



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, August 26, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Interim Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver Welch, Thornewill

Absent Members: Dutra

Late Arrivals: None

Early Departures: Camp, 1:47 pm

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Susan Hayford 08-4464	41 Madaket Road	MH-roof/sdng/clr chg/trim	41/414	Self
2.	Susan Hayford 08-4469	43 Madaket Road	Brn-roof/sdng/clr chg/trim	41/414	Self
3.	Kris Megna 08-4412	28 South Shore Road	Roof/front door color chng	80-178	Val Oliver
4.	5 Folger Lane, LLC 08-4436	5 Folger Lane	Clapboard color change	42.4.4/33.2	Val Oliver
5.	Charles Davidson 08-4449	40 Quincee Street	Add French door	42.3.4/103	NAG
6.	Kirk Coburn 08-4433	5 High Brush Path	Garage LK replacement	56/388	Normand Residential
7.	Corrine Nevinny-Lyle 08-4418	3 Catherine Lane	Roof change	66/8	T&T Roofing
8.	Olaf Clausson 08-4415	30 Eel Point Road	Rev. 2258: fenst & LK fenst	40/44.1	Thornewill Design
9.	Okay Okay House, LLC 08-4434	5 Coffin Street	Garage window change	42.3.1/98	BPC

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch

Alternates None

Recused Oliver, Thornewill

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns **Backus** – Asked that 10 Quince Street be pulled off for individual review.

No other concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve Items 1-4 and 6-9 and hold Item 5. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Certificate # **HDC2021-08-(as noted)**

III. NEW BUSINESS (08/3/2021)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Nant 24 Mill St, LLC 07-4269	24 Mill Street	Demo shed	55.4.4/97	Self
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Rick Griffith				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:09)	<p>Griffith – Presented project; doesn't think it's that old since interior is almost exclusively plywood.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 8/9: need date of shed; would prefer a rebuild. The main dwelling per Mr. Lancaster is circa 1834 and National Historic List references the cottage as 1900. She'd like interior photos of this shed for the file.</p> <p>McLaughlin – His uncle built the shed sometime in the 1940s.</p> <p>Camp – This is charming; she'd prefer a restoration.</p> <p>Pohl – Asked for photos of the interior. It looks like the door is right at grade so asked for photos of the floor as well.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
2.	Nant 24 Mill St, LLC 07-4270	24 Mill Street	120 sf shed	55.4.4/97	Self
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Rick Griffith				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:15)	<p>Griffith – Presented project; height is 12'.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 8/9: need better drawings with dimensions and window placement; need a better site plan indicating exact location. We need a more specific site plan; the architectural style should emulate the main house.</p> <p>Oliver – The dormer is an anomaly; depending on where it faces, it might not be an issue.</p> <p>Camp – She doesn't support this; she's waiting for more information on the existing shed. She's tired of seeing old buildings come down in favor of these generic designs.</p> <p>McLaughlin – He thinks this is appropriate.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Camp.</p> <p>Pohl – The drawings need to have dimensions; we don't know the height and size.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
3.	TLG Properties 07-4251	21 Pleasant Street	Driveway	55.4.1/1	Edgewater
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Paul Cronin, Edgewater				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:20)	<p>Cronin – Presented project; a 10' apron takes up half the driveway; could do all brick or all cobblestone.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 8/9: prefer cobblestone apron; the existing is cobblestone. The main dwelling is contributing; this would be more appropriate off Pleasant Street.</p> <p>Oliver – She wants to go by and see the other drives. She'd prefer all cobblestone.</p> <p>Camp – If the other driveways are cobble, she'd go with that.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Good with cobblestone.</p> <p>Coombs – She wants to know which houses have aprons. Brick is too formal; would prefer cobblestone.</p> <p>Pohl – He would not want to back onto Pleasant Street.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the driveway and apron to be cobblestone. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-07-4251

IV. OLD BUSINESS 08/10/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Jacqueline Pizzi 08-4335	3 Winn Street	New second dwelling	41/593	Self
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan McMorro, Ethan McMorro Design Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:26)	<p>McMorro – Presented project; not visible from Madaket Road.</p> <p>Coombs – West elevation, the dormer cheek walls should be brought in on both sides. Same with the east elevation dormer.</p> <p>Camp – This is cute. She'd like to see it rendered with the house to ensure details match. Agrees about reducing the dormers.</p> <p>McLaughlin – It's harmonious to itself and the neighborhood. No concerns.</p> <p>Oliver – This is appropriate.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation dormers brought in 6" each side. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4335
2.	Jacqueline Pizzi 06-4081	3 Winn Street	Pool and hardscape	41/593	Atlantic Lndscpg
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Lindsay Congleton, Atlantic Landscaping Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:26)	<p>Congleton – He wants to hold this for revisions pending comments regarding the second dwelling.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
3.	Jessica Millard 06-4017	5 Cudweed	Windows/doors	82/145	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:36)	<p>Oliver – Reviewed option for fenestration.</p> <p>McLaughlin – South elevation, the amount of glass is over 50%; this needs more double-hung windows.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees the addition has too much glass; likes the option with the 2nd-floor windows ganged.</p> <p>Thornewill – Likes the ganged option best but without the big triple doors in the right mass. This center mass should be treated as the main mass, drawing your focus.</p> <p>Camp – She likes the 3rd option with the separated windows on the 2nd floor of the center mass and likes Ms. Thornewill's idea of making it the main focus; the right mass should be more like the left with a single door and flanking double-hung windows.</p> <p>Pohl – Sounds like door with double hung on the left is best.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

