



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, April 22, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill
Absent Members: Dutra
Late Arrivals: McLaughlin, 1:16 p.m.
Early Departures: McLaughlin, 1:39 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Oliver, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. William Sherry 04-3	7 Wappossett Circle	Outdoor shower	67/565	Linda Williams
2. William Norris 04-3	5 Jeans Way	Deck/walkdown	67/875	Linda Williams
3. William Norris 04-3	5 Jeans Way	Fence	67/875	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, Camp, Oliver, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-04-(as noted)

III. DISCUSSION: ALTERNATIVE ROOF SHINGLES & GREY SHINGLES IN THE OHD/SOHD

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch
Alternates Thornewill
Public None
Concerns (1:05) **Welch** – Reviewed the comparison of alternative manufacturer, GAF, to approved shingles. GAF Fox Hollow could be a good option for the OHD, which doesn't have an approvable grey shingle.
Pohl – He thinks the Fox Hollow GAF is acceptable for the OHD.
Motion **Motion to Approve GAF Pewter Gray for use in the OHD/SOHD. (Welch)**
Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye
Motion **Motion to Approve GAF Fox Hollow for use in OHD/SOHD. (Welch)**
Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye
Motion **Motion to Approve GAF Charcoal for use in OHD/SOHD. (Welch)**
Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp Coombs, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye
Motion **Motion to Approve GAF Weathered Wood for use in OHD/SOHD. (Welch)**
Roll-call Vote Carried 4-1//Coombs, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye; Camp-nay

IV. OLD BUSINESS (03/30/21)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	3 Mary Ann Drive, LLC 01-2772	3 Mary Ann Drive	Rev. 71596: garage door	68/214	M. Cutone Arch.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and color chart.				
Representing	Doug Mills, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	Terry Norton, 5B Mary Ann Drive				
Concerns (1:16)	<p>Mills – Reviewed the application; there had been a question about color; the doors are installed; trim is natural to weather, windows white, people doors black.</p> <p>Flynn – Ms. Norton asked that an approval include the requirement that the paint be maintained.</p> <p>Camp – Likes the Terra Bronze with the color pallet; okay with the Desert Tan if it doesn't read as tan.</p> <p>Coombs – Likes Nantucket gray to go with the doors.</p> <p>Oliver – She'd prefer a color darker than Nantucket gray.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Terra Bronze seems more suitable.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the garage doors to be Terra Bronze. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried /5-0/Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-01-2772
2.	7 Starbuck Court, LLC 01-2818	7 Starbuck Court	Rev 1451: raise/new fndtn	42.3.3/80	M. Cutone Arch.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Doug Mills, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:23)	<p>Mills – Reviewed additional information provided per previous comments.</p> <p>Flynn – HSAB didn't review the revisions. Staff comments: this is a significant structure; should use lime mortar.</p> <p>Coombs – The lime mortar joints make a difference and makes it look more aged. Likes the pointing in the 19 Pleasant Street photo.</p> <p>Camp – Likes the Barrington red ¼" lime mortar.</p> <p>Oliver & Thornewill agree with Ms. Camp.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the S&H red Barrington brick and ¼" lime mortar. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-01-2818
3.	EBWC, LLC 02-2972	4 Lincoln Avenue	Garage	30/151	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:29)	<p>Botticelli – This was held to track; reviewed changes made per previous comments.</p> <p>Camp – No concerns.</p> <p>Thornewill – The dormers from the side are a little overwhelming but cute straight on.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2972
4.	4EW, LLC 02-3055	4 Ellen's Way	New dwelling	81/171	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:33)	<p>Meerbergen – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Camp – Appreciates the streetscape; this relates well with the rest of the neighborhood.</p> <p>Coombs – Appreciates the changes; this will fit in.</p> <p>Thornewill – No concerns.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No response.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; McLaughlin no vote			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-3055

