



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver, Stephen Welch,
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday June 30, 2022

Conference Room, 2 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 1:10 pm. and announcements by Ms. Camp

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist; Adrian Rodriguez, Administrative Specialist; Nicky Sheriff, Administrative Specialist

Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill

Remote Participants: Coombs, Camp, Thornewill

Absent Members: Dutra,

Late Arrivals: Pohl 1:11 pm, Welch, 1:32 pm

Early Departures: Oliver, 2:22 pm

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0

I. COMMISSION COMMENTS

1. None

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

1. None

V. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Andrew Vorce	40a Essex Road	Fence	67-324	Andrew Vorce
2. Andrew Vorce	40a Essex Road	Shed	67-324	Andrew Vorce
3. Andrew Vorce	40a Essex Road	Outdoor shower	67-324	Andrew Vorce

Voting Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch

Alternates Dutra, Thornewill

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, Carrie, Oliver, and Pohl-aye

Certificate # **HDC2022-(as noted)**

XII. NEWBUSINESS 06/07/2022

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Sankaty, LLC 06-6439	49 Sankaty Road	New dwelling	49/66	Dustin Maury
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Dustin Maury			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:14)	<p>Maury – Presented project and context per SAB concerns.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments 6/27: lot line to lot line with massing of a large wall; monolithic for ‘Sconset and too suburban; shingle-style porch okay. Abutter suggested dropping roof line 1’. SAB asked to see revisions. Proposed infill. Most photos are non-contributing; this side of Sankaty-Baxter are infill non-contributing. Nice design but is lot-line to lot-line. The 2/2 windows are contemporary but found in that area.</p> <p>Camp – Agree lot-line to lot line; should be reduced by bringing in additive massing on the sides; the additive massing roof line should be brought down at least 2’ to give the main mass more prominence. Front elevation dormers should be shed. Likes the shingle-style porch. The driveway takes up the whole front of the house and isn’t appropriate for the house and street; parking should stay on the right in front of garage. The 1st-floor windows don’t relate to the openings in the porch; that makes the porch look like an afterthought; they should align with the 2nd-floor windows. A chimney might help break up the long roof line, even if it is a faux chimney.</p> <p>Coombs – They said it was an eclectic façade. It’s too large and formal for ‘Sconset. North and south sides should drop down; there’s no additive massing. The porch is too heavy and not in keeping with the area. Lacks proper additive massing. Agree about lot-line to lot-line. We should consider the garage and that parking and garage equal the footprint of the house.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agree about the side masses; the full height of the supporting side pieces is inappropriate and need to come down. Likes the porch but the pitch is a little low making it top heavy. This reads as a big wall.</p> <p>Oliver – The context photos indicate they are all lot-line to lot-line so for her that is irrelevant. The wings should drop a little. Likes the shingle-style porch.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees the 1.5-story main mass with 2-story wings is not appropriate. Likes the idea of the small gable dormers going to sheds. Likes the porch. Lot-line to lot-line is a misnomer; this is setback to setback. The roof ridge is very long.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and to go back to SAB. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Carrie, Oliver, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
2. Jay Maroney 06-6453	29 Rhode Island	Shed	60.3.1/132	Jay Maroney
3. Jay Maroney 06-6454	29 Rhode Island	Deck	60.3.1/132	Jay Maroney
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Jay Maroney			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:23)	(1:23) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye			
	Maroney – Asked what the concerns were.			
	Coombs – MAB said they had no concerns.			
	Pohl – Mr. Welch will look to see if these are consentable.			
Motion	Held for Tuesday			
Roll-call Vote	N/A		Certificate #	
4. Biff Faberia 05-6416	58 Walsh Street	Roof material change	29/97	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:33)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 6/13: Roof shingles should be red cedar. Wallaba shingles are not appropriate on Nantucket; they are deep red in color and could take years to turn grey. Homeowners may be tempted to treat them to retain the red color.</p> <p>Welch – He’d be concerned of the proposed material.</p> <p>Coombs – She doesn’t think this is a good location to experiment with this material; it will make a big statement.</p> <p>Camp – She’s okay with it.</p> <p>Oliver – She’s also okay with it.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve based upon the fact based upon testimony given and that this is a test case. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2022-05-6416

