



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, February 15, 2022

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

Called to order at 5:01 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, PLUS Administrative Assistant; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Dutra, Thornewill

Absent Members: Dutra

Late Arrivals: Camp, 5:07 pm

Early Departures: Camp & Welch, 8:54 pm

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. SIGNS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Nt Maria Mitchell 10-4890	59 Milk Street	Move sign	56/209	Jascin Finger
2.	Alan Bell 01-5630	122 Pleasant Street	Wall sign	55/160	Sign Here
3.	Isaiah Truymen Held	117 Orange Street	Wall sign	55/377	Isaiah Truymen
4.	Erin Lindsay 01-5615	5 Old South Road	Wall sign	55/184	Sign Here
5.	Jason Weisman 01-5627	117 Pleasant Street	Wall sign	55/267.6	Sign Here
6.	Michael O'Reilly 02-5712	3 Ariel Avenue	New Sign	67/399	Sign Here
7.	Gwendolyn Perkins 02-5713	Stone Barn Way	Street sign	29/901	Gwendolyn Perkins

Voting Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill

Alternates Welch

Recused None

Documentation Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.

Representing None

Sign Advisory None

Concerns **Martinez** – Item 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, & 7 were recommended for approval; Item 3 was held for revisions.

Motion **Motion to Approve Items 1, 2, 4, & 7. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

Certificate #

HDC(as noted)

Motion **Motion to Hold Item 3 for revisions. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

Certificate #

III. CONSENTS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	N. R. Parizeau Trust 02-5678	10 Fulling Mill Road	Revs. 06-4078: resite	27/31	Botticelli + Pohl
2.	N. R. Parizeau Trust 02-5679	10 Fulling Mill Road	Revs. 06-4079: Fenest	27/31	Botticelli + Pohl
3.	C. Roach & C. Costa 02-5671	5 Hull Lane	Alterations to deck	67/179.1	Chris Roach
4.	Eric Shurm 02-5641	21 Woodland Drive	Window wells	68/262	Eric Schurm
5.	Johnson Irrev. Trust 01-5577	28 Longwood Road	Secondary Dwelling	71/38	Linda Williams
6.	Kim Glowacki 02-5653	3B Miller Lane	Move on Shed	68/120	Structures Unlimited
7.	Barry Lyden 02-5654	4 West Miacomet Road	Move off Shed	81/160	Structures Unlimited
8.	Murray – Ment 02-5650	18 Gardner Road	Portico and Window	43/135	Val Oliver
9.	Graham Burton 02-5640	37 Tomahawk Road	Rev. 68176: Window	69/326	Graham Burton
10.	James & Zeld Cahill 02-5655	5 Austin Farm Road	Garage	56/984	EMDA
11.	Vera Gierke Trust 02-5634	4 Polliwog Pond Road	Change Windows	55/423.7	Sean Higgins
12.	Gregg Tivnan 02-5659	13 Maclean Lane	Rear Door / Win. Dr. Swap	55/483	Gregg Tivnan
13.	Kristen Engle Trust 02-5642	90 Pocomo Road	Hardscape	15/43	CWA
14.	Frederich Hahn 01-5617	50 Eel Point Road	Rev. 06-4094: door Change	32/25.1	EMDA
15.	John & Lori Kann 02-5660	8 Okoraw Avenue	Replace Grge win. & door	79/132	Mark Cutone Archt.

16. Jay Cohen **01-5587** 24 Medouie Creek Road New Shed 20/2 Smith & Hutton
 Voting Camp (acting chair), McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused Pohl, Oliver
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns No concerns.
 Motion **Motion to Approve. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, and McLaughlin-aye Certificate # **HDC2022-(as noted)**

