



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, June 15, 2021

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Community Room – 5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:05 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill
Remote attendance: Coombs, Camp, Thornewill
Absent Members: Dutra
Late Arrivals: Thornewill, 5:37 p.m.
Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Oliver)**

Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, and Oliver-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	6 Gull Island, LLC 06-3998	6 Gull Island	Historic determination	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
2.	Town of Nantucket 06-3997	4 Western Avenue	Outdoor walk-in refrigerator	87/60	Abigail Shaw
3.	Kathleen Schatz 06-3990	8 Swain Street	As-built shed	42.4.1/82.1	Self
4.	Carl Nielsen 06-3995	15 Bassett Road	Rev. 69715: chimney/vents	26/59	Chris Carey
5.	Peter Kaizer 06-3996	6 Nobadeer Avenue	Grge move on fm 24 Woodbine	80/37.2	Self

Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch

Alternates None

Recused Pohl

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Welch)**

Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, and Coombs-aye

Certificate # **HDC2021-06-(as noted)**

III. CONSENT WITH CONDNTIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Thomas Wynn 06-3991	10 Moors End Lane	Pool/deck/pergola	43/214	Ahern, LLC
			• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity		
2.	Michael Schulder 06-3992	33 Nonantum Avenue	Shed	87/49	Jardins Intl
			• Due to lack of visibility		

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver

Alternates Welch

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No additional concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

Certificate # **HDC2021-06-(as noted)**

IV. SIGNS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Nant Land Bank	168 Hummock Pond Road	Informational Kiosk	65/13.2	Sustainable Nant.
2. Nant Land Bank	168 Hummock Pond Road	Quarter board sign	65/13.2	Sustainable Nant.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	Flynn – Items 1 & 2 approvable per SAC comments			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per SAC comments. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-06-
3. Sheila Egan	35 Old South Road	Projecting sign	68/6.4	Clay Twombly
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	Flynn – This is approvable.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-06-
4. Pearl Street Realty Trust	4 India Street	Rev. 3433: add brass edging	42.3.1/169	LINK
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	Flynn – No action was taken on this.			
Motion	No action taken			
Vote	N/A		Certificate #	
5. Nant Hist Assn.	15 Broad Street	Temporary banner	42.4.2/61	Ashley Santos
6. Nant Hist Assn.	15 Broad Street	Temporary banner	42.4.2/61	Ashley Santos
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	Flynn – Items 5 & 6 were held for revisions.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

V. NEW BUSINESS (05/18/21)

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Village Way R.T. 05-3782	6 Village Way	New dwelling	14/42	Workshop APD
2. 37 Pocomo Road RT 05-3813	37 Pocomo Road	Cabana	14/38	Workshop/APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:10)	These Items were not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold Items 1 & 2 for representation. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

3.	11 India Street, LLC 05-3816	11 India Street	Fence	42.3.1/122.2	Ahern
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:10)	<p>Ahern – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments from 5/24: posts should be wood with caps; proposed hedging and fence won't conceal the transformer year-round.</p> <p>Camp – Originally, she liked the idea of granite posts, but it's a strange addition to the picket fence; would prefer wood posts and a gate.</p> <p>Oliver – She was not in favor of them on Centre Street and not in favor of them now. Agrees with HSAB.</p> <p>Coombs – Also agrees with wood.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Okay with wood posts.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the end posts to be wood with cap. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3816	
4.	Cannonbury Lane Part 05-3817	14 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	74/11	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:16)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #		
5.	Cannonbury Lane Part 05-3788	14 Cannonbury Lane	Pool & harscape	74/11	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:16)	<p>Ahern – Presented project; pool equipment is at the rear, enclosed in a fence.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: No concerns.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3788	
6.	Gifford A Whitney Trst 05-3818	6 Lily Street	Fenst. Change & otdr shower	42.3.4/45	CWA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:19)	<p>Webster – Presented project; main house was approved with Green Mountain wood-clad windows, we would be willing to clarify as true-divided light (TDL) on both structures; white sash & trim.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments from 5/24: all windows should be TDL. My comments: south elevation door should be 9-light; okay with 4-light in gable going to 6-light; east elevation windows should be same size as existing; west elevation, question if it's visible.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with HSAB in term of the TDLs at least on the east and south elevations. Not sure 3 windows on the street is unnecessary; should be 9-light French doors.</p> <p>Coombs – Asked why the main house was approved with Green Mountain windows. Wood siding on the outdoor shower should be vertical.</p> <p>Camp – Likes the earlier form of 2 windows on the east elevation. The shower siding should be vertical.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The 15-light door isn't typical but not visible.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the shower siding to be vertical board and windows to be TDL. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3818	