5.	4EW, LLC 02-3054	4 Ellen's Way	Garage/studio	81/171	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	(McLaughlin lost connection)				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:39)	<p>Meerbergen – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Coombs – This is appropriate.</p> <p>Thornewill – South elevation, there's something bothersome; suggested a pent roof above the garage doors; the main roof slope makes the sidewalls look expansive.</p> <p>Camp – South elevation, the garage door windows are a little large; some pattern in the garage-door panels would help; this is visible from the street and should relate to the main house. North elevation, the overhead door is unusual but not visible.</p> <p>Welch – South elevation, agrees with Ms. Thornewill about the roof pitch; it might help if the dormer roofs go to a steeper pitch; agrees about a 1st-story element over the doors.</p> <p>Pohl – The 2-light windows in the garage doors is very contemporary; suggested they should be 6-lights</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a pent roof over the garage doors, the garage door windows to be 6-lights; and vertical V-grooves in the garage door panels. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-02-3054	
6.	4EW, LLC 02-3052	4 Ellen's Way	Pool and hardscape	81/171	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	(McLaughlin lost connection)				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:47)	<p>Meerbergen – There are pools each side of this lot; the buildings and middle fence will screen the view; it backs onto subdivision open land; the site is about a foot above the road; around the back, the fence is black wire in vegetation.</p> <p>Camp – It would look nice if the pool fence between the structures were vegetated on the roadside.</p> <p>Coombs – It would be good if the vegetation is a native evergreen; this is an informal area.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees with what's been said about the vegetation along the rear.</p> <p>Welch – He's okay with the board fence; a cross between a Nantucket plant that is sheerable and a native Nantucket evergreen is Leatherleaf Viburnum.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the addition of more informal planting to be in place at time of inspecting and in perpetuity. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-02-3052	
7.	Paul Piccirillo 10-2053	6 Baltimore Road	New dwelling	60/106	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design				
Public	Paul Piccirillo, owner				
Concerns (1:56)	<p>Oliver – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; natural to weather, grey, and black color pallet, not white.</p> <p>Camp – Her main concern was its size; it's not that much larger than the existing.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted including color change. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-10-2053	

V. NEW BUSINESS (04/06/21)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Philip Nowak 04-3489	32 New Street	Chimney/metal roof	73.4.2/30	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	G. Philip Nowak				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:13)	(1:59) Flynn – This came from a failed HDC inspection; they placed a metal roof and changed the chimney to brick. It was part of a historic determination in 2019 along with a stovepipe. Pohl – That is very surprising; we shouldn't move forward with it at this time. Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp) Carried //Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Pohl-aye Nowak – The original roof on the historic house was metal and worn. We replaced with a similar roof; Jim Lydon told us that the pitch was such that we couldn't shingle the roof. We attached photos in our file showing the original metal roof; it had been tar papered and shingled over. Mr. Lydon submitted a letter of approved metal-roofed houses he's worked on. Backus – SAB did not review this. Coombs – SAB should look at this before we review this.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for SAB review. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0// Oliver, Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
2.	JE Heron Trustee 04-3325	56 Washington Street	As-built A/C units	42.2.3/11	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	JE Heron, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:02)	Flynn – Also flagged as done without approval; the air-conditioning units (A/C) in the gable was flagged by the inspector. Heron – The A/C has been in place at least 20 years; the door has been pink from at least 1945; we had louvers made to cover the A/C. Backus – Read HSAB comments from April 5: proposed gable-end vent sticks out 6"; should be flush. Camp – If you were to push it back as far as possible and clad the A/C in natural-to-weather wood, it would blend in; could use a trellis to screen the ground-level A/C. Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Camp. Oliver – The Google Earth photo doesn't show the gable A/C but does show the pink door. Welch – He recalls the pink door as Nantucket red faded out. The gable A/C doesn't show in his photo and isn't consistent with our guidelines. Pohl – You can't see the ground-level A/C. These have been here quite a while. He's okay with the proposed solutions.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the pink door remaining' the gable A/C set back at least 4" and covered with the louvered panel' and the ground-level A/C covered with the louvered panel and plants. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-2//Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; Welch and Oliver-ay			Certificate #	HDC2021-04-3325
3.	David Lazowski 04-3410	18 Parson Lane	New 2 nd dwelling	75/102	M. Cutone Arch.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Doug Mills, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:19)	Mills – Presented project; existing vegetation along the road will remain; compared to the main house, this is small. Camp – We can't see the 3-car garage; however, the vegetation should be maintained in perpetuity. Coombs – Architecturally, the only problem is the roof on the west elevation. Oliver – As a second dwelling, it doesn't have a front door; it reads more like a 56'-long cabana. The stairwell railing is horizontal, which is an anomaly; asked for shingled railing. Hopes we can't see the back. Thornewill – Won't be visible. Suggested shingling the whole wall along the stairs so there isn't a large concrete wall. It's a good idea of using the slope for the garage and won't be visible.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the east elevation stair railing and concrete wall below to be shingled. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-04-3410

