



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, April 21, 2022

Conference Room, 2 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 1:00 pm. and announcements by Ms. Camp

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
 Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs
 Remote Participants: Coombs
 Absent Members: Oliver, Welch, Dutra, Thornewill
 Late Arrivals: Pohl, 1:02 pm
 Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 4-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Wendy Perkins 04-6086	11 Stone Barn	Roof replacement to 3-tab	29/907	Stegra Corp
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2022-04-6086

II. OLD BUSINESS 03/22/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Olsen Family 12-5425	28 Prospect Street	New Dwelling	55.4.4/77	Val Oliver
Voting	Camp (acting chair), McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:04)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

III. NEW BUSINESS 03/29/2022

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Soren Sorensen 03-5929	51 Fair Street	Changing Paint Color	42.3.2/40	Soren Sorensen
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Soren Sorensen, owner			
Public	Mary Bergman, Executive Director Nantucket Preservation Trust (NPT)			
Concerns (1:04)	<p>Sorenson – Presented project; white trim and grey clapboard; this was not originally a Victorian but was made so in 1990s</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 3/28: Victorians traditionally had an imaginative color scheme. Grey and white is disappointing and not appropriate for this style. The exact color should be identified.</p> <p>Circa 1930; the original renovation replicated the original colors.</p> <p>Camp – Though this is a “pseudo-Victorian”, she wants there to be contrast between the grey and white; suggested a darker grey with white trim.</p> <p>Coombs – 26 Fair Street took us a long time and we conceded to the chosen colors. This would be better with white clapboard and darker trim; she wants to see that more Victorian treatment.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The color scheme is typical; he has no concerns.</p> <p>Bergman – This was built by Charles Robinson in the 1870s; when Rick and Valerie Norton restored the house, they did an analysis of the paint and found historically it was dark green and turquoise.</p> <p>Pohl – He’d be okay with white trim and Platinum grey trim. He thinks that at some point the original Victorian trim was removed then replaced when the Nortons renovated it.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for more historic information. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
2. HMSW, LLC 03-6007	25 Sankaty Head	Demo/Addtn/Fenes. chg	48/3	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:23)	MacEachern – Presented project.			
Motion	No concerns.			
Roll-call Vote	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)		Certificate #	HDC2022-03-6007
3. 6 Old Westmoor Farm, LLC 03-6024	6 Old Westmoor Farm	Add Cupola and Siding	41/82.1	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:29)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; vertical siding to be natural to weather.</p> <p>Camp – The cupola seems “scrawny” and could be enlarged 1’ by drawing out 6” in width and height.</p> <p>Coombs – She looks at this like a barn, but the windows aren’t barn-like. She likes the cupola, but the windows don’t go with it.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Should eliminate the transoms over the north elevation windows. West elevation, the front door is atypical. The cupola is inappropriate.</p> <p>Pohl – The changes won’t be visible from a public way and are benign anyway. The vertical siding is to be natural to weather.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the cupola to be wider and taller 6” to 1’. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2022-03-6024