7.	8 Walsh, LLC	05-3819	8 Walsh Street	Addition, rplc wndws	42.4.1/83	B. Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver					
Alternates	Welch					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Brook Meerbergen					
Public	None					
Concerns (5:30)	<p>Meerbergen – Presented project; the west elevation Nr. 4 3-light window copies an existing window on the north elevation; he'll change the west elevation Nr. 4 window.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments from 5/24: north elevation, should have definitive break in sidewall between old and new; reuse existing windows when possible. This is “Quiet Corner” circa 1920.</p> <p>Camp – North elevation addition eave should be dropped away from the main mass.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Camp.</p> <p>Oliver – Doesn't think the addition will be visible.</p> <p>McLaughlin – West elevation 2nd-floor right 3-light window looks like a skylight and is inappropriate.</p> <p>Pohl – The head height of the window in the rear is 6.5; to drop it more, would require dormers. Appreciates the simplicity; the roof and eave are already low, and dormers would increase the complexity of the house. Feels visibility is limited.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with Nr. 4 west elevation 3-light window to be a Nr. 10. (Oliver)					
Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye; Camp-abstain			Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3819	
8.	Barry + Robert Ang	05-3821	11 Jonathan Way	New dwelling	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver					
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Nathan McMullen, Nathan McMullen Associates					
Public	None					
Concerns (5:45)	<p>McMullen – The building envelope limited due to wetlands; read Conservation Commission Order of Conditions. Presented project. Will provide more information on the roofing material.</p> <p>Camp – Given all the restrictions and the area, this is very formal, more like Main Street.</p> <p>Coombs – Too busy and too formal; shouldn't have a roof walk or the half-round windows. This needs to be simplified.</p> <p>Oliver – In terms of massing, it's scaled with the other buildings in the area. She shares the concerns about the complexity and formality of it. There are plenty of half-rounds in the area but no roof walks. Asked about the brand of asphalt tiles.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Front door should be a typical Nantucket front door; the 15-light doors over the front door should be windows. North elevation, the 15-light doors are atypical.</p> <p>Pohl – For an approval, we need concessions on the degree of formality. South elevation, suggested continuing the eave and eliminating the a-frame with the half-round window.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)					
Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #		
9.	Barry + Robert Ang	05-3822	11 Jonathan Way	Cottage	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver					
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Nathan McMullen, Nathan McMullen Associates					
Public	None					
Concerns (6:02)	<p>McMullen – Presented project; shutters are folded.</p> <p>Camp – It's a nice design but she can't imagine this out there; it's just not simple enough.</p> <p>Coombs – Shutters don't cover the windows when closed; too many windows. It's too tall for a cottage; should be kept under 22'. Balcony brackets are too fancy. Should be very simple. This has no front door and it needs one. East elevation, the circular window and ganged windows are too busy.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Round window is highly inappropriate. Visibility will be from Tom Nevers Pond and the road. North elevation gable pitches should be 7/12. Cupola should be eliminated. No arched brackets; should be straight, 45 degrees. This has no front door.</p> <p>Oliver – This needs to be simplified; massing is fine. South elevation is very complicated but is not visible.</p> <p>Pohl – Simplification and eliminate the cupola.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)					
Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #		

