



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, February 10, 2022

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

Called to order at 1:00 pm. and announcements by Ms. Camp.

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, PLUS Administrative Assistant; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill
Absent Members: Welch, Dutra
Late Arrivals: Pohl, 1:03 pm.; McLaughlin, 1:55 pm
Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Oliver)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. NEW BUSINESS 01/18/2021

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Rich Oneslager 01-5497	8 Cliff Road	L/k window replacement	42.4.4/23	Rick Johnston
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Rick Johnston			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:49)	<p>Johnston – Presented project; vinyl-clad inserts on back and sides. Backus – Contributing circa 1881 Queen Ann house, “Captain’s House.” We should have a window survey; the 1&1s are historic to the Queen Ann. Read individual comments from HSAB members. Pohl – We’re not loving the idea of vinyl-clad, insulated glass on a historic house in the old historic district (OHD). Recommended that Mr. Johnston speak with Ms. Backus about the window survey requirements. The replacement windows narrow down the historic apertures.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

2.	NIR Retail 01-5488	29 Commercial Wharf	Roof replacement	42.2.4/3	T & T Roofing
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Trevor Smith, T&T Roofing				
Public	None				
Concerns (8:43)	<p>Smith – Presented project; we can't get red cedar right now.</p> <p>Backus – The Landmark Maury Black is approvable in the old historic district (OHD). Circa 1970s built during Walter Beinecke era. I agree with HSAB comments; also, this seems to be counter-productive with other structures on the wharf going to cedar.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 1/18: This is the first cottage on the north side of Commercial Wharf and the most visible from the corner and should stay red cedar; all of the cottages on the south side before the corner are red cedar. NIR should be thinking about changing the wharf cottages from asphalt to red cedar not the other way around.</p> <p>Coombs – It should remain cedar.</p> <p>Camp – I agree with it staying wood; this is a high-visibility area.</p> <p>Oliver – I like it being wood but I don't know how hard it is to get the roof cedar shingles. If that is the case, they should either wait until the red cedar is available or use 3-tab, which is better than architectural.</p> <p>Thornewill – She'd like them to stick to wood on this corner.</p> <p>Pohl – No one disagrees that red cedar looks best. However, we have approved a small number of shingle types for use in the OHD. If we are going to pick and choose, he wonders why we created that list.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with red cedar shingles. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-2//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs-aye; Pohl and Oliver-nay			Certificate #	HDC2022-01-5488
3.	Amy Mignone 01-5547	10 Angola Street	Window/door replace& alt.	55.4.4/79	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:18)	<p>Oliver – Asked to hold for Tuesday</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday February 15 at applicant's request. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
4.	Sheila S. & C. Giardini 01-5507	7a Clifford Street	New dwelling	79/19	McMullen & Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen, McMullen & Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:20)	<p>McMullen – Presented project; height 27' and 69'X47'; roof pitch 10/12; trim and sashes white; front door Chrome green; southeast faces the water.</p> <p>Camp – It looks like the pool is crammed into the corner and the driveway takes up a lot of space; suggested moving the whole thing closer to the driveway creating more back yard. The house is simple and good looking. The sidelights should be 3 lights above a panel. Southeast elevation, the decking should be reduced with some roof in front it to give the porch presence.</p> <p>Oliver - It's nice looking. Agrees about shifting the house closer to the driveway.</p> <p>Coombs – The house looks the same on both sides and goes from property line to property line; agrees about shifting the program west; there's no need for such a huge circle of parking.</p> <p>Thornewill – Canting it makes it appear larger because you see the two masses at the same time; it also makes the whole thing feel jammed up. Agrees the rear deck is excessive; it could be broken up into smaller decks. The French doors should be 6-lights. The 4-light gable windows are “fussy” and should be eliminated.</p> <p>Pohl – He agrees about the canting and being pushed into a corner; an angled house does appear to be almost 25% larger. Suggested lessening the angle will provide more room for the pool and terrace though there would be less driveway. Agrees the French doors should have fewer larger panes. Agrees about removing the 4-light gable windows. Agrees with reducing the deck to have more hipped roof encompassing it. The sidelights should have bottom panels up to the lock rail.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, Thornewill, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