4. NHA Macy Warehouse 07-4199 12 Straight Wharf Unapproved LK doors 42.3.1/138 Linda Williams

Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill		
Alternates	None		
Recused	None		
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.		
Representing	Linda Williams Edward Rudd, Nantucket Historic Association (NHA) Scott Andersen, contractor		
Public	None		
Concerns (1:47)	<p>Williams – The diagonal interior pieces were added to stabilize the doors; the diagonal pieces were put on the outside of the rear doors; reviewed historical photos of the entry, without barn doors. Asserts the glass doors are technically interior doors and not in HDC’s jurisdiction. There are no other 501 C3 museums on Main Street so no precedent would be set.</p> <p>Backus – She has further information; this is an individually-significant, 1846 structure with a preservation restriction held by Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC); this was reviewed by MHC. She spoke to MHC; they reviewed this, and it meets the Secretary of the Interior standards; however, they expressed concern for setting a precedent and are supportive of an alternative idea with a more traditional door system for this prominent location within the old historic district (OHD).</p> <p>Rudd – The NHA regrets the belated application and apologizes. Reviewed the work involved in the renovations. The slant-board panels were holding water and rotting the doors; vertical boards make the water shed straight down. Also, we wanted to have as much daylight as possible to minimize the need for interior lighting. The new doors are already starting to grey out.</p> <p>Andersen – The glass doors are not part of the historic fabric but necessary to meet the energy code; the intent was an invisible gateway into the building. The prior doors were made of sugar pine from the Northwest and historically would have been very hard to get; we wanted to use wood indigenous to New England. Every cut and bored hole made during the renovation was documented and photographed for MHC.</p> <p>Thornewill – Through history, the doors have always been about the function of the building; for her the glass doors are appropriate because it speaks to its use now as a museum. The glass doors might have been pushed in a little farther. She’s more concerned about the knotty-pine, wooden doors, which are glaring; a more quality look might have been appropriate or painted red; she doesn’t know if a false weathering process would work or if they should be left alone.</p> <p>Oliver – The solution to weather or paint the doors is fine. Her concern is the glass; there are plenty of houses with wood French doors that are HVAC compliant. No one has brought up the subject of a penalty for unpermitted work.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Oliver. The doors can be weathered or painted. The glass is insulting; there are different answers to the problem. She was sitting on this two years ago when we gave permission to work on the roof and windows; we did not approve the ramp as constructed and it was never corrected. To her the glass doors look like a supermarket; this should be redone in a more traditional way, and you shouldn’t be able to see through to the back.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Not responding.</p> <p>Pohl – Regarding the glass doors, he’s been in 12th century buildings all over Europe that make this building look brand new, and they have glass doors for thermal control. Also, it is now a museum. Agrees about the missteps taken on the ramp but doesn’t want to tie that up with the NHA, since Public Works did that. The old doors had grayed out; the same will happen to these; a muriatic bath could speed the process; he would not recommend painting these doors. The larger issue is the glass. Asked this be put at the top of Tuesday’s agenda.</p>		
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and to come back Tuesday. (Oliver)		
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye; McLaughlin no vote, not responding	Certificate #	HDC2021-07-4199

V. NEW BUSINESS 08/17/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Whale’s End II, LLC 08-4369	43 Squam Road	Rev. 06-4031: addition	13/24	M Cutone Archit
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Doug Mills, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:24)	<p>Mills – Presented project.</p> <p>Thornewill – South elevation, reduce the number of windows.</p> <p>Coombs – This is nice and low. Agrees about reducing the connector windows to normal 2-over-2.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with what’s been said.</p> <p>Welch – Concurr.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south elevation 4 windows reduced to 2 hinged doors in the connector piece. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-08-4369		