10. Barry + Robert Ang	05-3823	11 Jonathan Way	Shed	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen, Nathan McMullen Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:12)	McMullen – Presented project. Camp – No concerns. Coombs – Eliminate the cupola; too tall. McLaughlin – Cupola should be eliminated; it's highly inappropriate on this structure. Oliver – She has no comments.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff without the cupola. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3824
11. Barry + Robert Ang	05-3824	11 Jonathan Way	Pool and hardscape	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen, Nathan McMullen Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:17)	McMullen – Presented project; pool has an autocover. Oliver – We don't have information on materials or what the firepit and steps look like. McLaughlin – No comments. Camp – She's okay with it. Coombs – Doesn't see any vegetation to screen it. Agrees with Ms. Oliver.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for some revisions and further information. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
12. Beach Not, LLC	05-3827	16 Cannonbury Lane	Pool and hardscape	74/12	JGG Architects
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:24)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
13. 103 Main Street, LLC	05-3829	103 Main Street	Gate	42.3.3/153	Atlantic Lndscpng
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lindsay Congleton, Atlantic Landscaping Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:25)	Congleton – As-built granite posts with chain. Backus – Read HSAB comments from 5/24: rope or chain fences are not appropriate for Main Street; posts should be wood; screen air conditioning unit (A/C). Oliver – Agrees about the rolling-fence gate. Camp – Also agrees about a gate. Coombs – Stone posts shouldn't be there; agrees with a gate. McLaughlin – The granite posts are highly inappropriate in this location. Pohl – Suggested approving the rolling gate.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a Type II rolling-fence gate. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3829

14. Steven J. Renehan Tr 05-3830	24 Stone Post Way	Pool and hardscape	73.3.2/68	Atlantic Lndscpng
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Lindsay Congleton, Atlantic Landscaping Inc.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:31)	<p>Congleton – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: the pool won't be visible but there is too much proposed hardscaping.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with SAB, reduce the hardscaping.</p> <p>Coombs – The hardscaping shouldn't run side-line to side-line.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Everything seems appropriate and there won't be any visibility.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with SAB and Ms. Coombs.</p> <p>Pohl – Doesn't think any of this will be visible.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south side conversation and fire pit area pulled back even to the stepping stone path, per Exhibit A. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 3-0//McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye; Coombs and Camp-abstain		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3830
15. 38 Prospect, LLC 05-3831	38 Prospect – Lot 29	Spa/hardscape	54.4.4/56	Mark Lombardi
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	Anne Lingeman Davis, 15 Mill Street Patricia Beilman, 17 Mill Street			
Concerns (6:39)	<p>Williams – Presented project; the retaining wall allows the raised spa to be below the surrounding grade.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments from 5/24: 10X10 is a small swimming pool and shouldn't be allowed in the old historic district (OHD); spa should be flush with grade; privet hedge is insufficient to screen visibility year round; bluestone patios should be avoided in the OHD; brick is more traditional.</p> <p>Flynn – Read into the record a letter of objections from Marjie Kargman of 8 Mill Street.</p> <p>Davis – This proposal is in what she argues to be a historically significant landscape. She's concerned about the precedent of allowing a spa in an historic neighborhood because of all the inappropriate stuff that goes with it: mechanicals, lights, water jets, speakers. The dense suburban screening needed to hide this is incongruent with the rural open neighborhood.</p> <p>Beilman – The HSAB recommendation that this is inappropriate is irrefutable. There will be 9 other lots that could also ask for spas if this is approved. This is visible from Prospect and North Mill Streets.</p> <p>Camp – Suggested driveway take a turn to allow for more landscaping in front of the spa. Not in favor of a shell drive in this area. There are 2 privet hedges along Prospect Street so okay with that but doesn't like the corral effect. Doesn't support the spa because it's not sufficiently screened and will be visible in the winter. There is too much bluestone.</p> <p>Coombs – This proposal has nothing to do with any of the streetscapes in the area; this is a hotel-type treatment. The spa should be denied; the retaining walls and fieldstone are inappropriate.</p> <p>Welch – The raised spa is a concern; we shouldn't discuss plant material, it isn't appropriate to do so. This is an important area. The bluestone won't be visible. We have shell drives all around the Island, so he has no concerns with that.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Asked staff to investigate the meeting rails on the house dormers. No comments on the spa.</p> <p>Pohl – We can discuss vegetation to the extent it is year-round screening; privet isn't an evergreen. Agrees with Ms. Camp's observation that the driveway shouldn't go straight in. Agrees walling off with privet is not in keeping with the area. There is a substantial grade change proposed; he'd like to see a north-south cross section through the spa and and east-west cross section through the driveway and spa. Agrees the extent of paving is way too formal for the area.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and more information. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