5.	S. & C. Giardini 01-5510	7a Clifford Street	New garage/studio	79/19	McMullen & Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen, McMullen & Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:35)	<p>McMullen – Presented project; height 22'; details match the house.</p> <p>Oliver – It's cute.</p> <p>Camp – No concerns; thought the east dormer windows could be wider; they look vertical.</p> <p>Coombs – It looks good.</p> <p>Thornewill – No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-01-5510
6.	S. & C. Giardini 01-5508	7a Clifford Street	New pool & hardscape	79/19	McMullen & Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen, McMullen & Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:39)	<p>McMullen – There are plenty of existing trees; a landscaper will be planting something.</p> <p>Camp – The pool terrace goes right to the property line. Her siting concerns are applicable here; it should all slide toward Clifford.</p> <p>Oliver – Nothing to add; the pool needs to be screened which isn't possible if so close to the property line.</p> <p>Coombs – Would like to see the house shifted and the pool surround reduced.</p> <p>Thornewill – You need a 5' buffer on your property.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
7.	S. & C. Giardini 01-5509	7a Clifford Street	New gazebo	79/19	McMullen & Assoc.
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen, McMullen & Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:44)	<p>McMullen – Presented project.</p> <p>Oliver – The design is fine, but it's shoehorned into the same corner.</p> <p>Camp – Its size looks good on the site plan but smaller in the drawing. She's on the fence about this.</p> <p>Coombs – Her concern is the placement; it's nice and simple.</p> <p>Thornewill – It is a simple building; questions the range hood in an open structure, though it's not visible.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for a site plan. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

8. Self J Douglas 01-5517	3 Martins Lane	New shtrrs/2 new winws	42.3.2/133	LINK
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	McLaughlin			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Victoria Ewing, LINK			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:55)	<p>Ewing – Presented project; withdrawing the 2nd window request.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1909-1923 per Sanborne maps. It would be helpful to know what the shutters would like so drawings would be appropriate.</p> <p>Read HSAB comments 1/18: The historic photo shows a pre-existing 28-light window, so this is appropriate. Shutters will add some needed charm to this building; however, scaled drawings or detailed specifications regarding the new window and which windows get shutters and how the shutters will be attached should be provided along with better photographs.</p> <p>Oliver – Asked for orientation points on the photos with more details about the shutters. Not sure how she feels about raised-panel shutters; doesn't think they work on this style.</p> <p>Camp – She could go with either style of shutter but agrees about needing more information.</p> <p>Coombs – She'd prefer louvered shutters; they are less formal for this structure.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees the louvers would be more appropriate.</p> <p>Pohl – Raised-panel shutters go with a formal Federal-style, which this is not. Louvre and flat panels would be better.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with more details on shutters, which are to be louvered, and no change to the south elevation back east corner window. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	HDC2022-01-5517	
9. Ali & Zach Smith 12-5313	232 Madaket Road	New dwelling	59.4/120.1	JN Design
10. Ali & Zach Smith 12-5315	232 Madaket Road	New garage	59.4/120.1	JN Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:09)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, Feb 15. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #		

11. Zero India St, LLC 01-5514	1 Cambridge Street	Rdc ftprnt/rf replace/fenst	42.3.1/130.2	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:09)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #		

VII. OLD BUSINESS 01/25/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Rich Peterson 09-4770	30 Main Street Sconset	Relocate garage & addition	73.3.1/46	Concept Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	TJ Waterson, Concept Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:10)	<p>Waterson – Willing to go forward with 3-person board. Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – SAB has not looked at these since December; they had concerns about the 2nd-floor deck.</p> <p>Camp – This has a sweet profile; confirmed that it's sited within the setback. West elevation, she'd like the deck balusters brought in to the French doors with more shingled rail; the French doors should match those on the 1st floor.</p> <p>Coombs – West elevation, the deck's right end should end at the dormer corner board to match the left end.</p> <p>Pohl – West elevation, the deck has been reduced about 25% and a window removed; pull the deck in symmetrically to the French doors.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation deck columns pulled in symmetrically around the French doors and make the 2nd-floor doors 2'8". (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-09-4770	

2. Marshall & Holly Pagon 11-5250	28 & 32 Baxter Road	Pool house & pergola	49.23/29	Design Associates
-----------------------------------	---------------------	----------------------	----------	-------------------

Voting Pohl, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns (2:21) **Backus** – Mr. Dalmus asked this be continued to Tuesday.
 Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold for Tuesday, February 15. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

3. LeSelect Properties 11-5144	1 Ash Street	Fenestration changes	42.4.2/85	Normand Residential
--------------------------------	--------------	----------------------	-----------	---------------------

Voting Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver
 Alternates Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.
 Representing Ben Normand, Normand Residential
 Public None
 Concerns (2:22) **Normand** – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; only access is the front door and basement egress.
Backus – Circa 1840-1846 contributing structure.