IV. CONSENTS WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Joseph Marchese 11-5158	8 Winn Street	Rev. 08-4861: pool	41/51.2	Waterscapes
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection or thereafter.				
2. Lyubenor Lyubomir 01-5552	7 Toombs Court	Solar Roof Array	68/153.1	Ack Smart
• Due to lack of visibility				
3. Young Bracebridge TR 02-5675	7 Shawkemo Road	Ground Solar Array rev.	43/5	Sun Wind, LLC
• Due to lack of visibility				
4. Roach/ Costa 02-5670	5 Hull Lane	Pool	67/179.1	Chris Roach
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection or thereafter.				
5. Courtney Cotter 01-5604	19 Ellens Way	Spa	81/184	Courtney Cotter
• Due to lack of visibility				
6. 6 Whitetail Circle, LLC 02-5645	6 Whitetail Circle	Pool	71/24	Thornewill Design
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection or thereafter.				
7. Bluefin, LLC 01-5626	27 Ellens Way (Lot 29)	Pool/Hardscape	81/180	Brook Meerbergen
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection or thereafter.				
8. Barry and Robert Ang 02-5672	11 Jonathan Way	Rev.10-4929:+shed & ac	75/42	McMullen and Assoc
• Due to lack of visibility				
9. Van and Michelle Velle 02-5657	10 Maxey Pond Road	Rev.10-1949:gble/dr hgt	40/100	Lucas Velle
• Due to lack of visibility				
10. C.&B. Montgomery 02-5633	3 Pinkham Circle	Rooftop Solar	56/178	Cotuit Solar
• Due to lack of visibility				
11. Eileen Oakford 02-5658	29B Brewster Road	Door, Window Changes	54/173.1	SMRD
• Due to lack of visibility				
12. 14 MVR, LLC 02-5676	14 Madequecham Vly Rd	Pool/ Hardscape	89/13	Atlantic Landscaping
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection or thereafter.				
13. Rich Meisenberg 02-5668	86 Polpis Road	Solar Ground Array	44/25.4	Ack Smart
• Due to lack of visibility				
14. Chris & Susan Mitchell 02-5646	10 Skyline Drive	Window Replace	79/7.1	Chris/Susan Mitchell
• Due to lack of visibility				
15. Chris & Susan Mitchell 01-5618	10 Skyline Drive	Garage: fenst&door rplc	79/7.1	Chris/Susan Mitchell
• Due to lack of visibility				
16. Patrick Cairns 01-5625	6 Nichols Road	Additions/ Renovations	92.4/65	MCA
• Due to lack of visibility				
17. Sea La Vie, LLC 02-5666	42 Dukes Road	Rooftop Solar	56/249	Sun Wind, LLC
• Due to lack of visibility				
18. Jay Cohen 01-5599	24 Medouie Creek Road	Pool & Hardscape	20/2	Studio Landscape
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection or thereafter.				
19. 38 Monohansett, LLC 02-5664	38 Monohansett Road	Pool	79/60	Val Oliver
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection or thereafter.				
20. 38 Monohansett, LLC 02-5663	38 Monohansett Road	Cabana	79/60	Val Oliver
• Due to lack of visibility				
Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch				
Alternates None				
Recused Oliver, Thornewill				
Documentation None				
Representing None				
Public None				
Concerns No additional concerns.				
Motion Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye Certificate # HDC2201/2022(as noted)				

V. OLD BUSINESS 01/21/2021

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	3 Beaver St, LLC 12-5316	3A Beaver Street	Renovation	55.1.4/97	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams Polly Walldorf				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:10)	<p>Williams – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns and context; submitted Scott Forrest’s letter regarding raising. The window wells can’t go on the side due to the zero setback to the property line and driveway.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1755, timber-frame, lean-to, the Simeon Gardner house; they have letter of historic determination and are going for the historic tax credit. This is in proximity of AE flood zone, raising is being proactive. The structural engineer’s letter doesn’t give the Base Flood Elevation (BFE)/Design Flood Elevation (DFE), so she emailed the agent requesting those. The rubble basement is almost non-existent; they should use period appropriate material and reuse salvage rubble material. HSAB didn’t look at this. Read into the record individual HSAB member comments. Asked the plans and engineer letter should be revised to include the BFE and DFE.</p> <p>Camp – Asked if the front window wells could be reduced to 3-over-3s (no, for egress). Okay with the rear dormer and bringing the chimney back. Her only concern is window wells on the street; they need to be screened.</p> <p>Coombs – HSAB did discuss this; they said due to the age, the front basement windows are inappropriate; we don’t know the ages of the houses in the context photos. Appreciates the chimney coming back. The rear dormer should be smaller due to the age and unchanged condition of this house.</p> <p>Oliver – She has no concerns about the dormer and loves the chimney. Would prefer the window wells be moved to the side; however, they would then be more visible.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees with what’s been said. Agrees the front window wells must be hidden; they shouldn’t be on the bump.</p> <p>Walldorf – There are two bedrooms in the basement and need egress windows, which can’t go on the sides due to regulations regarding parking and the property line.</p> <p>Pohl – Old buildings like this do need to be lifted out of the dirt; putting it on a proper foundation is right. The foundation needs a vintage appropriate veneer. Building down is a good idea but does require window wells; he gets that. The front is the most formal façade and should have a formal salvaged brick veneer with rubble on the sides.</p>				
Motion	<p>Motion to Approve through staff with the proper elevation information certified by the engineer; the window wells not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter; and use of any existing rubble on the west foundation and salvaged brick with appropriate grout on the front. (Oliver)</p>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2020-12-5316