16. Greg Raiff 05-3832	100 Low Beach Road	Rev. 10-2182: hardscaping	75/27	Bernice Wahler
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	Camp took a break			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Bernice Wahler			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:04)	<p>Wahler – Presented project; the pool has an autocover.</p> <p>Oliver – This modification has greatly opened up the lot from what it was before with more pavers; there was a lot of natural vegetation before.</p> <p>Thornewill – The squares and rectangles are hard; it was more natural looking before.</p> <p>Coombs – The privet is out of character with this area; it had more natural vegetation before.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The plans are very clear.</p> <p>Pohl – In comparing the approval with this, some formal elements have been added. The approved parking was very casual and fit the area. The terrace added next to the spa isn't natural.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
17. Jim Ikard 05-3833	1 Bloom Street	Addition	42.3.3/140	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	Camp still on break			
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:17)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; east elevation, want to increase the size of windows on the secondary mass.</p> <p>Backus – Individually significant from 1727. Read HSAB comments from 5/24: existing is simple; proposed is complicated and competes with the main mass; roof walk is too large; front door surround should be simplified; addition is too large and overwhelms existing and should be pushed back and reduced in scale. The age of the additive ell should be indicated. While there is a photo of a roof walk from the 1970s, there wasn't one originally.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with much HSAB said. Okay with the roof walk. Agrees the massing overwhelms the existing. The additive massing should be more subservient; suggested pushing the south-elevation gable back.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees with HSAB; the original shouldn't be touched. The roof walk is too large for this house. Existing east elevation, asked if the right chimney is being removed. This should be simpler, so the old house stands out.</p> <p>Welch – East elevation, the left addition proportion is an important aspect; it doesn't follow a story. The south elevation is primarily visible from at least an oblique angle; that is an aspect that should be retained. Roof walk is too wide. Agrees with much that's been said.</p> <p>McLaughlin – East elevation, the 9-light windows are inappropriate and should be 6-over-6.</p> <p>Pohl – Most of his comments have been made. He'd like to see something less formal and simpler. The proposed chimney should be smaller.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
18. Jim Helfrich 05-3834	37 Fair Street	Addition/alteration	42.3.2/212	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	Camp took a break			
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:32)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; circa 1830s</p> <p>Backus – This is a typical Nantucket half house, circa 1820s; the roof walk is large but is documented by Clay Lancaster. Read HSAB comments from 5/24: rear side-turned gable presenting eave to the back is very uncharacteristic and awkward; rear additions should telescope down with consistent ridge orientation; 4-unit French doors should be changed to door window combo; foundation should be lime mortar; roof walk skirt on back only might be noticeable; basement window "G" panes too square.</p> <p>McLaughlin – East elevation right shed roof has a 3/12 pitch, 4/12 is the minimum; too much glass in the front door.</p> <p>Coombs – East elevation, the right steps to the porch, asked if they and the deck are set back (set back). North elevation, the 4 French doors should be two doors and 2 windows.</p> <p>Thornewill – Overall, it's a good job. Clarified the demolition plan.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with much that's been said. The rear addition is wider than the main mass; it should rebate in. The French doors on the north elevation are too much.</p> <p>Pohl – The rear gable terminus should go straight back.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