Read HASB comments 1/24: The drop in the head casing of the new door relative to the existing windows is awkward; this discrepancy could be mitigated by the addition of a shed roof over the stoop to create a small covered entry porch. The lights in the new door should be made smaller. Please conceal the air-conditioning unit (A/C) on North Water Street and the meter on the back.

McLaughlin – No comments on the proposed changes.

Coombs – A pent roof over the door would be good and agrees the door should be a 9-light. The A/C and meter should be screened.

Camp – If it has a roof over the side door, it should fit the neo-classical style; she likes the 9-light door suggestion; she liked the transom windows over the door. Suggested heavy trim and entablature around the door without the transom.

Oliver – She liked the transom window over the door, but the pane size should match what's in the door; or put up a quarter board.

Pohl – Could make the door a little wider so the panes match the windows. Likes Ms. Camp's suggestion.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the door to have a formal entablature aligning with the top of the windows and the door to have a 9-light window. (Camp)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2021-11-5144**

Rest held for Tuesday, February 15th

4. Trogoh Nominee Trust 05-3640	26 Easy Street	Mixed Use- Retail & Resid	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
5. Cindy Helfrich 12-5354	37 Fair Street	Roof & fenestration changes	42.3.2/121	Emeritus
6. BC Sconset, LLC 07-4226	9 Hawks Circle	Hardscape	74/37.1	Ahern
7. Brett Fodiman 12-5374	3 Tetawkimo Drive	New dwelling	53/41	CWA
8. Brett Fodiman 10-4969	27 Cato Lane	New dwelling	55/118	CWA
9. Brett Fodiman 10-4970	27 Cato Lane	Garage	55/118	CWA
10. Theodorakos Vaios Trust	79 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15/5	CWA
11. Anthony Noto 11-5270	10 Lincoln Avenue	Addition & reno	30/184	Emeritus
12. 450 Green Park, LLC 11-5272	2 Stone Alley	Adtn, Alter, & Foundation	42.3.1/103	Emeritus

IX. NEW BUSINESS 02/01/2022

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Joseph Marchese 11-5158	8 Winn Street	Rev. 08-4861: pool	41/51.2	Waterscapes
2. Glenn Lajeunesse 01-5553	4 Mioxes Way	New Cabana	65/87	Thornewill Designs
3. 34B Walsh St N.T. 01-5568	34B Walsh Street	Addition	29/104	Studio Ppark
4. Peter Michalowski 01-5573	34 Dukes Road	Rev. 72768: hardscape	56/187	Linda Williams
5. BPC 4 Dolphin Ct., LLC 01-5574	4 Dolphin Court	Addition	42.4.1/65.2	Linda Williams
6. BPC 8 N. Beach St., LLC 01-5572	8 North Beach Street	Addition	42.4.1/65.1	Linda Williams
7. S & R Island Dev. 01-5576	26 Woodland Drive	Demo Dwelling	68/260	Linda Williams
8. Sam Nicholson 01-5534	22 Brewster Road	Addition	54/196.1	Val Oliver
9. Steve Theroux 01-5536	25 Broadway	Storage/ Garbage Bins	73.1.3/108	NAG
10. Steve & Kim Schaefer 01-5526	86 Cliff Road	Shed/ Fence	30/74.2	Robert Newman
11. Steve & Kim Schaefer 01-5525	86 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30/74.2	Robert Newman
12. All Vines LLC 01-5537	9 Prospect Street	Roof Shingle Change	55.4.4/41	T & T Roofing
13. Hollis Webb 01-5586	30 Dukes Road	Demolition	56/189	Hollis Webb
14. The Sandbar 01-5527	4 Bathing Beach Road	Roof Overhang	29/1	Val Oliver
15. 36 Easton St. Corp. 01-5520	36 Easton Street	Move AC to West Rev	42.1.4/19	EMDA
16. B16ACK LLC 01-5524	8 Meadowview Drive	New Dwelling – Garage	56/147	EMDA

