	September 16, 21, & 23, 2021
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)
Roll-call vote	Carried //Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye
Review Minutes	September 9, 28, & 30, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Thursday, October 7, 2021 at 1:00 pm, ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, Intro • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions
Commission Comments	McCarthy – Thursday’s agenda has an OML complaint discussion; he will send the information about the complaint for commissioners to review prior to the meeting. He will find out of Town Counsel will be at the meeting as well.

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 8:56 pm. (Camp)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board Madaket Advisory Board Sign Advisory Council