19. Earret, LLC 05-3836	6A Morey Lane	New dwelling	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	Oliver took a break			
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	Chris Staudt, 6 Morey Lane Caroline Cook Buechle, 8 Morey Lane Charles Cruice, 5 Morey Lane Marianne Hanley, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP, for 8 Morey Lane Robin Ried, 6 Morey Lane Elizabeth Shaw, 8 Morey Lane			
Concerns (7:50)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; visibility of the 1st floor is minimal.</p> <p>Backus – Infill structure; there is a historic barn on the property. Read SAB comments: unprecedented and threatens the existing nature of Morey Lane and ‘Sconset village; too large, overall height is too much and should have more 1-story elements; architectural language unrelated to the barn; this design needs to be appropriate to the location.</p> <p>Staudt – This property is in the core of ‘Sconset’s OHD. This lot is highly visible from Morey Lane. Given the sensitive location, any building here warrants a hard look at the context. The proposed is grossly out of scale, awkwardly placed on the lot, and not in keeping with Morey Lane. This would be the single most massive building, 63% larger and the longest roof line and takes up 25% of the lot. As proposed, this and the structure at 6 Morey Lane would read as a 106’ single building.</p> <p>Cook Buechle – Mr. Stout covered most of our concerns. South of 8 Morey Lane is Lily Street and the Underhill Cottages; that part of the village has a pastoral feel with structures limited to 1 story; this is a complete contrast to that feel.</p> <p>Cruice – Agrees with his neighbors. He’s on the board of the ‘Sconset Trust and they are very concerned about how this will fit into historic ‘Sconset.</p> <p>Hanley – Confirmed they will be doing a landscaping plan showing the driveway. Asked the dimensions of the proposed garage (15’) and if there will be living space over the garage (no). There’s been talk about removing the barn; asked if there will be an application for a second dwelling or any ancillary construction (don’t know at this time).</p> <p>Camp – She’s concerned about the barn being moved off. This is too large in scale for the neighborhood and too tall. The massing of the main gable is more in keeping with Baxter Road. It goes lot line to lot line in an area where houses have a lot of groundcover around them. As someone said, this is monolithic.</p> <p>Welch – His over-arching comment is this has to be dramatically simplified in respect to dormers and gables; this is a density more in keeping with Evelyn or Pochick Street. If it’s going to be dense, it needs to be simple. Lot line to lot line is probably not appropriate; it needs to be designed sensitive to the setting.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North elevation, the 1st floor has too much glass; left dormer should have a 4/12 pitch minimum; the windows above the dormer should be double hung. South elevation, eliminate the two middle windows on the 1st floor. West elevation, 2nd-floor windows should be double hung.</p> <p>Coombs – This has no appeal. It fills the lot. Chimney is huge and should be corbelled lower. Too many windows.</p> <p>Pohl – The west elevation turns a shoulder to Morey Lane showing a massive chimney with no entry. Agrees with what’s been said about the mass. Not a fan of the double gable.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
20. John Berry 05-3837	22 Eel Point Road	Demo/move off	40/45	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, and, historic documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:21)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; not of a significant age or architectural value.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move off/demo. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3837