Proposed HDC Minutes for February 10, 2022

17.	71 N. Liberty Trust 01-5539	71 North Liberty Street	Hardscape	41/141.1	NAG
18.	Rbt. Veghte & Robin Rednor	2 Ann's Lane	New Roof Walk	49/59.1	DTA
19.	William Schultz 01-5550	23 Friendship Lane	Garage Demo/ Move Off	56/347	David Pekarcik
20.	William Schultz 01-5551	23 Friendship Lane	Garage Move on Site	56/347	David Pekarcik
21.	Glenn Lajeunesse 01-5553	4 Mioxes Way	Solar Roof Array	65/87	Ack Smart
22.	Lyubenor Lyubomir 01-5552	7 Toombs Court	Solar Roof Array	68/153.1	Ack Smart
23.	Vlatko Pesnacki 01-5557	10 Lewis Court	New Dwelling	67/155	Val Oliver
24.	Hamling Deirdre Tr 01-5559	6 Lowell Place	Rev. 02-2951: addition	41/167	Joseph Topham
25.	King Fisher Realty Tr 01-5596	278 Polpis Road	Rev. COA: Rf Wlk & Fenest.	25/2	Gryphon Architect
26.	Fine Luxury Homes 01-5601	10 Beaver Street	Re-roof	55.1.4/80	Steven Stockigt
27.	Jay Cohen 01-5599	24 Medouie Creek Road	Pool & Hardscape	20/2	Studio Landscape
28.	Jay Cohen 01-5587	24 Medouie Creek Road	New Shed	20/2	Smith & Hutton
29.	Jay Cohen 01-5570	24 Medouie Creek Road	Main House Alteration	20/2	Smith & Hutton
30.	Lloyd Realty, LLC 01-5600	7 Heather Lane	New Dwelling	30/24.2	S. Metz
31.	Hulbert Ack LLC 01-5565	2 Hulbert Avenue	Hardscape	42.1.4/21	Atlantic Landscaping
32.	Nantucket 62 Walsh, LLC 01-5588	62 Walsh Street	Rev. 08-4379:	29/85 + 85.2	Botticelli + Pohl
33.	Taco 1 LLC 01-5569	22 Bartlett Road (24 Bart)	New Dwelling	65/86	BPC
34.	Ocean Dojo, LLC 01-5567	20 Bartlett Road (22 Bart)	New Dwelling	65/76	BPC
35.	Mike & Jackie Raso 01-5612	82 Centre Street	Alteration	42.4.3/62	Mike & Jackie Raso

IX. OLD BUSINESS 02/08/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Bluefin, LLC 11-5194	27 Ellen's Way Lot 20	New Dwelling	81/180	Brook Meerbergen
2. Elizabeth Powell 12-5445	71 Cliff Road	Hardscape	30/160	Atlantic Landscaping
3. Elizabeth Powell 12-5440	71 Cliff Road	Cabana	30/160	Thornewill Designs
4. Matt O'Connor 12-5370	16 Tashama Lane	Retaining wall	55/481	KM Designs
5. 1 Caroline Way, LLC 12-5439	1 Caroline Way	Rev: main and guest houses	85/58 & 59	Vincente Burin Arch.
6. 1 Caroline Way, LLC 12-5414	1 Caroline Way	Pool & hardscape	85/58 & 59	Ahern
7. 22 Easton St, LLC 06-4026	22 Easton Street	Pool & hardscape	42.1/12	Ahern
8. Island Living, LLC 11-5151	4a Wamasquid Place	Pool & hardscape	56/113.9	Ahern
9. 33 North Mill St, LLC 11-5051	7 North Mill Street	Garage & studio	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz
10. 33 North Mill St, LLC 11-5126	7 North Mill Street	Hardscape	55.4.4/77	Atlantic Landscaping
11. 23 Broad St, LLC 10-4843	23 Broad Street	Fenestration & addition	42.4.2/77	Emeritus

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	January 25 & 27, 2022
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye
Review Minutes	February 1 & 3, 2022
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, February 15 @ 5:00 pm VIA ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:35 pm. (McLaughlin)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, Camp, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board