5.	Jamie Kaplan 06-6440	6 Joy Street	Hardscape	55.4.4/32.2	Elaine Johnson
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:41)	Backus – This was previously held for July 5 th .				
Motion	No action at this time.				
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #	
6.	Jody & Robert Newman 05-6415	6 Topping Lift	Garage studio	66/308	SCI
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:42)	Newman – Presented project. Solar will be under a separate application. Oliver – No concerns. Camp – Hoped for the roof to break more; it's pitch should be less. Coombs – The spiral stairs are visible on the south, west, and east and might be visible. The west elevation broke-back roof might be visible. If the height could come down 1', that would be nice. Welch – Need to take a foot out of the height; that would address the broke back looking tall over the doors. Also, address the south elevation height between the doors and the 2 nd -floor porch. Ceiling height could be reduced to bring the overall height down.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the height to be 24'6". (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Camp, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye; Welch-nay			Certificate #	HDC2022-05-6415
7.	Melissa Kreiser 06-6444	89 Washington Street	Front hse trim color chng	55.1.4/81	Melissa Kreiser
8.	Melissa Kreiser 06-6513	89 Washington Street	Back hse trim color chng	55.1.4/81	Melissa Kreiser
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:53)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
9.	T & M Montgomery 06-6447	33 North Liberty Street	Outdoor shower/arbor	41/157	Thomas/ Margaret
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:54)	Backus – Proposed arbor and outdoor shower with a landscaping pad in front of the door. Infill in the old historic district (OHD). The outdoor shower should be simplified; it might be visible from the street. Read HSAB comments 6/27: The front shingled railing should remain. The side porch brackets should change to vertical posts; the left bracket may actually interfere with head height for the stairs. It would be preferable to have the back stair in a less visible location. Coombs – Okay with the arbor. The shower looks like a closet; it's too formal. Camp – No concerns. Oliver – There is a significant hedge screening the shower and it will weather in; no concerns. Welch – Not inappropriate.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-06-6447

10. Rubinstein-Bistany 05-6400	51 Tennessee Avenue	New main dwelling	59.4/202	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:01)	<p>Meerbergen – Presented project; his client wants to keep as much natural vegetation as possible</p> <p>Backus – Read MAB comments 6/27: Length and complicated roof planes as seen from Tennessee; being “lot-line to lot-line” is inappropriate; less than 2’ drop from the left corner to the street. Height should not exceed 25’. Dormer extensions too long; pull end walls back. Door in connector has different head height. Panes in front door don’t track with the windows. South elevation, remove barn board. With the connector to the other structure, it looks like one very long building.</p> <p>Oliver – The connector is her only concern; suggested approving without that and reapply once the house is framed in. The free-standing fireplace is a concern but might not be visible.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees about the very large outdoor fireplace; it should be inside or simplified. Should avoid it’s running setback-to-setback; there is no precedence for that in that area of Madaket. The architecture is appropriate.</p> <p>Coombs – Okay with the building. Agrees with Ms. Oliver about not having the connector until it’s all framed in. Agrees about the concern it runs setback to setback.</p> <p>Welch – He keeps hearing commissioners say, “I like it.” Wishes people would refer to the guidelines and not likes and dislikes; this is an issue of legal tenability. Explained why he has no concerns with this running setback to setback. Agrees about the west elevation dormer. He has some concerns about the freestanding fireplace; it should be held until the structure is framed in.</p> <p>Pohl – Likes the connector. Suggested removing the fireplace until it’s framed up. Front elevation the left dormer could be smaller.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation center dormer be shortened 1’ to 1.5’ and the connector and chimney to be brought back before us once the house is framed up. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Oliver, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye; Camp-nay		Certificate #	HDC2022-05-6400
	Rest held for Tuesday, July 5 th .			

11. Rubinstein-Bistany 05-6402	51 Tennessee Avenue	New garage	59.4/202	Brook Meerbergen
12. Rubinstein-Bistany 05-6401	51 Tennessee Avenue	New pool & deck	59.4/202	Brook Meerbergen
13. Okay Okay Café, LLC 06-6449	15 Washington Street	Addition	42.3.1/99	BPC
14. Ack Tack LLC 06-6434	19 Bishops Rise	Secondary dwelling	40/31.3	Chris Hall Architects
15. Auburn Cottage, LLC 06-6463	46 Easton Street	MH add/renovation	42.4.1/22	Botticelli + Pohl
16. 44 Monomoy, LLC 06-6451	44 Monomoy Road	New garage/studio	54/72	WAPD