21. John Berry	05-3838	22 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	40/45	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	James Houlihan, 28 Swift Rock Road				
Concerns (8:23)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project.</p> <p>Houlihan – His main concern is the raising of the grade to the detriment of the adjoining lots and placing the structure very high relative to the neighboring houses. The lot is currently flat, and grade should remain unchanged.</p> <p>Oliver – She wants a benchmark for the current grade and topography. The house is acceptable; but she doesn't like the steep 14/12 pitch; it's an introduction of an atypical feature.</p> <p>Coombs – North elevation, the front door needs more trim to stand out. She doesn't want to see the lot filled.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with Ms. Oliver about the 14/12 roof pitch; would prefer height be lowered to a more shingle style. The 1st-floor windows look high off the ground. Would prefer the massing be staggered back.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North elevation, the front door should be an appropriate style.</p> <p>Pohl – There's been a lot of discussion about grading; he's concerned that there is no information on the current versus proposed grade. The 14/12 pitch in an area of low vegetation makes this pop out of the landscaping. East elevation, the right most gable is overly vertical in a horizontal landscape.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and topo and site information. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
22. Bill Burke	05-3839	54 Pochick Avenue	Revisions & addition	79/128	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:42)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The front door should be a 6-panel door.</p> <p>No others have concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation front door to be a 6-panel door. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3839
23. Doug Meyer	05-3841	18 Gardner Road	New dwelling	43/135	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:50)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; thinks a viewing is warranted; topography change is indicated on the plans; the existing structure has been approved for removal.</p> <p>Oliver – We need the elevations identified, the 1st-floor elevation, cross sections, and benchmarks.</p> <p>Coombs – She knows this site; the 1st-floor of the existing was well above the road. They will have to work around the topography; wants to see a topographical map.</p> <p>Camp – Wants to view with ridge poles. She wants to ensure it's in scale with the area.</p> <p>McLaughlin – South elevation, the French doors with transoms are inappropriate. West elevation has a 3/12 pitch should be 4/12 minimum. North elevation, the front door should be a typical Nantucket front door. North elevation, the 3-light windows should be 3-over-3. Eliminate the cupola.</p> <p>Pohl – The topography isn't reconciled; we don't know if it goes up or down with almost 8' of grade change front to back. West elevation sits on almost all fill.</p>				
Motion	Motion to View with height poles at either end of the main ridge and Hold for revisions and more topographical information. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl			Certificate #	

24. Doug Meyer 05-3840	18 Gardner Road	Garage	43/135	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (9:02)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main house. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

Rest held for Thursday, June 17th.

25. Darrell Ferguson 05-3842	28 Main Street, Sias	Rev. 2856: cupola + pergola	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
26. Eric Kraeutler 05-3843	35 New Street	Move off/demo	73.4.2/42	Botticelli + Pohl
27. Eric Kraeutler 05-3844	35 New Street	New dwelling	73.4.2/42	Botticelli + Pohl
28. Okay Okay House, LLC 06-3934	10 Union Street	Rev. 2342: door change	42.3.1/43	BPC
29. Hannah Gardner House 05-3845	6 Gull Island Lane	Revise bldg size + alterations	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
30. NISDA 05-3846	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
31. NISDA 05-3847	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
32. NISDA 05-3848	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
33. William Scannell 05-3849	119R Eel Point Road	Rev. 2446: cupola revs	33/17.1	BPC
34. Sweet Meadow Sylvia Ln 05-3851	74 West Chester Street	Hardscape	41/478	NAG
35. Kingfisher Realty Trust 05-3719	278 Polpis Road	Rev. 2488: relocate on site	25/2	Gryphon Arch