4. David Lazowski 04-3411	18 Parson Lane	Hardscaping	75/102	M. Cutone Arch.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Doug Mills, Mark Cutone Architecture			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:30)	Mills – Presented project; retaining will wrap around to the back of the building. Camp – The vegetation needs to be maintained in perpetuity. Coombs – Agrees; maybe we should hold for information on the retaining wall. Oliver – It seems there is 7' retaining along the driveway; asked about that.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information and revisions. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #

Rest held for April 27.

5. Barbara Maier 04-3406	24 Union Street	Driveway/apron/fence	42.3.2/177	NAG
6. Kim Wentworth 04-3408	14 Lincoln Avenue	Pool-hardscape	30/182	M. Cutone Arch.
7. Cannonbury Holdings, LLC 04-3380	18 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	71/13	CWA
8. EBWC, LLC 04-3395	4 Lincoln Avenue	New studio	30/151	Botticelli & Pohl
9. Richard Hohlt 04-3384	121 Madaket Road	Pool-spa	40/60.1	Botticelli & Pohl
10. John Confalone Trst 04-3414	30 Cliff Road	Driveway and hardscape	42.4.4/36	Val Oliver Design
11. Mary Claus Trustee 04-3405	31 Low Beach Road	New dwelling	74/36	Botticelli & Pohl
12. 36 Lily Street LLC 04-3401	36 Lily Street	Relocate studio on lot	42.4.3/94	Botticelli & Pohl
13. 36 Lily Street LLC 04-3416	36 Lily Street	New dwelling	42.4.3/94	Botticelli & Pohl
14. Anehialine Prop LLC 04-3327	19 East Creek Road	Addition	55/60	BPC
15. William Scannell 04-3396	119R Eel Point Road	Rev. 2760: fenst + omit deck	33/17.1	BPC
16. William Scannell 04-3400	119R Eel Point Road	Cabana/gazebo	33/17.1	BPC
17. ACK Mimi LLC 04-3413	58 Wauwinet Road	Garage	14/65	NAG
18. Eugene Clapp 04-3388	42 Cliff Road	Addition + fenestration	42.4.4/40	Normand Resid.
19. Tonya Capaldo 04-3392	19 Union Street	Rev 12-2411 add + fenest	42.3.2/136	Topham Design
20. Beach Vibes LLC 04-3393	9 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	74/28	Workshop APD
21. Beach Vibes LLC 04-3397	9 Cannonbury Lane	Garage	74/28	Workshop APD
22. Beach Vibes LLC 04-3398	9 Cannonbury Lane	Shed	74/28	Workshop APD
23. Nelson Eldridge 04-3402	2 Eldridge Lane	Roof top solar	49/77	Freedom Frvr,LLC
24. MAG Ventures 04-3419	30 Devon Street	Garage	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
25. MAG Ventures 04-3418	30 Devon Street	Cabana/otdr shr/pergola	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
26. Eliza Silva 04-3391	16 Helen's Drive	Rooftop solar	66/53	ACK Smart
27. Jennifer Silva 04-3381	14 Harbor View Way	Addition	42.4.1/26	Thornewill Design
28. Daniel Omstead 04-3378	9 Quaise Pasture - MH	Rev. 2441: cupola/brzwy	26/20.1	SMRD
29. Daniel Omstead 04-3377	9 Quaise Pasture - Cottage	Rev 12-2439 porch chng	26/20.1	SMRD
30. Thomas Keegan 04-3330	41B Cliff Road	Addition	29/40	JB Studio
31. Thomas Keegan 04-3329	41B Cliff Road	Cabana	29/40	JB Studio
32. Thomas Keegan 04-3328	41B Cliff Road	Pool and hardscape	29/40	JB Studio
33. Mark Norris 04-3415	14A Lowell Place	Cottage-resite/additions	41/164	Williams/Emeritus
34. Peter Taylor 04-3394	98 Main Street	A/C units and fence	42.3.3/111	Linda Williams
35. 14 MVR LLC 04-3420	14 Madequecham Valley Rd	New dwelling	89/13	Emeritus
36. Tim Demasi 04-3424	3 Gladlands Avenue	New dwelling	80/234	Emeritus
37. Deidre Hamling 04-3425	8 Lowell Place	Demo building	41/508	Topham Design
38. David Berson 04-3382	6 Hedge Row	Dormer + shed addition	73.3.2/87	SMRD
39. KMC Ventures LLC 04-3488	34 Morey Lane	Garage renovations	73.3.2/60	Paulin Vitanov