2.	Arline Bartlett 12-5454	21 Pleasant Street	Windows, doors, addition	55.4.1/1	LINK
Voting	Camp (acting chair), McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Victoria Ewing, LINK				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:35)	<p>Ewing – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. We will be applying for full landscaping. I’m putting together a window survey that will be ready next week; reviewed the types of windows, location, and age.</p> <p>Welch – For the sake of accuracy, asked if we have an image showing the grade change. The existing grade is buried; the topography will dramatically change, and we don’t have the images he previously requested. There is no existing grade versus proposed grade being shown on the elevations. It’s not appropriate to review the structure when it’s not in context with the whole project. The fenestration changes are minor, but we shouldn’t move forward without the landscape plan with grade changes. He wants to see the previously approved hardscape application; he doesn’t think a grade change was discussed with that. This could be held to track until the grading is resolved.</p> <p>Oliver – We need to be clear about the actual grade change; a hardscape plan would be helpful. Regarding the addition, the eave line should drop so it’s more additive.</p> <p>Coombs – We haven’t discussed the amount of fill; the dirt is piled 2 to 3 feet high and will kill the trees. The proposed north shows flat grade. We have rules about how much fill can be added. The fill should be removed from the trees now. We need to know exactly how much the grade is going up; she agrees we should get that before continuing. The shutters as proposed won’t work.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The changes are appropriate and compatible, and this should be approved.</p> <p>Camp – She saw a site plan showing a driveway from Candle House, so she gets why the grade change. Agrees with HSAB regarding the shutters.</p> <p>Backus – She believes the property came in for a new driveway, which has been approved; that location and shape is not what was approved. HSAB reviewed the original application; shutters that can’t close shouldn’t be allowed and so should be discussed. Topography and landscape would be helpful. There is a window survey forthcoming. There is the adjacent lot subdivided off this under 41-81L and we need to know where the driveways will be in relation to each other. Discussion about the fill that was delivered to the site. Commission request the delivered fill be removed.</p>				
Motion	<p>Motion to Hold for cross-section representation on the X-Y axis; topographical plan showing existing and proposed to extend over the lot line; images of what is there today taken from Candle House and the rear lot showing the grade changes; and for revisions. (Welch)</p>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, and Camp-aye			Certificate #	

VI. NEW BUSINESS 01/18/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
3.	Amy Mignone 01-5547	10 Angola Street	Window/door replace& alt.	55.4.4/79	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:02)	<p>Oliver – Presented project; circa 1973 infill; asking for simulated-divided lights (SDL)</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments 1/31: This is in the old historic district (OHD) so all windows should be true-divided lights (TDL). The single side-light at the front door is not appropriate. The side wing as proposed has an awkward massing; either keep the shingled walls on the front and part of the side or drop the porch floor level 8” to improve the proportions and reduce the shingle area above the garage door; if it remains an open porch, the roof should change to a hip. HSAB would like to review further revisions.</p> <p>The windows facing the public way should be TDL. The pediment over the front door and cross bucks don’t go well together; correlate the front door surround with the new balcony. Read into the record a letter from Anne Dewez.</p> <p>McLaughlin – (audio cut out)</p> <p>Camp – Likes the new window dimensions; front door should be more classical; adding a middle column to the deck would give it more presence. There are ways to make crossbucks work.</p> <p>Coombs – The windows should be TDL; this is in the OHD. The deck over the garage is okay as proposed but likes Ms. Camp’s suggestion.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agree with what’s been said and HSAB. She’s concerned about white with the porch and garage door.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees about the asymmetrical entryway; the original is charming. The 2nd-floor porch is okay as proposed and fits with how it was originally built; adding another column would give it more character. Grey trim would be better than white. This is set way back and we’ve approved SDLs in the OHD, cited the former Nobby Shop 2nd-floor as an example; he’s okay with the windows going to SDL in this location, which is a safe place to do that.</p>				
Motion	<p>Motion to Approve through staff with a more classic entry door; add a center column to the sun porch; and trim and sash to be light grey. (Camp)</p>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-01-5547