4. Jennifer Fraizer	03-6025	Maple Lane (Lot 9)	Front Porch	67/303	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:40)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; a subdivision plan would be helpful.</p> <p>Camp – North elevation right, the shed dormers being different sizes is odd but breaks up it's being too symmetrical.</p> <p>Coombs – It looks very long. North elevation, the right most dormer cheek walls should be reduced.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The number of porch posts is excessive, and they are very heavy.</p> <p>Pohl – Porch to porch it is 81'2". Agrees with Ms. Coombs about reducing the width of the north elevation right dormer. The porches ground this house.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation right dormer side cheeks being reduced. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-03-6025
5. OHOM, LLC	03-6026	28 Main Street (Sconset)	Gate	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:50)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; could reduce the horizontal and crossbuck members by 1".</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments 3/28: prefer simpler design; too ornate for house and setting. Main structure is circa 1820. Agrees with SAB that it's too ornate; recommend taking a cue from historic photos.</p> <p>Camp – She doesn't mind it. Asked if the lion in the center is actually part of the proposal (yes).</p> <p>Coombs – Okay with this as proposed or make it with 4 solid rectangle panels. Doesn't think the lion will be visible.</p> <p>McLaughlin – This should be a very simple gate.</p> <p>Pohl – This whole gate appears to be 3.5" to 4" deep and will appear thicker than a normal gate. The edges of the open circle at the top will break off very easily. He'd like to see some simplification. He doesn't like the lion.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
6. 31 Western Ave, LLC	03-5991	31 Western Avenue	Hostel: fenst, stirs, ramp	87/94	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	Mary Bergman, Executive Director NPT				
Concerns (1:59)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project. Charles Robinson design, circa 1874; NPT holds a deed restriction against any significant changes outside and inside.</p> <p>Bergman – We've reviewed this and find the proposed changes approvable by the Secretary of Interior standards.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 4/4: Regarding the proposed new ramps, HSAB had differing opinions on what is more important historically – to either maintain the existing front steep boat ramp and add the required side ramps vs. eliminate some of the side ramps for less clutter and make the front boardwalk and boat ramp the appropriate pitch for wheelchair access. It would be helpful to see other options for providing access to both doors. If the side ramps remain, low, simple landscaping might conceal the elevated sides. Regarding the proposed changes to the front door, the original door had diagonal boards with no X-bracing - diagonal boards should be shown; the transom-in-the-door approach is unusual, and it should either be a fixed transom with shorter doors or full-height doors of a consistent pattern. HSAB had differing opinions on whether multi-paned French doors are appropriate vs. frameless sheet glass; perhaps more options could be provided. Asked how it will look with the storm doors closed. HSAB would like to see revisions. Lifesaving building built 1874 designed by Charles Robinson. Read into the record NPT's letter, which was received today; recommend their requirements outlined in the letter be met before approval.</p> <p>Coombs – There was a lot of discussion at HSAB about the double ramps along the right side being excessive and unnecessary. The proposed French doors will change the façade; the storm doors should not be changed.</p> <p>Camp – Reducing the ramp would be great. Agrees the original storm doors with diagonal V-groove should remain and the large French doors with transoms above are odd and overly large.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Okay with changes to the stairs. No concerns with the ramp. The outer front doors should rebuild exactly as what's there.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees about the front door array; the French doors should be normal sized with actual transoms.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and to go back to HSAB. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

7. 31 Western Ave, LLC **03-6006** 31 Western Avenue Cabin 87/94 Emeritus
 Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development
 Public Mary Bergman, Executive Director NPT
 Concerns (2:21) **MacEachern** – Presented project, circa 1938; existing east elevation door is not original.
Bergman – This not part of the grouping of historic buildings so is exempt from the deed restriction. The changes are in keeping with the rest of the campus.
Backus – Read HSAB comments 4/4: Triple-ganged window should be changed to double.
 Circa 1930-1950, contributing. Agrees with HSAB.
Coombs – Agrees the east elevation triple-ganged windows should be reduced to either 2 spaced or mulled as the other windows on the structure.
Camp – Agrees.
McLaughlin – Appreciates the proposed changes.
 Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the east triple-ganged unit changed to double ganged. (McLaughlin)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2022-03-6006**
8. 31 Western Ave, LLC **03-5988** 31 Western Avenue Dorm exterior stairs 87/94 Emeritus
 Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development
 Public Mary Bergman, Executive Director NPT
 Concerns (1:27) **MacEachern** – Presented project; could make changes per HSAB comments. The condensers will be part of the landscape plan.
Bergman – NPT thinks this is approvable.
Backus – Read HSAB comments 4/4: Other options should be considered to tuck the exterior stair back closer to the building. Asked if there is an application to demolish the small chicken coop/shed its history. Asked if there are any proposed changes to building #3. All new hardware should be muted in color and finish – not polished or lacquered. This was formerly a barn circa 1900 to 1920. The demolition of the chicken coop needs to be applied for.
Camp – No concerns.
Coombs – Should keep the little shed.
 Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted. (McLaughlin)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2022-03-5988**

Rest held for Tuesday.