VI. OLD BUSINESS (04/20/21)

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Chris Loftus 03-3092	8 1/2 Evergreen Way	New dwelling	68/703	Linda Williams
2. Sharon Hubbard 02-2943	28 Dukes Road	Pool and hardscape	56/190	Waterscapes
3. 10 Easy St NT 03-3089	10 Easy Street	Window changes	42.3.1/78	NAG
4. 38 Prospect LLC 03-3070	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New main house	55.4.4/80.1	Brook Meerbergen
5. 38 Prospect LLC 03-3099	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New 2 nd dwelling	55.4.4/80.1	Brook Meerbergen
6. 38 Prospect LLC 03-3094	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Shed	55.4.4/80.1	Brook Meerbergen
7. 38 Prospect LLC 03-3037	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Water feature	55.4.4/80.1	Brook Meerbergen
8. MAG Ventures 03-3168	30 Devon Street	MH new dwelling	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
9. MAG Ventures 03-3252	30 Devon Street	GH new dwelling	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
10. MAG Ventures 03-3169	30 Devon Street	Pool	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
11. Justin Brooks 03-3112	15 Correia Lane	New dwelling	80/56	Val Oliver Design

Proposed HDC Minutes for April 22, 2021

12. Justin Brooks 03-3113	15 Correia Lane	New garage/studio	80/56	Val Oliver Design
13. Nathan Cressman 03-3280	7 Weetamo Road	Addition/alteration	15/48	BPC
14. James Wilson 03-3211	1 Appleton Road	Rooftop Solar	66/388	ACK Smart
15. Stuart Hendrin 02-2941	43 Kendrick Street	New Dwelling	76.4.3/31	CWA
16. Stuart Hendrin 02-2942	43 Kendrick Street	Garage	76.4.3/31	CWA
17. Karen Urban 03-3216	33 Main St, Sias	Pool	73.4.2/34	David Troast
18. Gordon C. Russell 02-2898	3 School Street	Adtn, rfwlk, clpbrd	42.3.2/125	Flavin Architects
19. Gordon C. Russell 02-2976	3 School Street	Hardscape	42.3.2/125	Flavin Architects

VII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	April 6 & 15, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Old Business Thursday 04/22/21 at 01:00 pm • Discussion of Resilient Nantucket meeting • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Approvable Roof Shingle Color guideline
2. Alternative Roof Shingle selections
3. Draft HDC minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:36 p.m. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board Madaket Advisory Board