4.	Ali & Zach Smith 12-5313	232 Madaket Road	New garage	59.4/120.1	JN Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Amaurys Solana, JN Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:19)	Solana – Asked to hold this. They are making revisions. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for further revisions at applicant's request. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5313
5.	Ali & Zach Smith 12-5315	232 Madaket Road	Fenestration & dormer	59.4/120.1	JN Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Amaurys Solana, JN Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:22)	Solana – Presented project and changes made per MAB comments; height 26'2". Backus – Read MAB comments 1/24: North and south dormers are inappropriate on the front; they go to the ridge, have unusual transom windows, appropriate skylights, and the chimney should not be taken over by the dormers. The structure is visible from both Madaket Road and potentially from the rear Long Pond Drive. 2-over-2s on this style house are not appropriate; should remain 6-over-6 or option to 6-over-1. Wrap-around porch negatively impacts the symmetry of the structure; a standard front porch running from side to side to corner boards would be appropriate. The hip roof around the east side is not appropriate. French door composition is odd. Not standard 4 light. If the windows are not changed, the doors should remain 15 lights, though the visibility may be minimal at ground level. East and west elevations clearly show the odd dormers, pitch might not be 4/12, and show the skylights raised off the roof plain, which is not standard for Nantucket. East elevation, the inappropriate wrap around porch oddly placed. Use of "TBD" (to be determined) is not appropriate on applications; skylights should be no larger than 24" x 36" vertically oriented; question the orientation of this one. Circa 1986. Looks like the plans have been changed per those comments. McLaughlin – The rear dormer as drawn is inappropriate; the windows are too small. Coombs – Windows should be 6-over-6 or 12-over-12; 2-over-2 is not appropriate. Asked the visibility of the south elevation. Camp – The existing pane configuration is charming. The front porch posts should be larger/thicker and should be at the very end of the porch. The rear dormer needs another window; there's too much shingle space. Welch – No concerns. Pohl – No concerns but does like adding a window into the rear dormer. The front porch posts would be better if they're 8X8.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 4th window the rear dormer and increasing the front porch columns to 8X8. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//McLaughlin, Welch, Camp, and Pohl-aye; Coombs-nay			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5315
6.	Zero India St, LLC 01-5514	1 Cambridge Street	Rdc ftprnt/rf replace/fenst	42.3.1/130.2	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:35)	MacEachern – Asked to hold this for further revisions. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information at applicant's request. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

VII. OLD BUSINESS 01/25/2022

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Marshall & Holly Pagon 11-5250	28 & 32 Baxter Road	Pool house & pergola	49.23/29	Design Associates
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Chris Dalmus, Design Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:37)	<p>Dalmus – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; east elevation faces Baxter Road.</p> <p>Backus – This is Windrush, circa 1906. At the last meeting, you asked that the chimney have brick to match the main house; one commissioner said it was heavy.</p> <p>McLaughlin – West elevation, the doors have too much glass; fenestration should be cut back to 50% of the wall space.</p> <p>Oliver – This isn't a dwelling so she doesn't feel the fenestration guidelines need to apply. She has no concerns.</p> <p>Coombs – It's set way back and isn't a house or garage. She has no concerns.</p> <p>Thornewill – Appreciates the chimney going to brick. This is a great little building.</p> <p>Pohl – This is a pavilion, an accessory structure.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-11-5250
2. Trogo Nominee Trust 05-3640	26 Easy Street	Mixed Use- Retail & Resid	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:44)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Disagrees with HSAB about the 3rd-floor program.</p> <p>Backus – Contributing lot in the OHD. Appreciates reduction in number of dormers; agree the roof walk is inappropriate and not historically accurate; balcony over a public space is inappropriate. This must comply with Chapter 11, new construction of Resilient Nantucket. Haven't seen the engineer's letter on the BFE or DFE; we need that.</p> <p>Read HASB comments 1/18: Would like a streetscape of this building relating to the neighboring structures. The HDC has repeatedly asked the applicant to lower the building and eliminate the balcony; it's still too tall. The roof pitch should lower to 8/12 and the 1st-floor ceiling height reduced. The gable dormers are too big and create a 3rd-floor wall; they should be much narrower with single windows. The roof walk is too wide and should be reduced to about 7 feet or eliminated; it adds to the height. Second-floor balconies on the front of any building downtown are inappropriate, and it should be removed. The two sets of triple doors leading nowhere should be changed to double-hung windows. The 3rd-floor mulled windows in the gable end are inappropriate and should be a single. The applicant is still asking for too much program in this location; trying to maintain this much floor area on the 3rd floor shouldn't be driving the design. A reduction in 3rd-floor space will help steer this design closer to the proper height and scale for the neighborhood. This is a classic example of the applicant repeatedly asking for the same thing each time without making the changes that the HDC has requested in the hopes that eventually the HDC will approve something. It is wasting everyone's time. HSAB would like to review future revisions.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees with HSAB about the 2nd-floor deck on the front. East elevation, it should be 3 small dormers; the roof walk isn't appropriate; the larger 2nd-floor window increases complexity. North elevation, the dormer should shift away from the east wall. She doesn't think shed dormers are appropriate in town.</p> <p>Coombs – We've repeatedly asked this be reduced in sized and no change has been made; it should be smaller. This is overpowering and doesn't reflect anything in the area. The roof walk has no point. East elevation, the 2nd-floor front balcony is inappropriate. South elevation, the 3rd-floor dormers are too big and take up the whole roof.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with much that's been said. The 1st floor is fine. Appreciates it getting simpler. South elevation, eliminate the middle dormer and reduce the pitch. Eliminate the roof walk and the east elevation 2nd-floor balcony.</p> <p>Pohl – South elevation, the 3rd-floor dormers increased to 6 windows from 5; that's not simplification. The previous submission with the little dormers and cupola would be better if the number of dormers were reduced but in that size. The roof walk should be eliminated. He'd like to see options on handling the 3rd-floor with fewer than 6 windows.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and to go back to HSAB. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