9. Boyers Way, LLC **03-6020** 1 Boyers Alley Way Add A.C Conditioning 55.4.1/211 Philip Cox

IV. OLD BUSINESS 04/05/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Jeffrey Greenberg 10-4940	30A Orange Street	Garage Reno	42.3.3/200	Emeritus
2.	Elizabeth Powell 12-5445	71 Cliff Road	Hardscape	30/160	Atlantic Landscaping
3.	450 Green Park LLC, 11-5272	2 Stone Alley Way	Adtn, Alter & foundation	42.3.1/103	Emeritus
4.	Zero India, LLC 01-5514	1 Cambridge Street	Reduce footprint & chng roof	42.3.1/130.2	Emeritus
5.	Taco Taco 1, LLC 01-5567	22 Bartlett Farm Road	New Dwelling	65/76.1	BPC
6.	Ocean Dojo, LLC 01-5569	20 Bartlett Farm Road	New Dwelling	65/76	BPC

V. NEW BUSINESS 04/12/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Joan Bonting	3 Pine Tree Street	Pool and hardscape	68/228	Linda Williams
2.	Nantucket G & S, LLC 03-6043	81 Vestal Street	Rev. add roof to deck	56/254	MCA+
3.	Steven Busch 03-6057	8 Grand Avenue	Demo chimney	73.3.1/118	Zoran Milovski
4.	God Bless Dad, LLC 03-6059	76 Baxter Road	New pool	49/42	Atlantic Landscaping
5.	Marc Knight 03-6046	60 Nobadeer Avenue	Roof walk	88/10	Permit Plus
6.	Mariocha Krishnamurti 03-6011	17 Milk Street	Front door color change	42.3.3/86.1	Mariocha Krishnamurti
7.	6 Clara Drive, LLC 03-6038	6 Clara Drive	Fencing and driveway	66/283	Elaine Johnson
8.	Cliff Lane 81, LLC 03-6060	81 Cliff Road	White picket fence	30/165	Garden Group
9.	Eileen Harkness 03-6064	5 Gardner Perry Lane	Add porch, skylight, rme shutt.	55/32.1	Thornewill Design
10.	James Chapman 03-6050	10 Angola Street	Driveway/apron	55.4.4/79	Viktoriya Keltz
11.	Nick and Kacie Pappas 03-6067	7 Beaver Street	Alterations/additions	55.1.4/82	Val Oliver
12.	Alex Woodley 03-6065	1 Newtown Court	New dwelling	55/210.1	Val Oliver
13.	Alex Woodley 03-6066	1 Newtown Court	New garage apartment	55/210.1	Val Oliver
14.	Helen Dubois 03-6070	5 Stone Post	New pool/spa/fencing	14/80	KM Designs
15.	Farrell Francis 04-6074	4 Westmoor Lane	New cottage	41/12	Farrell Francis
16.	Greg & Mary Ferguson 04-6076	50 Hulbert Avenue	Renew: garage/studio+ mods	29/62	Normand Residential