XIII. OLD BUSINESS 06/14/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Lions Foot, LLC 03-5844	9 Sherburne Way	MH move off or demo	30/37	Topham Designs
2. Ocean Dojo, LLC 03-5847	20 Bartlett Farm Road	Pool & hardscape	65/76	Atlantic Landscaping
3. Bishop Rise, LLC 01-5597	20B Bishop Rise Road	Garage/cottage	40/127	Topham Designs
4. The Iren Hollo 05-6268	31 Low Beach Road	Add/move on site	74/36	Botticelli + Pohl
5. Juraj Bencat 03-5957	15 Wappossett Circle	Solar roof array	67/571	ACK Smart
6. Arline Bartlett 12-5454	21 Pleasant Street	Windows, doors, sm add	55.4.1/1	LINK
7. Amenda & Kevin Jacobs 04-6226	4 Rays Court	Addition & historical reno.	42.3.2/3	Design Assoc. Inc.

58XIV. NEW BUSINESS 06/21/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Cornell French	35 Main Street (Sias)	Porch rails change	73.3.1/7	Normand Residential
2. Sam Phelan	65 Pleasant Street	New fence	55/36.2	Sam Phelan
3. 18 Sherburne TP Nominee Tr	18 Sherburne Turnpike	New dwelling	30/196	S. Metz
4. Anna & Daniel Day	7 Bayberry Lane	New dwelling	67/61 (lot A)	Val Oliver
5. Lisa Dobue Holby	19 Low Beach Road	2 nd dwelling	74/83	Val Oliver
6. 308 Madaket Rd, LLC	308 Madaket Road	Addition	60.2.1/67	EMDA
7. Elizabeth Dorn	23 Front Street	Roof chng (3 tab – Arch)	73.1.3/92	James Lydon
8. 4.5 Cathcart, LLC	4.5 Cathcart Road	Demo roof walk	54/82	David Nagys
9. Hospital Thrift Shop Inc	17 India Street	Deck removable bridge	42.3.1/117	EMDA
10. Charles Dermody	11 Hydrangea Lane	New shed	73/93	Structures Unlimited
11. Jim & Cindy Helfrich	37 Fair Street	Alter & add covered porch	42.3.2/212	Emeritus
12. Richmond Great Point Pt	1 Violet Place	New commercial building	68/340	KOH
13. Richmond Great Point Pt	2 Violet Place	New commercial building	68/340	KOH
14. Richmond Great Point Pt	3 Violet Place	New commercial building	68/340	KOH
15. Julia Morash	18½ Gray Avenue	New cottage	67/183.1	Thornewill Design
16. Cailen Casey	77 Sparks Avenue	Hardscape & driveway	55/138.1	Cailen Casey
17. Jennifer Dobue Cheul	1 Stone Post Way	Garage/apartment	74/82	Val Oliver
18. 26 Pine Crest, LLC	26 Pine Crest Lane	New dwelling	68/426	EMDA

Proposed HDC Minutes for June 28, 2022

19.	18 Center St, LLC	18 Center Street (Sias)	Addition & raise roof	73.1.3/105	Twig Perkins
20.	Susan O'Malley	10 New Mill Street	New deck	59.4.4/9	Boris Nikolov
21.	Susan O'Malley	10 New Mill Street	Fence	59.4.4/9	Boris Nikolov
22.	Horchow & Routman	33 Cliff Road	MH fenest, ramp, dormer	42.4.4/5	CWA
23.	Horchow & Routman	33 Cliff Road	Guest house: addtn/fenest	42.4.4/5	CWA
24.	Horchow & Routman	33 Cliff Road	Garage	42.4.4/5	CWA
25.	Clarke Browne	23 Ocean Avenue	Addition	73.3.1/19	Angus Macleod
26.	India & Rose Tr	28 India Street	Rev. 02-5776: fenestration	42.3.4/108	Botticelli + Pohl
27.	Frank Rovinski	33 Main Street (Sias)	Reno/alteration	73.4.2/34	Emeritus
28.	Chicken Box	12 Dave Street (Bldg. 1)	New dwelling	55/158	Emeritus
29.	Chicken Box	12 Dave Street (Bldg. 2)	New dwelling	55/158	Emeritus
30.	Glidden	24 Rugged Road	Move off dwelling	67/164	Emeritus
31.	HMSW, LLC	25 Sankaty Head Road	MH addition/demolition	48/3	Emeritus
32.	HMSW, LLC	25 Sankaty Head Road	New shed	48/3	Emeritus
33.	Guy Wisinski	13 Arkansas Avenue	Solar roof array	59.4/158	Ack Smart
34.	Sergey & Yuliya Chumak	8 Parson Lane	New pool/cabana	75/97	WAPD
35.	Ack N Back, LLC	33 Quidnet Road	Move off/demo	21/27.2	WAPD
36.	Ack N Back, LLC	33 Quidnet Road	Primary dwelling	21/27.2-27.4	WAPD
37.	Ack N Back, LLC	33 Quidnet Road	Garage studio	21/27.4	WAPD
38.	Ack N Back, LLC	33 Quidnet Road	Pool cabana	21/27.4	WAPD
39.	Nantucket Shire, LLC	30 Dukes Road	New dwelling	56/189	Linda Williams
40.	Nantucket Shire, LLC	30 Dukes Road	Move shed & addition	56/189	Linda Williams