3.	Cindy Helfrich	12-5354	37 Fair Street	Roof & fenestration changes	42.3.2/121	Emeritus
Voting	Camp (acting chair) McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:02)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. The roof walk was previously approved</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1820 typical Nantucket individually significant; the addition, alteration and porch were approved August 2021. Screening used to get this approved should be looked at very carefully; the side entry stairs compete with the front; agrees stairs should be parallel with the side of the wall; we do have side entries on ells in the OHD. The roof walk was approved natural to weather and should remain as approved. There is already one basement access in the rear, this proposed basement access is excessive.</p> <p>Read HASB comments 1/18: The north elevation areaway will be visible from Fair Street and should be eliminated; there is already another basement access in the rear; this was previously requested by the HDC, yet it is still proposed. The front stoop should be repaired rather than replaced to enable the existing railing to remain at a less than code height. The south elevation exterior stair should be integrated along the side of the building, not projecting out; this was also requested by the HDC. Privet hedges should not be counted on to hide inappropriate architectural features on the front of buildings; they lose their leaves in winter and could be removed in the future. If something is inappropriate, it should not be allowed. HSAB would like to review future revisions.</p> <p>Coombs – The front basement entry is not appropriate on Fair Street. North elevation, the shutters are inconsistent (existing).</p> <p>Thornewill – South elevation, the stair is okay; not sure the hedge needs to be 8'. The roof walk skirt needs to remain natural to weather. Doesn't think the basement stair will be "in your face."</p> <p>Oliver – Okay with the roof walk. Agrees the side steps on the driveway side are fine. Still concerned about the side porch stairs coming straight down. We could add that screening be in perpetuity.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Camp – Thinks the front basement access will blend with the side porch.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted with the privet to be maintained in perpetuity. (McLaughlin)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5354
4.	BC Sconset, LLC	07-4226	9 Hawks Circle	Hardscape	74/37.1	Ahern
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	None					
Representing	None					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:19)	Not opened at this time.					
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye				Certificate #	
5.	Brett Fodiman	12-5374	3 Tetawkimmo Drive	New dwelling	53/41	CWA
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and correspondence.					
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:20)	<p>Webster – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Barriers around the wells on the rear will be addressed in the landscape plan. Removed any reference to a pool. The neighborhood design review board has approved of this.</p> <p>Welch – East elevation, the ¾-story dormer has an artifact line that makes it look like a double roof. Changing out the brackets helped keep the subtle shingle style. Appreciates the west-elevation garage overhang being pulled back. North elevation, the left and right dormers are proud of the secondary mass on the 2nd floor.</p> <p>Thornewill – West elevation, appreciates getting rid of the brackets but the top band board makes it look fragile; should be shingled; the lights in the garage doors should match the front door 4 lights; the chimney looks fat from this side.</p> <p>Coombs – West elevation, the garage doors, eliminate the bottom row of windows.</p> <p>Oliver – Asked if the boxes shown on the floor plan are below grade (yes). They have no railings.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees about the garage door lights. She would prefer the see-through to be brought in 6" each side.</p> <p>Backus – Read into the record a letter of concerns from Stephen Watson; his attorney asked for the height from grade.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the archway brought in 6" on the sides and top; the garage door lights to be 4-lights matching the front door; and to conform with the approval of the Neighborhood Design Review Board. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Camp-aye; Oliver-nay				Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5374