Proposed HDC Minutes for April 21, 2022

17.	Richard Wolfe 04-6075	68 Washington Street	Replace wndws w/ French dr	42.2.3/15	Christopher
18.	Robert Graves 04-6094	23 Appleton Road	Driveway mat chng- concrete	66/399	Sanne Payne
19.	Elin Hildebrand 04-6117	60 Crooked Lane	Alterations	41/198	Emeritus
20.	88 Pocomo, LLC 04-6092	88 Pocomo Road	New guest house	15/42	Emeritus
21.	Jerry Miller 04-6093	63 Boulevarde	New garage	79/212	Emeritus
22.	2 Chestnut, LLC 04-6091	2 Chestnut Street	Color change	42.3.1/69	Emeritus
23.	Housing Nantucket 04-6101	31 Fairgrounds Road	Solar and carport	67/149	Jardins Intl.
24.	Candlewick CornerVttAck, LLC 04-6106	120 Old South Road	New commercial bld	68/969	CWA
25.	Candlewick CornerVttAck, LLC 04-6105	122 Old South Road	New commercial bld	68/969.1	CWA
26.	Candlewick CornerVttAck, LLC 04-6104	124 Old South Road	New commercial bld	68/969.2	CWA
27.	55 Eel Point Holdings, LLC 04-6096	55 Eel Point Rd	New garage apartment	32/47	Botticelli + Pohl
28.	Stark Point, LLC 04-6109	16 Easton Street	Move off/ demo mh	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
29.	Stark Point, LLC 04-6110	16 Easton Street	Move off/demo garage	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
30.	Stark Point, LLC 04-6118	16 Easton Street	New dwelling	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
31.	Stark Point, LLC 04-6120	16 Easton Street	New garage	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
32.	Stark Point, LLC 04-6119	16 Easton Street	New cottage	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
33.	Stark Point, LLC 04-6121	16 Easton Street	New gym	42.1.4/11	Botticelli + Pohl
34.	Island Living, LLC 04-6113	2B Longwood Drive	New main house	71/13.4	JB Studio
35.	Island Living, LLC 04-6111	2B Longwood Drive	New guest house	71/13.4	JB Studio
36.	Island Living, LLC 04-6112	2B Longwood Drive	New pool	71/13.4	JB Studio
37.	Steven & Marian Wilson 04-6123	5 Surfside Road	Addition with lift	55-253	LINK
38.	ACKLifesaving Museum	158 Polpis Road	Window replacement	27/28	LINK
39.	Jean Moran 01-5621	4 Washington Avenue	New pool	60.2.4/65	Jon Paul Couture
40.	Jean Moran 01-5620	4 Washington Avenue	Window well	60.2.4/65	Jon Paul Couture
41.	Jean Moran 01-5199	4 Washington Avenue	New garage	60.2.4/65	Jon Paul Couture
42.	Nantucket Shire, LLC	30 Dukes Road	New dwelling	56/189	Linda Williams
43.	Nantucket Shire, LLC	30 Dukes Road	Move shed and addition	56/189	Linda Williams
44.	N.T. Historical Assoc. 02-5779	7 Fair Street	Replace windows	42.3.1/50	Linda Williams

VI. OLD BUSINESS 04/19/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Melissa Sperau 12-5433	21 Bank Street	Rev. 72714: 2nd floor adtn	73.1.3/57	Gryphon Architect
2.	K225, LLC	126 Main Street	Move on site & renovations	42.3.3/98	JB Studio
3.	20A Bishops Rise 01-5590	20A Bishops Rise	Garage	40/127	Topham Designs
4.	20A Bishops Rise 01-5594	20A Bishops Rise	New pool	40/127	Topham Designs
5.	20B Bishops Rise 01-5591	20B Bishops Rise	Main house	40/127	Topham Designs
6.	20B Bishops Rise 01-5597	20B Bishops Rise	New garage/wtudio	40/127	Topham Designs
7.	20B Bishops Rise 01-5593	20B Bishops Rise	New pool	40/127	Topham Designs
8.	Scott Dehm 02-5644	8 Ash Street	Addition & shift arbor	42.4.2/94	SCI
9.	Cordts-Pearce 02-5742	76 Pleasant Street	Addition	55/367	JB Studio
10.	41 Monomoy Rd, LLC 03-5883	41 Monomoy Road	New dwelling	54/79.1	Emeritus
11.	88 Pocomo Rd, LLC 03-5885	88 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15/42	Emeritus
12.	Tack3, LLC 10-4863	26 Washington Street	Addition & remove balcony	42.3.2/23	CWA
13.	Ocean Dojo, LLC 03-5847	20 Bartlett Farm Road	Pool & hardscape	65/76	Atlantic Landscape
14.	Hoehn-Saric 10-4865	34 Easton Street	New dwelling	42.1/14/18	CWA
15.	Eleven Lincoln Trust 08-4451	32 Jefferson Street	Addition	30/132	Botticelli + Pohl

VII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	April 12 & 14, 2022
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, April 26th @ 5:00 pm Hybrid – Zoom & 4 Fairgrounds Rd, Community Room • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion

Motion to Adjourn at 2:34 pm. (McLaughlin)

Roll-call vote

Carried 4-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

PROPOSED