Proposed HDC Minutes for August 26, 2021

Rest held for Tuesday, August 31

2.	NFI Realty Tr 08-4368	169 Eel Point Road	Pool	33/5	M Cutone Archit
3.	Mark Cannan 08-4324	12 Waquoit Road	Garage/Cottage	89/10	Thornewill Dsgn
4.	Mark Cannan 08-4326	12 Waquoit Road	Pool/Hardscape	89/10	Thornewill Dsgn
5.	North Mill, LLC 08-4338	Lot A – Birdsong Lane	New dwelling	55.4.4/80.1	Thornewill Dsgn
6.	Carl Nielsen 08-4359	50 Wanoma Way	Raise hse / new foundation	92.4/244	Thornewill Dsgn
7.	Conway Family Tr 08-4328	11 Western Avenue	New dwelling	87/117	Val Oliver Design
8.	Scott Sampson 08-4375	14 Aurora Way	New dwelling	56/445	Val Oliver Design
9.	Susan Doughan 08-4330	134 Main Street	Rev. 2406: drvway/hrdscape	41-37.1	Gryphon Arch
10.	Tom McCann	78 Milk Street	Rev. 1386: pool location	56/6.1	Linda Williams
11.	Roy Weeden	9 Twin Street	Demo cottage	55.4.1/71	Linda Williams
12.	Roy Weeden	9 Twin Street	New dwelling	55.4.1/71	Linda Williams
13.	Don Dimock	59 Bartlett Road	Add porch roof	66/99.1	Linda Williams
14.	NHA	89 A-B Bartlett Road	Change roof overhang	66/410	Linda Williams
15.	4 E Lincoln, LLC 08-4340	4 East Lincoln Avenue	Add Stair & Door	42.4.1/49	NAG
16.	Acked, LLC	18 B Bartlett Road	Move Building	67/113.1	Petro Zlatev
17.	One Chester Smiley, LLC 08-4347	1 Chester Street	Window/door changes	42.4.3/18	Normand Resid
18.	Andrew Reger 08-4349	7 East Lincoln Avenue	Add Roofwalk, clarify color	42.4.1/8	Emeritus
19.	Liz Norris 08-4363	14 Lowell Place	Rev 2188; window change	41/164	Emeritus
20.	NIR Retail, LLC 08-4362	27 Old South Wharf	Add Dormer	42.2.4/2	Emeritus
21.	Slacktide Development	111 Surfside Road	Pool/Hardscape	80/70	KM Designs
22.	Michael Raso 08-4350	82 Center Street	L-K Window Replacement	42.43/62	Self
23.	Michael Raso 08-4351	82 Center Street	Fence- As Built fee	42.43/62	Self
24.	Dan Displacido 08-4375	20 Goldfinch Drive	New dwelling	68/689	Val Oliver Design
25.	Nantucket Develop 08-4370	9 Hydrangea Lane	New dwelling	73/94	Val Oliver Design
26.	Michael Jemison 08-4378	195C Hummock Pond Rd	Change roof, add stairs	65/23.2	Botticelli + Pohl
27.	Nant 62 Walsh, LLC 08-4379	62 Walsh Street	Rev. 05-3618: wnds/roof	29/85 + 85.2	Botticelli + Pohl
28.	12 Pitman, LLC 08-4385	12 Pitman Road	Storage barn	73.4.1/17	Patrick Levesque
29.	Allen Dewing 08-4483	74 Milk Street	Addition to barn	56/6.1	Linda Williams
30.	Allen Dewing	74 Milk Street	Addition	56/6.1	Linda Williams
31.	Back 41, LLC 08-4381	105 Tom Nevers Road	Rev. 03-3154: deck/balcony	91/25	CWA
32.	Engle Kristen Trust 08-4382	88 Pocomo Road	Beach stairs	15/42	CWA
33.	Cannonbury Hldgs, LLC 08-4383	18 Cannonbury Lane	Rev. 04-3380: fenestration	74/13	CWA
34.	Whitney A Gifford Tr 08-4384	6 Lily Street	Rev. 02-2977: shed drmr	42.3.4/45	CWA
35.	John Myntinen	10A Old Tom Nevers Rd	Window replacement	75/57	Jeff Mackinnon

VI. OLD BUSINESS 08/24/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	G2 Bunker Hill, LLC 06-4101	7 Bunker Hill Road	Pool and hardscape	73.4.2/39	Topham Design
2.	90 N. Liberty Pres. Trst 07-4195	90 North Liberty Street	New foundation	41/22	Botticelli & Pohl
3.	Salvator Lentini 06-4052	20 Field Avenue	Pool	80/149	CWA
4.	High Tide Partners, LLC 07-4115	8 Ackermuck Way Lot 2	Garage	41/618	BPC
5.	Jim Ikard 05-3833	1 Bloom Street	Addition	42.3.3/140	Emeritus
6.	Trogoh Nom. Trust 05-3640	26 Easy Street	Mixed use structure	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
7.	Craig Majernik 07-4240	63 Burnell Street	New main house	49.3.2/1.1	Workshop APD
8.	Craig Majernik 07-4241	63 Burnell Street	New garage/studio	49.3.2/1.1	Workshop APD
9.	Kristine Amendolare 05-3625	8 Bank Street Sias	Additions	72.1.3/69	Angus Macleod
10.	Westmoor Club, LLC 07-4189	105 West Chester Street	Tennis/pickleball courts	41/805	JGG Architects

VII. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	August 12, 17, & 19, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, August 31, 2021 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:30 p.m. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