6.	Brett Fodiman	10-4969	27 Cato Lane	New dwelling	55/118	CWA
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates					
Public	None					
Concerns (7:47)	<p>Webster – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Thornewill – The front door should have typical sidelights: panel with 3 lights. North elevation rear mass, the fascia could drop bringing down the whole roof making it more secondary. There’s a lot of glass on the rear but doesn’t think it’ll be visible.</p> <p>Oliver – Appreciates the changes.</p> <p>McLaughlin – West elevation, the left should have only 2 glass doors. South elevation, the overhanging balcony needs brackets; the basement well has no walkout access.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information on the basement well access and site plan and revisions. (Thornewill)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Thornewill, and Coombs-aye				Certificate #	
7.	Brett Fodiman	10-4970	27 Cato Lane	Garage	55/118	CWA
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates					
Public	None					
Concerns (8:01)	Not opened at this time.					
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main dwelling. (Thornewill)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Thornewill, and Coombs-aye				Certificate #	
8.	Theodorakos Vaios Trust		79 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15/5	CWA
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates					
Public	None					
Concerns (8:02)	<p>Webster – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; this is 168’ from the road; 1st-floor length is 88’ not including the porches.</p> <p>Thornewill – Being 4’ shorter is better than nothing; the fenestration changes make a big difference. The front door sidelights should have 2 lights at the top to match the door. Hopes the north elevation isn’t visible from the beach; given Mr. Pohl’s comments, we should probably see a reduction in the north-elevation fenestration.</p> <p>Coombs – Appreciates the reduction of windows. South elevation left 2nd-floor, suggested eliminating the center “C” window to lighten it up. Doesn’t think this be visible from the beach. Asked the length including the porches; this is too long and needs to be further reduced.</p> <p>Discussion about the length with and without porches; overall length need to be included on the elevations.</p> <p>Oliver – She viewed this; given what’s happening across the street, she has no concerns.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The 2nd-floor decks shouldn’t extend more than 8’ off the wall.</p> <p>Pohl – The elevations look completely flat when there is at least 1’ to 2’ of grade change. If you can see the water, the water can see you; this is overly large, and he doesn’t support it. It’s around 107’6” including the porches.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	

9.	Anthony Noto 11-5270	10 Lincoln Avenue	Addition & reno	30/184	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	Kristen Gagalys, for 11 & 13 Lincoln Avenue				
Concerns (8:20)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; to move forward 10’ and still be 70’ from the road.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1908 Queen Anne; this has a distinctive style and setting that should be maintained; it shouldn’t be moved to accommodate a program in the rear; this is a double-frontage lot. It’s debatable whether or not the rear would be visible. There had been a request for a window survey. The shingle style should be maintained. The plans should also show the structure as it exists. Should bring back the shingle-style elements; shed dormers would be more appropriate.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 1/31: The house should not move forward on the property; to preserve the large front lawn, the driveway and parking should remain on the back of the property. The modified shed dormers on the front are preferred and should drop so that the tops of the dormers intersect the roof at the break in the gambrel roofs. The south-facing 3rd-floor window/door unit still has too much glass; the windows should be reduced in size to create at least a foot of shingles between the doors and windows. The French doors on the front balcony should be changed to 12 lights with kick panel; to minimize the visibility of the front balcony French doors, shingle the lower half of the balustrade rail. On the south, the 6-unit French door is too expansive and should be broken up or reduced. HSAB would like to review further revisions.</p> <p>Gagalys – Moving this forward dramatically changes the historic streetscape as does the addition of a front driveway.</p> <p>Camp – On this side of the street, large lawns are the streetscape; access should remain of Capaum Road. The shed dormers are quieter and likes the upper gambrel being the top of the dormer roof. If the garage is beside the house, it will create a massively long block. An eyebrow window would harken back to shingle style. East elevation, the 3rd floor is over fenestrated; it needs more shingles.</p> <p>Coombs – East elevation 3rd floor, there should be one door with 2 windows; it’s over fenestrated. South elevation, reduce the number of doors and windows; the 1st-floor fenestration should match the 2nd floor. Agrees with what’s been said.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with HSAB. There is precedent for the east 2nd-floor deck. The dormers should be below the main roof.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with Ms. Oliver about the dormers. He’s definitely against moving this.</p> <p>Pohl – He agrees with what’s been said. Pointed out that 12 Lincoln was approved moved forward because of the location of this house, which is now being proposed to change.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

10.	450 Green Park, LLC 11-5272	2 Stone Alley	Adtn, Alter, & Foundation	42.3.1/103	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	Alger Linda Williams				
Concerns (8:50)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – Reviewed it’s history. Appreciates the stepping back but it still presents as a wall along Stone alley (check tape 8:54) We need a window survey since windows are being replaced.</p> <p>Pohl – This is too complicated to review in the time left today. Asked to hold for Thursday.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday, February 17th. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

Rest held for Thursday, February 17th.