XIV. OLD BUSINESS 06/28/2022

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	Lindsay Matthews 03-5955	37 West Chester Street	Addition	41/150	NAG
2.	Milestone Property M.	28A Evergreen Way	Guest House	68/713.2	BPC
3.	Maple Lane, LLC	Maple Lane Lot 1	New Dwelling	67/303	Val Oliver/ Maury
4.	Pocomo 53 Trust 05-6289	53 Pocomo Road	Main House	15/17	Mellows & Paladino
5.	Pocomo 53 Trust 05-6291	53 Pocomo Road	Guest House	15/17	Mellows & Paladino
6.	31 Western Ave, LLC 05-6312	31 Western Avenue	Pergola & Hardscape	87/94	Ahern
7.	Victor Haley 03-5943	94 Orange Street	Addition	55.4.4/47	Paul Dreher
8.	K225, LLC	126 Main Street	Renovation	42.3.2/98	Linda Williams
9.	Mike Romano 05-6245	55 Easton Street	Addition	42.4.1/68	Shelter 7
10.	Erik Gersten 03-6027	25 India Street	Skylight	42.3.4/106	Linda Williams
11.	High Tide Partners, LLC 04-6196	26 Douglas Way	New dwelling	39/41	BPC
12.	High Tide Partners, LLC 04-6198	26 Douglas Way	Garage	39/41	BPC
13.	High Tide Partners, LLC 04-6173	26 Douglas Way	Gazebo	39/41	BPC
14.	High Tide Partners, LLC 04-6172	26 Douglas Way	Shed	39/41	BPC
15.	High Tide Partners, LLC 04-6197	26 Douglas Way	Pool	39/41	BPC
16.	450 Green Park, LLC 11-5272	2 Stone Alley	Addtn, alter. & foundation	42.3.1/103	Emeritus
17.	17 Ranger Rd, LLC	17 Ranger Road	New garage	39/28	LINK
18.	ACK 71 Orange St, LLC	71 Orange Street	New garage	55.4.1/167	LINK
19.	High Cliff Trust 04-6202	11 East Hallowell Lane	Mh addition & renovation	30/17	Botticelli + Pohl
20.	High Cliff Trust 04-6191	11 East Hallowell Lane	New garage	30/17	Botticelli + Pohl
21.	Stark Point, LLC 04-6118	16 Easton Street	New dwelling	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
22.	Nant. 62 Walsh St, LLC 04-3608	62 Walsh Street	Rev 12-2551: siding change	29/85	Botticelli + Pohl
23.	32 Hulbert Trust 11-5220	32 Hulbert Avenue	New dwelling	29/72	Botticelli + Pohl
24.	Sarah Murphy 05-6351	Maple Lane Lot 4	New Dwelling	67/303	Emeritus
25.	Sarah Murphy 05-6380	Maple Lane Lot 4	New Guest house	67/303	Emeritus
26.	John Wise 05-6346	10 Starbuck Road	New shed	59.3/62	Emeritus
27.	Jeffrey Greenberg 05-6381	30 Orange Street	New stoop & rev roofwalk	42.3.2/176	Emeritus

XV. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Motion	
Roll-call vote	
Review Minutes	June 21 & 23, 2022
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, June 5th @ 5:00 pm Hybrid – Zoom @ 4 Fairgrounds Rd, Community Room • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions

- | |
|---|
| • Discussion of options for house moves |
|---|

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:30 pm. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 4-0//Camp, Carrie, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

PROPOSED