VI. OLD BUSINESS (05/25/21)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Mary Claus Trustee 04-3405	31 Low Beach Road	New dwelling	74/36	Botticelli + Pohl
2.	Anehialine Prop. 04-3327	19 East Creek Road	Addition	55/60	BPC
3.	38 Prospect, LLC 03-3070	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New main house	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
4.	38 Prospect, LLC 03-3099	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New 2 nd dwelling	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
5.	38 Prospect, LLC 02-3037	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Water feature	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
6.	38 Prospect, LLC 02-3094	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Shed	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
7.	Tim Demasi 04-3424	3 Gladlands Ave	New dwelling	80/234	Emeritus
8.	Josh Gregg 05-3714	2 Sandplain Drive	Pool and hardscape	68/356	Swim Pool&Dsgn
9.	David Berson-Lacey 04-3382	6 Hedge Row	Dormer + shed addition	73.3.2/87	SM Roethke
10.	Cannonbury Holding 04-3380	18 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	71/13	Chip Webster
11.	Jennifer Silva 04-3381	14 Harborview Way	Lift, addition & roofwalk	42.4.1/26	Thornewill Dsgn
12.	Sam Aloisi 05-3620	19 Quaker Road	New dwelling	41/42	Thornewill Dsgn
13.	Brian Franz 04-3609	10-12 Cannonbury Lane	Pool	74/9 + 10	Ahern LLC
14.	Diedre Hamlin Trust 02-2951	6 Lowell Place	Addition	41/167	Topham Design
15.	Gary Creem 04-3603	6 + 8 Hydrangea Lane	Addition	73/87 + 88	Val Oliver Design
16.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC 04-3600	4 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/702	Val Oliver Design
17.	3 Waterview, LLC 04-3613	3 Waterview Drive	New dwelling	76/117.1	Linda Williams
18.	3 Waterview, LLC 04-3594	3 Waterview Drive	Pool and hardscape	76/117.1	Linda Williams
19.	Stephanie Basile 04-3602	8 New Mill	Garage/apartment	42.3.3/33.2	Linda Williams
20.	Kristina Amendolare 05-3625	8 Bank Street	Addition	73.1.3/69	Angus Macleod
21.	Mark Finnegan 05-3623	36 Warren's Landing	Gazebo/cabana	38/44	BPC
22.	Mark Finnegan 05-3624	36 Warren's Landing	Pool	38/44	BPC

VII. NEW BUSINESS (06/07/2021)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Josh Morash 05-3885	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot A	Move/demo	67/72	Val Oliver Design
2.	Josh Morash 05-3886	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot A	New dwelling	67/72	Val Oliver Design
3.	Jeff Morash 05-3881	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot B	New dwelling w/ garage	67/72	Val Oliver Design
4.	Laurence Goode 05-3887	10 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/705	Val Oliver Design
5.	Lawrence Conway 05-3891	167 Surfside Road	New dwelling	87/118	Val Oliver Design
6.	Local Buoy Props. 05-3890	39 Beach Grass Road	New duplex	66/368	Val Oliver Design
7.	Linda Towne 05-3884	5 Evergreen Way – Lot B	New dwelling	68/726	Val Oliver Design
8.	Jacob Martinson 05-3883	16 West York Lane	New dwelling	55/8.2	Val Oliver Design
9.	Diane Catino Et al 05-3892	11 D Street	New dwelling	60/2.1	E McMorrow
10.	Tomaiolo Development 05-3901	3 Raceway Drive	Move off/demo	66/281	E McMorrow
11.	3 Raceway Drive, LLC 06-3964	3 Raceway Drive	New dwelling	66/281	Sophie Metz
12.	Town of Nantucket 05-3897	58 Bunker Road	New metal shop building	78/119	S.M. Roethke
13.	Hatcreek Cattle Co. 05-3898	15 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	68/394	Karsten Reinemo
14.	Patti Duester 05-3876	13 Monomoy Road	As built deer fence	54/198	Self