VII. NEW BUSINESS 02/01/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Glenn Lajeunesse 01-5553	4 Mioxes Way	New Cabana	65/87	Thornewill Designs
2.	34B Walsh St N.T. 01-5568	34B Walsh Street	Addition	29/104	Studio Ppark
3.	Peter Michalowski 01-5573	34 Dukes Road	Rev. 72768: hardscape	56/187	Linda Williams
4.	BPC 4 Dolphin Ct., LLC 01-5574	4 Dolphin Court	Addition	42.4.1/65.2	Linda Williams
5.	BPC 8 N. Beach St., LLC 01-5572	8 North Beach Street	Addition	42.4.1/65.1	Linda Williams
6.	S & R Island Dev. 01-5576	26 Woodland Drive	Demo dwelling	68/260	Linda Williams
7.	Sam Nicholson 01-5534	22 Brewster Road	Addition	54/196.1	Val Oliver
8.	Steve Theroux 01-5536	25 Broadway	Storage/ garbage bins	73.1.3/108	NAG
9.	Steve & Kim Schaefer 01-5526	86 Cliff Road	Shed/ Fence	30/74.2	Robert Newman
10.	Steve & Kim Schaefer 01-5525	86 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30/74.2	Robert Newman
11.	All Vines, LLC 01-5537	9 Prospect Street	Roof Shingle Change	55.4.4/41	T & T Roofing
12.	Hollis Webb 01-5586	30 Dukes Road	Demolition	56/189	Hollis Webb
13.	The Sandbar 01-5527	4 Bathing Beach Road	Roof Overhang	29/1	Val Oliver
14.	36 Easton St. Corp. 01-5520	36 Easton Street	Rev.: Move AC to west	42.1.4/19	EMDA

Proposed HDC Minutes for February 15, 2022

15.	B16ACK LLC 01-5524	8 Meadowview Drive	New Dwelling – Garage	56/147	EMDA
16.	71 N. Liberty Trust 01-5539	71 North Liberty Street	Hardscape	41/141.1	NAG
17.	Rbt. Veghte & Robin Rednor	2 Ann's Lane	New Roof Walk	49/59.1	DTA
18.	William Schultz 01-5550	23 Friendship Lane	Garage Demo/ Move Off	56/347	David Pekarcik
19.	William Schultz 01-5551	23 Friendship Lane	Garage Move on Site	56/347	David Pekarcik
20.	Glenn Lajeunesse 01-5553	4 Mioxes Way	Solar Roof Array	65/87	Ack Smart
21.	Vlatko Pesnacki 01-5557	10 Lewis Court	New Dwelling	67/155	Val Oliver
22.	Hamling Deirdre Tr 01-5559	6 Lowell Place	Rev. 02-2951: addition	41/167	Joseph Topham
23.	King Fisher Realty Tr 01-5596	278 Polpis Road	Rev. COA: Rf Wlk & Fenest.	25/2	Gryphon Architect
24.	Fine Luxury Homes 01-5601	10 Beaver Street	Re-roof	55.1.4/80	Steven Stockigt
25.	Jay Cohen 01-5570	24 Medouie Creek Road	Main House Alteration	20/2	Smith & Hutton
26.	Lloyd Realty, LLC 01-5600	7 Heather Lane	New Dwelling	30/24.2	S. Metz
27.	Hulbert Ack LLC 01-5565	2 Hulbert Avenue	Hardscape	42.1.4/21	Atlantic Landscaping
28.	Nantucket 62 Walsh, LLC 01-5588	62 Walsh Street	Rev. 08-4379:	29/85 + 85.2	Botticelli + Pohl
29.	Taco 1, LLC 01-5569	22 Bartlett Road (24 Bart)	New Dwelling	65/86	BPC
30.	Ocean Dojo, LLC 01-5567	20 Bartlett Road (22 Bart)	New Dwelling	65/76	BPC
31.	Mike & Jackie Raso 01-5612	82 Centre Street	Alteration	42.4.3/62	Mike & Jackie Raso

IX. OLD BUSINESS 02/08/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Michael Koufakis 10-5042	6 Swain Street	Dormer addition	42.4.1/82.2	George Wing
2.	Bluefin, LLC 11-5194	27 Ellen's Way Lot 20	New Dwelling	81/180	Brook Meerbergen
3.	Elizabeth Powell 12-5445	71 Cliff Road	Hardscape	30/160	Atlantic Landscaping
4.	Elizabeth Powell 12-5440	71 Cliff Road	Cabana	30/160	Thornwill Designs
5.	Matt O'Connor 12-5370	16 Tashama Lane	Retaining wall	55/481	KM Designs
6.	1 Caroline Way, LLC 12-5439	1 Caroline Way	Rev: main and guest houses	85/58 & 59	Vincente Burin Arch.
7.	1 Caroline Way, LLC 12-5414	1 Caroline Way	Pool & hardscape	85/58 & 59	Ahern
8.	22 Easton St, LLC 06-4026	22 Easton Street	Pool & hardscape	42.1/12	Ahern
9.	Island Living, LLC 11-5151	4a Wamasquid Place	Pool & hardscape	56/113.9	Ahern
10.	33 North Mill St, LLC 11-5051	7 North Mill Street	Garage & studio	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz
11.	33 North Mill St, LLC 11-5126	7 North Mill Street	Hardscape	55.4.4/77	Atlantic Landscaping
12.	23 Broad St, LLC 10-4843	23 Broad Street	Fenestration & addition	42.4.2/77	Emeritus
13.	Family Ties ACK, LLC 11-5159	11 Alliance Lane	New dwelling	39/24.1	Studio Ppark

X. NEW BUSINESS 02/01/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Brandon Bean	2 Candle House Lane	New Dwelling	55.4.1/1	TJ Waterson
2.	Peter Barrett	40 Maryann Drive	Move garage door	68/965	Topham Designs
3.	Philip Garufi	6 West Way	Additions	38/134	Val Oliver
4.	Ocean Heath, LLC	9 Falmouth Avenue	Fenestration and Decks	82/423	JN Designs
5.	Ocean Heath, LLC	9 Falmouth Avenue	Shed	82/423	JN Designs
6.	9 Beach Grass, LLC	9 Beach Grass Road	New Duplex	68/859	Linda Williams
7.	Pebbe Nicholson	24 Brewster Road	New Barn/Apt	54/169.3	Val Oliver
8.	50 Brewster Rd, LLC	50 Brewster Road	Reduce Building revision	43/96	EMDA
9.	Wallace Ack, LLC	45 Hulbert Avenue	Boardwalk/ Gate	29/16	Jardins Intl.
10.	Andrew and Brooke Roger	7E Lincoln Avenue	Driveway/ Hardscape	42.4.1/18	Jardins Intl.
11.	One Bloom, LLC	1 Bloom Street	Hardscape: drive, fence, etc	42.3.3/140	Jardins Intl.
12.	11 Beach Grass, LLC	11 Beach Grass Road	Revision: trim change	68/855	Linda Williams
13.	Michael & Jaqueline Raso	82 Center Street	Replace/inststall front wall	42.4.3/62	Mike & Jackie Raso
14.	Jean Moran	4 Washington Avenue	New Pool	60.2.4/65	Jon Paul Couture
15.	Jean Moran	4 Washington Avenue	Window Well	60.2.4/65	Jon Paul Couture
16.	Jean Moran	4 Washington Avenue	New Garage	60.2.4/65	Jon Paul Couture
17.	Robert and Daryl Westbrook	16 Baxter Road	Rooftop Solar	49.2.3/16	Cotuit Solar
18.	10 Hydrangea Ln No 3, LLC	10 Hydrangea Lane	Rooftop Solar	73/89	Cotuit Solar
19.	Caesara Wendin Family TR	1 West Chester Street	Roof Replacement	42.4.3/15.2	T & T Roofing
20.	Scott Dehm and Amy Hauk	8 Ash Street	Addition; Gate	42.4.2/94	Sandcastle Const. Inc
21.	Scott Dehm and Amy Hauk	8 Ash Street	Demo Shed	42.4.2/94	Sandcastle Const. Inc
22.	Klinck Ruth Hill	301 Madaket Road	Demo shed	60.2.1/55	NAG
23.	Klinck Ruth Hill	301 Madaket Road	New shed	60.2.1/55	NAG
24.	Lloyd Realty, LLC	7 Heather Lane	New Guest House	30/24.2	S. Metz
25.	N. Liberty, LLC	74 North Liberty Street	Shed	41/236	Val Oliver
26.	Gail Johnson	21 South Water Street	New Front Door	42.4.2/102	Lucas Velle
27.	Ack Weatherly Pl	3 Weatherly Place	Move Shed on Lot	67/950	Plamen Dimitov
28.	Ack Weatherly Pl	3 Weatherly Place	New Second Dwelling	67/950	Plamen Dimitov
29.	PFox Nantucket, LLC	20 Orange Street	Rev10-5015:rmv prt pergola	42.3.2/70	Botticelli + Pohl
30.	John Holt	14 Clifton Street	Lower Building Height	73.4.1/39.1	Emeritus

Proposed HDC Minutes for February 15, 2022

31. Lindsay Torpey	7 Green Lane	Rebuild/revise deck	42.3.3/86	Emeritus
32. Kerry Propper	9 Hawks Circle	Solar Ground Array	74/37.1	Ack Smart
33. Lloyd Realty LLC	7 Heather Lane	Pool & Hardscape	30/24.2	Atlantic Landscaping
34. 7 King St Nom Trust	7 King Street 'Sias	MH Revisions	73.1.3/41	Botticelli + Pohl
35. 7 King St Nom Trust	7 King Street 'Sias	New Shed	73.1.3/41	Botticelli + Pohl
36. Still Dock Nantucket, LLC	14 Oakland Street	Addition	59.4/255	Botticelli + Pohl
37. Still Dock Nantucket, LLC	40 Tennessee Avenue	Addition	59.4/84	Botticelli + Pohl

I. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	February 1 & 3, 2022
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye
Review Minutes	February 8 & 10, 2022
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Thursday, February 17 @ 1:00 pm VIA ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 8:56 pm. (McLaughlin)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board Madaket Advisory Board Sign Advisory Council