Proposed HDC Minutes for June 15, 2021

15. Magnus Nicolin 06-3957	6 Brier Patch Road	Rooftop solar	21/136	Karen Alence
16. Robert Meyer Jr. 06-3961	307 Polpis Road	Renovate barn	25/39	CWA
17. 5 Sherburne Way, LLC 06-3958	5 Sherburne Way	New guest house	30/38	Botticelli & Pohl
18. Kristen Engle Trust 06-3979	90 Pocomo Road	Pool and hardscape	15/43	CWA
19. Howard + Holt _____	10 Bayberry Lane	Addition	67/71	Newman Inc.
20. Oliver Carr 06-3954	84 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30/74.1	Robert Newman
21. Robert Newman 06-3972	6 Topping Lift Road	Addition/garage	66/308	Robert Newman
22. Downyflake Inc 06-3974	14 West Creek Road	Commercial building	55/175	Robert Newman
23. Downyflake Inc 06-3971	14 West Creek Road	Rooftop solar array	55/175	Robert Newman
24. Stuart Whitlock 06-3965	101 Orange Street	As built fence	55.1.4/17	Self
25. 17 Lincoln Realty Trust 06-3968	17 Lincoln Circle	Pool and hardscape	30/18	Ben Champoux
26. Gary Winn 06-3960	25 North Water Street	Window replacement	42.4.2/2.1	Linda Williams
27. Peter Dupont 06-3963	47 Millbrook Road	New dwelling	56/231	E McMorrow
28. Tim Quinlisk 06-3962	88 Quidnet Road	Rev. 0793:	21/109	Botticelli + Pohl
29. Thomas Rhodes II Trst 06-3932	125 Main Street	New dwelling	42.3.3/49	Gryphon Arch
30. Tim Vieth 06-3912	3 Gladlands Avenue	Pool and hardscape	88/234	Atlantic Landscap
31. Aileen Newquist 06-3911	29 Main Street	Pool and hardscape	73.3.1/9	Atlantic Landscap
32. Rhack, LLC 06-3909	20 Sherburne Turnpike	Pool and hardscape	30/195	Atlantic Landscap
33. Brian Nester 06-3908	4 East Lincoln Avenue	Pool and hardscape	42.4.1/49	Atlantic Landscap
34. 41 Beach Grass, LLC 06-3953	41 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	68/367	Val Oliver Design
35. 43 Beach Grass, LLC 06-3952	43 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	66/358	Val Oliver Design
36. John Barry 06-3956	22 Eel Point Road	New guest house	40/45	Emeritus
37. John Barry 06-3955	22 Eel Point Road	New garage	40/45	Emeritus
38. Barbara Henderson 06-3981	6A Silver Street	Spa and hardscape	55.4.1/184.1	Waterscapes
39. Thomas Wynn Trst 06-3966	10 Moors End Lane	Addition	43/214	Studio Ppark

VIII. OLD BUSINESS (06/15/2021)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Peter Garren 04-3615	36 Pocomo Road	2 nd dwelling/garage	14/79	NAG
2.	Eliza Silva 04-3391	16 Helen's Drive	Rooftop solar	66/53	ACK Smart
3.	Jennifer Khoury 05-3768	27 West Chester Street	Spa	42.3.4/2	David Troast
4.	Westmoor Club 05-3636	109 West Chester Street	Dorm A	41/805	JGG Architects
5.	Westmoor Club 05-3637	105 West Chester Street	Dorm B	41/805	JGG Architects
6.	Carol Anne Surface 04-3605	47 Warren's Landing	New dwelling	38/34	BPC
7.	Carol Anne Surface 04-3606	47 Warren's Landing	Studio	38/34	BPC
8.	Carol Anne Surface 04-3607	47 Warren's Landing	Pool	38/34	BPC
9.	14 MVR LLC 04-3420	14 Madequecham Valley Rd	New dwelling	89/13	Emeritus
10.	Frederick Hahn 05-3797	50 Eel Point Road	Pool and hardscape	32/25.1	Atlantic Lndscap
11.	Zero India Street 03-3268	1 Cambridge Street	Addition	42.3.1/150.2	Emeritus
12.	One Folger Road, LLC 05-3642	1 Folger Road	Studio	30/195.1	Studio Ppark

IX. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes Motion Vote	June 3, 2021 Motion to Approve. (Coombs) Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye
Review Minutes	June 7, 2021
Other Business Motion Vote	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Thursday, June 17, 2021 at 1:00 p.m. 2 Fairgrounds Road, Conference Room • HDC Meeting Schedule Update • Sign Advisory Council's updated construction signs and site guidelines vote. • Motion to Endorse the SAC construction signs and site guidelines. (Oliver) • Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye • Coastal Resilience Plan Virtual Open House #2, June 24, 2021, 6-8pm. Registration to attend: https://www.eventbrite.com/e/nantucket-coastal-resilience-plan-open-house-2-tickets-154033750093 • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed
2. Construction Signs and Site Guidelines

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 9:05. (Camp)**
Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board Madaket Advisory Board Sign Advisory Council

